

access

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
Monday, December 12, 2022
General Session: 12:00 p.m.
Closed Session: Immediately Following

***Webinar - please see note below**

MISSION STATEMENT

Access Services promotes access to all modes of transportation and provides quality and safe ADA paratransit service on behalf of public transit agencies in Los Angeles County.

	<u>DISPOSITION</u>
1. CALL TO ORDER	ACTION
2. REVIEW & APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE BOARD MEETING ON OCTOBER 17, 2022 (page 7) [Staff Recommendation: Approve minutes as written.]	ACTION [Vote Required: majority of quorum by roll call]
3. REVIEW & APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE BOARD SPECIAL MEETING ON NOVEMBER 15, 2022 (page 17) [Staff Recommendation: Approve minutes as written.]	ACTION [Vote Required: majority of quorum by roll call]
4. REPORT FROM EX-OFFICIO BOARD MEMBERS	INFORMATION
5. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT	INFORMATION
6. SUPERIOR SERVICE AWARD	PRESENTATION

7. **CONSENT CALENDAR**

ACTION
[Vote Required:
majority of
quorum by roll
call]

Item reviewed by the Performance Monitoring Committee:

- a) Consideration to Extend Term and Increase Funds - TAP Card Production Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) (page 19)
[Staff Recommendation: Authorize an additional \$400,000 for the production and issuance of Access Rider ID/TAP cards for the period of February 1, 2023 - January 31, 2024.]

Items reviewed and approved by the Planning and Development Committee:

- b) Consideration to Approve 2023 Board Calendar (page 21)
[Staff Recommendation: Review and approve the proposed Board and Standing Committee Meeting calendar for 2023.]
- c) Consideration to Award Demand Forecasting Services Contract (AS-4161) (page 24)
[Staff Recommendation: Authorize staff to execute Contract No. AS-4161 with Hollingsworth Consulting LLC (Hollingsworth) for demand forecasting services in an amount not-to-exceed \$250,000 for a five-year period beginning July 1, 2023.]

Items reviewed and approved by the External/Stakeholders Relations Committee:

- d) Consideration to Approve Community Advisory Committee Member Reappointments (page 29)
[Staff Recommendation: Staff requests the Board to reappoint the following Group B members.
- Olivia Almalel
 - Maria Aroch
 - Michael Conrad
 - Rachele Goeman
 - Kimberly Hudson
 - Jan Johnson
 - Liam Matthews

Item neither reviewed nor approved by any Committee:

- e) Consideration to Approve Resolution to Continue Public Meetings through Teleconferencing (page 31)
[Staff Recommendation: Approve the following resolution - "The Access Board of Directors has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency; and the following circumstances exist: (i) The state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of the members to meet safely in person; and (ii) State or local officials continue to impose or recommend measures to promote social distancing. Hence, teleconferencing for Access Board and committee meetings will continue for the next thirty (30) days."]

[Staff Recommendation: Approve the Consent Calendar.]

- | | | |
|-----|---|--|
| 8. | CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AGENCY SAFETY PLAN (PTASP) (page 33)

[Staff Recommendation: Approve Access' Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan (PTASP), which documents Access' processes and activities related to Safety Management System (SMS) implementation in compliance with federal regulations.] | ACTION
[Vote Required: majority of quorum by roll call] |
| 9. | SCOPE OF WