

# access

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

Monday, April 22, 2024

General Session: 12:00 p.m.

Closed Session: Immediately Following

Access Services Headquarters

Council Conference Room, 3rd Floor

3449 Santa Anita Avenue

El Monte CA 91731

3650 Fairland Boulevard  
Los Angeles CA 90043

See \*Note below for remote public link.

## *MISSION STATEMENT*

*Access Services promotes access to all modes of transportation and provides quality and safe ADA paratransit service on behalf of public transit agencies in Los Angeles County.*

---

<u>ITEM</u>	<u>DISPOSITION</u>
1. CALL TO ORDER	ACTION
2. REPORT FROM EX-OFFICIO BOARD MEMBERS	INFORMATION
3. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT	INFORMATION
4. SUPERIOR SERVICE AWARD	PRESENTATION

<p>5. <b>CONSENT CALENDAR</b></p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">a) Consideration to Approve Minutes from the Board Meeting on March 25, 2024 (page 6) [Staff Recommendation: Approve minutes as written.]</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">b) Consideration to Award Contract for Fleet Inspection Services (AS-4170) (page 13) [Staff Recommendation: Authorize staff to execute Contract No. AS-4170 with AmeriTran Service Corporation (dba Transit Resource Center (TRC)) for fleet inspection services in an amount not to exceed \$620,404.41 for the base period of June 1, 2024 through May 31, 2027.]</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;"><b>[Staff Recommendation: Approve the Consent Calendar.]</b></p>	<p><b>ACTION</b> [Vote Required: majority of quorum by roll call]</p>
<p>6. <b>SERVICE DEMAND PROJECTIONS</b></p>	<p><b>PRESENTATION</b></p>
<p>7. <b>BUDGET UPDATE</b></p>	<p><b>PRESENTATION</b></p>
<p>8. <b>OPERATIONS UPDATE</b></p>	<p><b>PRESENTATION</b></p>
<p>9. <b>UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS (page 22)</b></p>	<p><b>INFORMATION</b></p>
<p>10. <b>EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT</b></p>	<p><b>INFORMATION</b></p>
<p>11. <b>BOARD MEMBER COMMUNICATION</b></p>	<p><b>INFORMATION</b></p>
<p>12. <b>NEW BUSINESS SUBSEQUENT TO THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA</b></p>	<p><b>DISCUSSION/ POSSIBLE ACTION</b></p>
<p>13. <b>PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS</b></p>	<p><b>INFORMATION</b></p>
<p>14. <b>CLOSED SESSION:</b></p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">A) <b>CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL: GOV. CODE §54956.9</b></p> <p style="padding-left: 80px;">1. Anticipated Litigation: Gov. Code §54956.9 (b) (i) Significant exposure to litigation pursuant to subdivision (b) of Gov. Code §54956.9 (b) a situation where, based on the advice of counsel considering "existing facts and circumstances," there exists a "significant exposure to litigation".</p> <p style="padding-left: 80px;">2. Pending Litigation: Gov. Code §54956.9 (d)(1) (i) Litigation, to which Access Services is a party, has been initiated formally.</p> <p style="padding-left: 80px;">1. Aviles, Guillermo v. Access Services, LASC Case # 20STCV3752</p>	<p><b>DISCUSSION/ POSSIBLE ACTION</b></p>

B) CALIFORNIA GOV. CODE § 54956.8 - REAL PROPERTY  
NEGOTIATIONS -

1. Property: APN:6139-014-008

Access Negotiator: Andre Colaiace/Hector Rodriguez

Negotiating Party: Colliers

Under Negotiation: Price and terms

15. **ADJOURNMENT**

**ACTION**

Access Services does not discriminate based on disability. Accordingly, Access Services seeks to ensure that individuals with disabilities will have an equal opportunity to participate in the range of Access Services events and programs by providing appropriate auxiliary aids and services for communications. Primary consideration is given to the request of individuals with disabilities. However, the final decision belongs to Access Services. To help ensure the availability of any auxiliary aids and services you require, please make every effort to notify Access Services of your request at least three (3) business days (72 hours) prior to the meeting in which you wish to utilize those aids or services. You may do so by contacting (213) 270-6000.

Note: Access Services Board meetings are held pursuant to the Ralph M. Brown Act [Cal. Gov. Code §54950] and are open to the public. The public may view and obtain all written information supporting this agenda provided to the Board both initially and supplementally prior to the meeting at the agency's offices located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue, El Monte, California and on its website at <http://accessla.org>. Documents, including Power Point handouts distributed to the Board members by staff or Board members at the meeting, will simultaneously be made available to the public. Three opportunities are available for the public to address the Board during a Board meeting: (1) before a specific agenda item is debated and voted upon regarding that item, (2) public comment and (3) before closed session regarding matters to be discussed in closed session. The exercise of the right to address the Board is subject to restriction as to time and appropriate decorum. All persons wishing to make public comment must fill out a goldenrod Public Comment Form and submit it to the Secretary of the Board. Public comment is generally limited to three (3) minutes per speaker and the total time available for public comment may be limited at the discretion of the Chairperson. Persons whose speech is impaired such that they are unable to address the Board at a normal rate of speed may request an accommodation of a limited amount of additional time from the Chair but only by checking the appropriate box on the Public Comment Form. Granting such an accommodation is at the discretion of the Chair. The Board of Directors will not and cannot respond during the meeting to matters raised under public comment. Pursuant to provisions of the Brown Act governing these proceedings, no discussion or action may be taken on these matters unless they are listed on the agenda, or unless certain emergency or special circumstances exist. However, the Board may direct staff to investigate and/or schedule

certain matters for consideration at a future Board of Directors Meeting and the staff may respond to all public comments in writing prior to the next Board meeting.

Alternative accessible formats are available upon request.

### \*NOTE

The public may also participate via the Zoom webinar link, or by teleconference. Please review the procedures to do so as follows -

#### How to Provide Public Comment in a Board Meeting via Zoom

##### Online

1. Click the Zoom link for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at: [https://accessla.org/news\\_and\\_events/agendas.html](https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html). Make sure to use a current, up-to-date browser: Chrome 30+, Firefox 27+, Microsoft Edge 12+, or Safari 7+. Certain functionality may be disabled in older browsers including Internet Explorer. You may also use this direct link - <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/85909014953>
2. Enter an email address and your name. Your name will be visible online while you are speaking.
3. When the Board Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, click on "raise hand." Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Mute all other audio before speaking. Using multiple devices can cause audio feedback.
4. Please note that the "Chat" feature is not enabled during the meeting for general public attendees. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, then please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called, please limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

Note: Members of the public will not be shown on video.

##### By phone

1. Call the Zoom phone number and enter the webinar ID for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at: [https://accessla.org/news\\_and\\_events/agendas.html](https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html)
2. You can also call in using the following information -
3. Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):  
US: +1 669 444 9171 or +1 669 900 6833 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 719 359 4580  
or +1 253 205 0468 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 386 347 5053 or +1 507 473 4847  
or +1 564 217 2000 or +1 646 931 3860 or +1 689 278 1000 or +1 929 205 6099  
or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 305 224 1968 or +1 309 205 3325 or +1 312 626 6799  
or +1 360 209 5623 or 877 853 5247 (Toll Free) or 888 788 0099 (Toll Free) or 833 548 0276 (Toll Free) or 833 548 0282 (Toll Free)  
Webinar ID: 859 0901 4953

4. When the Board Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, press \*9 to raise a hand. Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Speakers will be called by the last four digits of their phone number. Please note that phone numbers in their entirety will be visible online while speakers are speaking.
5. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, the please submit a written comment as outlined above.
6. When called, please state your name, and limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.



STATEMENT OF PROCEEDINGS FOR THE  
MEETING OF THE ACCESS SERVICES  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

MARCH 25, 2024

12:00 p.m.

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chair Doran Barnes at 12:09 p.m.

**BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT REPRESENTING A QUORUM**

Present: Vice Chair Doran Barnes, Treasurer Lee Burner, Secretary Dolores Nason, Directors Valerie Gibson and Martin Gombert

**BOARD MEMBER(S) EXCUSED FROM THE MEETING**

Not Present: Chair Theresa De Vera, Directors Giovanna Gogreve and John Troost

**2. REPORT FROM EX-OFFICIO BOARD MEMBERS**

TPAC Chair Fayma Ishaq stated the committee received the operations report given by Project Administrator Vicente Pena. TPAC members asked about the ProMaster design features and whether the vehicle was functioning for all riders or if there were any issues or concerns. Staff stated that the vehicle meets all ADA requirements and any issues had been already addressed. TPAC members asked about the two KPIs on preventable incidents and preventable collisions not meeting standards. Staff stated that contractors are providing additional safety training and drivers are getting acquainted with the new vehicle.

Manager of Strategic Planning Eric Haack presented the CARB ZEB rollout plan. TPAC members asked if Access was partnering with Metro for ZEB vehicle procurement. TPAC also asked if by 2026 manufacturers would be able to provide zero emission cutaway class A and B vehicles, along with the charging infrastructure, and if it'll be readily available to contractors. Access staff mentioned that they are facing challenges in locating fully 100% electric vehicles and are working with manufacturers to meet all future requirements.

Emergency Management Coordinator Alex Chrisman stated that the Emergency Operations Center was activated during the month of February, providing storm intelligence and messaging to riders. In addition, they welcomed Golden Empire Transit in Bakersfield to TransMac. TransMac is a group of transit agencies that

coordinate assistance in times of critical emergencies. TPAC members gave kudos to Access operations department on being proactive in simulated emergency scenarios.

Director of Planning and Coordination Matthew Avancena showed a rough cut of the reservation video and TPAC members made suggestions on the video.

CAC Chair Yael Hagen stated the CAC had a discussion with the customer service department on the different types of notifications that people can sign up to receive. They had some input on making sure that those notifications could be used by not only the riders but also caregivers or family members.

The next agenda item was regarding the FAQs on the website. They are looking at various frequently asked questions that can be incorporated into the website. They also had a discussion on how to improve the rider's guide. The rider's guide is broken down into chapters and sections and subsections so it's easy to find information, but it's more of a reference guide. They also talked about the rider's guide being more encouraging and positive and being more problem solving oriented.

The Eligibility Subcommittee looked at the questions that are being asked, improving them, making them a little clearer. The Operations Subcommittee is working on strategies on how to improve the driver/rider connection when the vehicle arrives early. The Website Subcommittee is reviewing the proposed website changes to make sure that the information is accessible, readable and understandable. The Communication Subcommittee has been working on the next video script, which has to do with how to avoid no-shows.

### **3. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

None.

### **4. SUPERIOR SERVICE AWARD**

Project Administrator Vicente Pena introduced the Superior Service Award winner, Maria Avila.

### **5. CONSENT CALENDAR**

- a) Consideration to Approve Minutes from the Board Meeting on February 26, 2024
- b) Consideration to Approve Purchase Authorization for ADA Paratransit Vehicles

**Motion made by Secretary Nason to approve the Consent Calendar, seconded by Director Gombert. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.**

## 6. BUDGET UPDATE

Deputy Executive Director Hector Rodriguez presented this item.

### Public Comment:

None.

### Board Member Questions:

Director Gombert asked if the PC-40 funding for FY25 would be lower than FY24. Mr. Rodriguez responded that it would be about \$15 million less.

Vice Chair Barnes asked if the numbers that were presented in terms of the total budget included the 5% as well for the upcoming year or if the 5% was on top of the totals. Mr. Rodriguez responded that at this time it was unclear if a reserve would be established for FY25.

Vice Chair Barnes asked for more information on two of the funding sources, new federal funding and reprogrammed funding. Mr. Rodriguez stated that there were leftover monies from other agencies that couldn't be used but needed to be spent. The grants department and the FTA worked together to repurpose those monies for Access' proposed budget so it wouldn't lapse.

## 7. INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY UPDATE

Director of Information Technology Bill Tsuei presented this item.

### Public Comment:

Fernando Roldan made a public comment that when they are applying for those grants, Access should keep in mind the San Fernando Valley rail extension and possibly target service at Mission or LA Valley Colleges.

Yael Hagen made a public comment by asking if there were plans on rescheduling the autonomous vehicle demonstration that was supposed to be at Rancho. Mr. Tsuei responded they will but currently the vehicle is undergoing a software upgrade. They will schedule that accordingly down the road.

### Board comments:

Vice Chair Barnes thanked Mr. Tsuei for serving as the Chair of the California Transit Association's Information Technology Committee along with coordinating with APTA on their study mission efforts in terms of having folks come here. APTA frequently organizes trips to other parts of the world and helps bring other parts of the world to them.



## 8. OPERATIONS UPDATE

Chief Operations Officer Mike Greenwood and Director of Administration F Scott Jewell presented this item.

### Public Comment:

Fernando Roldan made a public comment by stating that regarding the surveys and the operations section of it, what is missing from the reports is the way the shared rides are made. He has brought it up at the CAC and now at the Board meeting. That is something that has been a hassle for a lot of riders because of the way the routes are made.

Yael Hagen made a public comment by asking if on excessively late trips, they are talking about trips that arrive excessively late, not the ones that took an excessively long time. Mr. Greenwood said yes it was correct. Yael Hagen stated that when looking at the statistics, there is a difference between the statistics that they see in the reports, which are fantastic, and the reality of being on a vehicle for a long time. Having a late pick up then having the trip being long, that is difficult for riders. There are too many unknown factors and she wanted to give that perspective to them.

### Board Member Questions:

Director Gibson asked what does the data show in terms of what's behind that change in free fare usage. Mr. Jewell stated that the anecdotal reports of higher crime on fixed route, along with heightened health sensitivity in being in proximity to other riders, has most likely led to the decrease in free fare ridership.

Director Gombert asked if they were going to bring back to the Board the issue of potentially increasing the Access fleet. Mr. Greenwood responded that would be considered in a future budget where they could look at expanding the fleet instead of just keeping up with vehicle replacement.

Executive Director Andre Colaiace stated that staff is going to internally review that topic and make recommendations for future budget years.

Director Gombert asked if they are still in a situation where there are no zero-emission vehicles that meet the medium-duty requirements of their fleet. Mr. Greenwood responded it was a combination of zero-emission vehicles not meeting their requirements as well as the Buy America requirements. Director Gombert stated that what sparked his thought on that is that there is some zero-emission bus funding coming into the region as part of last year's state budget and perhaps staff could look at acquiring agency-owned sedans. Mr. Greenwood stated that depended on the number of wheelchair users that would be forecasted in future years.

Executive Director Andre Colaiace stated they were looking into hydrogen vehicles as well.

Director Matthews stated that being a rider himself and a member of the disability community who actively uses Access every day for work, the statistics are very good in the way they're presented. He agrees with the community that these numbers do not tell the story of how the service is being used as a whole. They give a portion of how the service is used and that's from an operational perspective. The importance here is that the community, specifically with disabilities, are left waiting 30 to 45 minutes for a trip to be picked up, which also does not account for travel time due to the vehicle already being late. In some cases, they are looking at two and a half hours to three hours for a trip that should have taken an hour to 45 minutes at most. He would like to reiterate this because this is extremely important from an operational perspective, this may be within the parameters of each trip for everyone, depending on their location. This information should not be missed by the Board members and the community that's present.

Director Burner asked if the strategy for purchasing vehicles in the future includes ZEVs and the infrastructure that goes with it. Mr. Colaiace stated they are tracking the technology, both electric and hydrogen, but a lot of that goes back into facilities and having their own facilities where they can put in the infrastructure. Staff's priorities are to first find zero-emission vehicles that work for Access and then they need facilities where they can build the infrastructure to support them. At this point in time, they are making progress on both. There's money in the budget for the purchase of initial electric vehicles and there's money in the budget for working on the Antelope Valley facility. They are continuing to search for additional funding for additional facilities over the next 5 to 10 years. Director Burner asked about the life expectancy of the vehicles. Mr. Greenwood responded that the ProMaster life expectancy was four years. Mr. Colaiace stated they run them 250,000 miles, which is well beyond the FTA's expected life of 100,000 miles.

## **9. UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS**

Director of Administration F Scott Jewell presented this item.

## **10. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Executive Director Andre Colaiace stated the Federal Access Board is an independent federal agency that promotes equality for people with disabilities through leadership, accessible design and development of accessibility guidelines and standards. It was created in 1973 to ensure access to federally funded facilities. The Federal Access Board is now a leading source of information on accessible design and is structured to function as a coordinating body among federal agencies and directly represent the public, particularly people with disabilities. It is governed by a 25-member Board, significantly larger than this Board. The news is that from April 15 to 19, the Board will be holding its quarterly meeting in Los Angeles to understand the state of accessibility in the city. On Tuesday, the Board will hold a town hall meeting, on Wednesday, the Board will focus on accessibility in Hollywood and on Thursday, April 18, the Board will spend the day looking at accessibility in the city of Los Angeles as it pertains to the

Olympic games. He's been asked to participate on a panel discussing the accessibility of transportation and transportation facilities in Los Angeles and he looks forward to discussing the role that Access Services plays in making Los Angeles accessible and how new infrastructure, like bike lanes, need to be considered in paratransit design. Last week in his role as President of Los Angeles Board of Taxicab Commissioners, he attended Mayor Karen Bass's first annual meeting of her appointed commissioners. It was a great event, which allowed him to meet other commissioners, including Access customers who serve on the City Commission on Disabilities. After the remarks, he was able to reconnect with the Deputy Mayor for Infrastructure, Randall Winston and Tina Backstrom, the Mayor's Senior Director of Transportation to discuss Access priorities. Finally, Access is requesting \$20 million for the Antelope Valley Paratransit operations and maintenance facility in Lancaster through the federal Raise grant program. They are also looking at submitting a similar proposal to the federal bus and bus facilities program as well.

## **11. BOARD MEMBER COMMUNICATION**

CAC Chair Hagen stated that they need to take a closer look at the Abilities Expo. They need to rethink how the pickups are done and put some energy into making it a little smoother. It is something they are going to give attention to in the next Advisory Committee meetings and encourage staff to keep a tab on that because she thinks there is a lot they can improve with the pickups.

TPAC Chair Ishaq thanked Superior Service Award Winner from CTI, Maria Avila, for her dedication in helping all the Access riders and thank everyone for the presentations.

Director Gombert thanked staff for their great presentations.

Director Gibson thanked staff for their thorough and informative presentations. She also wanted to acknowledge Ms. Avila for receiving the Superior Service Award. It is always her favorite part, and it invigorates her and makes the work they are doing worthwhile. Access is going to have presence down at the CalAct Conference in San Diego in mid-April and she was excited to see that.

Secretary Nason listened to the reports and there were wonderful presentations. She is really proud of the work they are doing. She reads a lot about the other transportation companies and what's going on with them and she thinks they are doing so great. She is grateful for Maria the Superior Service awardee.

Director Matthews thanked the staff for their presentations. They were detailed and gave a picture of what's going on with Access. Specifically, the portion that he wanted to mention is in relation to the Where's My Ride app. There's been some great improvements in that app, and he is a bit of a technology enthusiast so it's great to see that that it continues to be utilized and continues to help ridership and lower that call center volume.

Vice Chair Barnes stated that he is honored to continue to serve as a member of the California Transit Association's Executive Committee representing transit Board members like Access Services, but also all transit board members in the state. He was appointed to Chair the committee for the Zero Emission Vehicle task force. He has had the honor of chairing that committee for several years now. He appreciates the conversations they have about the medium duty space and the light duty space. They have now branched off into locomotives and ferries. The whole suite of zero emission vehicles is on the table and there's a lot of work to be done. He thinks the conversations they have had helped him better understand what's happening within the organization.

## **12. NEW BUSINESS SUBSEQUENT TO THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA**

None.

## **13. PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS**

Fernando Roldan stated he agrees with Chair Hagen that things were a little disorganized with the Abilities Expo. He thinks they could have more of the providers involved to help. There was a lot of confusion and he thinks that needs to be looked into when the Expo comes back next year to the LA Convention Center.

## **14. CLOSED SESSION REPORT**

There was no Closed Session.

## **15. ADJOURNMENT**

Motion made by Director Gombert, seconded by Director Gibson to adjourn.

The meeting adjourned at 1:33 p.m.

Approved

---

Dolores Nason, Secretary

---

Date

APRIL 15, 2024

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
FROM: PETER STAWNICZY, FLEET ELECTRONICS TECHNICIAN  
BRIAN SELWYN, MANAGER, PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT  
ADMINISTRATION  
RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD CONTRACT FOR FLEET INSPECTION  
SERVICES (AS-4170)

---

**ISSUE:**

Board approval is required to exercise the award of Contract No. AS-4170 for fleet inspection services.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Authorize staff to execute Contract No. AS-4170 with AmeriTran Service Corporation (dba Transit Resource Center (TRC)) for fleet inspection services in an amount not to exceed \$620,404.41 for the base period of June 1, 2024 through May 31, 2027.

**IMPACT ON BUDGET**

This action is consistent with the FY 2023-2024 and 2024-2025 budgets and will be appropriately allocated in future budget years.

**EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, the staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a written contract upon terms and conditions no less favorable to Access than those proposed above. Access would not be legally bound to the contract herein proposed unless and until it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

**ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED**

The only alternative that could be considered would be to have current Access fleet staff perform the required audits. However, the agency does not have enough in-house staff to perform all the necessary inspections. Additionally, staff has determined that having a qualified third-party contractor perform these audits reduces the possibility of disagreements or discrepancies for certain types of inspections.

**BACKGROUND:**

Access is committed to protecting its fixed assets and ensuring that our service providers maintain the assets in a state of good repair. The third-party inspection

process is one of many means utilized by Access to protect those assets. Access Services requires that vehicles operated in revenue service, whether owned by the agency, the service provider, or contracted by the service provider, are maintained and kept in the best condition possible. In addition to the pre-trip and maintenance inspections currently being performed in the field by service contractors, Access' Fleet department and Road Safety Inspectors routinely perform inspections of all revenue vehicles and equipment. In order to ensure further compliance with this policy, Access has compiled a menu of inspections that are performed by a third-party auditor; the collection of inspections includes: in-plant inspections of new vehicles to be purchased by Access; inspections of Access-owned vehicles currently used in revenue service; and quarterly paper audits of non-dedicated, contractor-owned vehicles and taxis.

As a recipient of 5310 funding, Access is required to perform in-plant inspections of new vehicles during the procurement process. Historically, our vehicles have been built in three facilities, across three states: Texas, Arizona, and Indiana; additionally, vehicles are now acquired from a local vehicle manufacturer in California. Given that the build period can last as long as six months per vehicle, without the use of third-party inspectors, Access would have to utilize existing staff, or add new staff, re-locating them to facilities out of state for extended periods of time. Access believes that agency resources can be better spent by engaging the services of expert, third party inspectors to perform this work.

In terms of Access-owned vehicles currently in revenue service, staff has found the use of a third-party inspector essential in facilitating the transition of rolling stock from an outgoing to an incoming service provider. With the turnover of any service contract, a full inspection of all vehicles is required. The use of third-party inspectors (vs. Access or service provider staff) allows for an objective, non-biased assessment of the condition of vehicles during the transition period.

As is the case with the current contract, the new contractor will audit the maintenance records of over 800 non-Access owned taxis and other vehicles used in revenue service on a quarterly basis. This is an important, but extremely time-consuming task.

A Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued on January 4, 2024, to solicit proposals from firms qualified to perform the above listed services. To further advertise this opportunity to disadvantaged business entities potentially interested in this solicitation, the RFP was also shared with our diverse business opportunity consultant, GCAP. Proposals were submitted by AmeriTran Service Corporation (dba Transit Resource Center), Fleet Maintenance Consulting, Inc., and Fleet Maintenance Specialists. Inc. on February 8, 2024. The three firms and their proposals were deemed, respectively, responsible and responsive. (None of the firms are certified as a disadvantaged business enterprise.)

A request for proposal clarification and the opportunity to submit a Best and Final Offer (BAFO) was sent to the proposers on February 27, 2024. An evaluation team, consisting

of members of the Fleet Maintenance and Finance units, reviewed the proposals and responses to the requests for clarification and, based on the evaluation criteria delineated in the RFP, completed the scoring of the proposals on March 12th. TRC received the highest score overall score, as well as the highest technical score. Once scoring was finalized, staff then negotiated with TRC, whose price was lowered by approximately \$150,000.

The final scores are as follows:

<b>EVALUATION CRITERIA</b>	<b>TRC</b>	<b>FMS</b>	<b>FMC</b>
General Understanding (10 points max.)	9.60	8.23	6.67
Technical Approach (20 points max.)	18.87	17.60	13.13
Experience of Contractor & Staff Qualifications (20 points max.)	19.13	18.13	13.93
Project Staffing (20 points max.)	18.47	17.60	12.00
<b>TOTAL TECHNICAL SCORE</b>	<b>66.07</b>	<b>61.77</b>	<b>45.73</b>
Recent Similar Project References (10 points max.)	10.00	10.00	10.00
Pricing for Base Term+Option Years Following Receipt of Best and Final Offers (20 points max.)	16.26	20.00	5.58
<b>TOTAL OVERALL SCORES FOLLOWING RECEIPT OF BEST AND FINAL OFFERS</b>	<b>92.33</b>	<b>91.77</b>	<b>78.83</b>

Staff has determined that TRC is very well suited to undertake the work detailed in the RFP. TRC has completed fleet inspection services for Access in the past, holding contracts for over two decades. Access staff found all three companies to have the requisite qualified staff and proposed procedures necessary to complete the tasks as specified in the RFP. However, based on an evaluation of the technical and cost proposals, staff recommend awarding a contract to TRC under the terms of the RFP and based on the costs delineated below.

### Cost Analysis

Based on the historic rates of Access contractors providing the requested services, the rates charged to do fleet vehicle inspections and audits for peer agencies, the rising labor costs, and the proposer’s need to manage risk, the rates proposed by TRC are deemed fair and reasonable.

It should be noted that the rates under the outgoing contract, for which TRC is the incumbent, were computed based on the pre-pandemic industry rates and the industry environment of 2019. When the current contract was let, vehicle production schedules were shorter and more predictable. Given that a large portion of the cost for this service is linked to the inspection of vehicles in the plant, a longer production schedule means more hours to perform inspections. As Access provides compensation based on the number of completed inspections and not the time it takes to complete inspections, this has a significant effect on the proposers’ ability to accurately determine the cost of

performing the inspections. In reviewing TRC’s most current inspection project at upfitter Sunset Vans, for example, the total project cost (consisting of direct labor and travel expenses) was \$38,249, while the revenue earned based on the rates paid by Access to TRC was only \$21,827.

Another significant factor in the increase in proposed rates, both in-plant and locally, is the cost of labor itself. California labor rates have increased significantly over the past five years and in order to provide adequate compensation for well-qualified inspectors, proposers must be willing to pay competitive rates. As a significant portion of in-plant inspections are now conducted in California, as are all contractor turnover inspections, and quarterly taxi audits, this increase in labor rates affects the rates that proposers have quoted. Also contributing to this rate increase is a nearly 100% increase in the cost of fuel over the past five years, as well as increases in other elements included in the fully loaded rates of compensation such as worker’s compensation and liability insurance.

Considering the unpredictability of production schedules, labor costs and rates of inflation, TRC has proposed rates of compensation over the five-year term of the new contract period that are deemed fair and reasonable. The proposed annual increase in the rates of compensation over the three-year base period and two one-year extensions periods fall within the range of the year-over-year percentage changes in the Consumer Price Index seen over the past five years for the Los Angeles region (*US Department of Labor Statistics, Los Angeles Region*), which has varied from 0.7% to 8.6%. For the tasks delineated in Exhibit A below, none of the proposed annual rate increases exceed 5.80%.

The estimated cost for this service, based on assumed service levels for fleet inspections described in the RFP and final proposed rates, is as follows:

	<u>TRC</u>	<u>FMS</u>	<u>FMC</u>
<b>Cost: Three Year Base Period</b>	<b>\$620,404.41</b>	<b>\$599,400.00</b>	<b>\$1,418,886.64</b>
<b>Cost: Two Option Years</b>	<b>\$459,415.78</b>	<b>\$399,600.00</b>	<b>\$1,068,081.44</b>
<b>COST: TOTAL FIVE YEARS</b>	<b>\$1,079,820.19</b>	<b>\$999,000.00</b>	<b>\$2,486,968.08</b>

The annual task-specific rates proposed by the three proposers for each of the five years (three-year base + two one-year options) are provided in Exhibit A below.



**EXHIBIT A**

**PROPOSED RATES: YEARS 1-5**

**Year 1**

<b>TASK</b>	<b>FMS</b>	<b>TRC</b>	<b>FMC</b>
In-Plant Inspections Per Vehicle Rate (1-35 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$490.82	\$1,555.00
In-Plant Inspection Per Vehicle Rate (36-150 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$441.74	\$1,555.00
Production Change: Hourly Rate (20 Hrs. per year)	\$40.00	\$78.00	\$138.22
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (1-120 Vehicles)	\$150.00	\$48.81	\$106.33
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (121-200 Vehicles)	\$200.00	\$48.81	\$106.33
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (1-50 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$357.11	\$502.20
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (51-275 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$309.55	\$502.20
In Service 10% Per Vehicle Rate	\$200.00	\$314.04	\$414.66
<b>ANNUAL COST*</b>	<b>\$199,800.00</b>	<b>\$197,926.06</b>	<b>\$450,089.60</b>

*\* Cost based on estimated volume of activity as delineated in the subject RFP.*

Year 2

TASK	FMS	TRC	FMC
In-Plant Inspections Per Vehicle Rate (1-35 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$515.36	\$1,633.00
In-Plant Inspection Per Vehicle Rate (36-150 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$463.82	\$1,633.00
Production Change: Hourly Rate (20 Hrs. per year)	\$40.00	\$79.00	\$145.13
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (1-120 Vehicles)	\$150.00	\$49.26	\$111.65
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (121-200 Vehicles)	\$200.00	\$49.26	\$111.65
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (1-50 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$375.05	\$527.31
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (51-275 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$327.50	\$527.31
In Service 10% Per Vehicle Rate	\$200.00	\$331.98	\$435.39
<b>ANNUAL COST*</b>	<b>\$199,800.00</b>	<b>\$206,737.40</b>	<b>\$472,639.56</b>

*\* Cost based on estimated volume of activity as delineated in the subject RFP.*

Year 3

TASK	FMS	TRC	FMC
In-Plant Inspections Per Vehicle Rate (1-35 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$541.13	\$1,714.00
In-Plant Inspection Per Vehicle Rate (36-150 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$487.02	\$1,714.00
Production Change: Hourly Rate (20 Hrs. per year)	\$40.00	\$79.50	\$152.39
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (1-120 Vehicles)	\$150.00	\$49.70	\$117.23
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (121-200 Vehicles)	\$200.00	\$49.70	\$117.23
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (1-50 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$393.00	\$553.68
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (51-275 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$345.44	\$553.68
In Service 10% Per Vehicle Rate	\$200.00	\$349.93	\$457.16
<b>ANNUAL COST*</b>	<b>\$199,800.00</b>	<b>\$215,740.95</b>	<b>\$496,157.48</b>

*\* Cost based on estimated volume of activity as delineated in the subject RFP.*

Option Year 1

TASK	FMS	TRC	FMC
In-Plant Inspections Per Vehicle Rate (1-35 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$568.19	\$1,800.00
In-Plant Inspection Per Vehicle Rate (36-150 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$511.37	\$1,800.00
Production Change: Hourly Rate (20 Hrs. per year)	\$40.00	\$80.00	\$160.01
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (1-120 Vehicles)	\$150.00	\$50.15	\$123.09
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (121-200 Vehicles)	\$200.00	\$50.15	\$123.09
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (1-50 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$410.94	\$581.36
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (51-275 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$363.39	\$581.36
In Service 10% Per Vehicle Rate	\$200.00	\$367.87	\$480.02
<b>ANNUAL COST*</b>	<b>\$199,800.00</b>	<b>\$224,973.29</b>	<b>\$521,016.36</b>

*\* Cost based on estimated volume of activity as delineated in the subject RFP.*

Option Year 2

TASK	FMS	TRC	FMC
In-Plant Inspections Per Vehicle Rate (1-35 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$596.59	\$1,890.00
In-Plant Inspection Per Vehicle Rate (36-150 Vehicles)	\$400.00	\$536.94	\$1,890.00
Production Change: Hourly Rate (20 Hrs. per year)	\$40.00	\$80.50	\$168.01
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (1-120 Vehicles)	\$150.00	\$50.60	\$129.24
Taxi Quarterly Audit Per Vehicle Rate (121-200 Vehicles)	\$200.00	\$50.60	\$129.24
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (1-50 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$428.89	\$610.43
Contractor Turn Over Per Vehicle Rate (51-275 Vehicles)	\$350.00	\$381.33	\$610.43
In Service 10% Per Vehicle Rate	\$200.00	\$385.82	\$504.02
<b>ANNUAL COST*</b>	<b>\$199,800.00</b>	<b>\$234,442.49</b>	<b>\$547,065.08</b>

*\* Cost based on estimated volume of activity as delineated in the subject RFP.*

APRIL 15, 2024

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
 FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION  
 RE: UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS

---

**ISSUE:**

The following items are tentatively scheduled to be addressed by the Board and its committees through June 2024.

**May 20, 2024 - Board Meeting**

<b>Agenda Items:</b>	<b>Disposition:</b>
Employee Health and Benefit Contracts Renewals	Action
Commercial Business Package Insurance Renewals	Action
Self-Insured Retention Automobile Liability Program Renewal	Action

**June 24, 2024 - Board Meeting**

<b>Agenda Items:</b>	<b>Disposition:</b>
Language Interpreting Services Contract Award	Action
FY2024/25 Budget Approval	Action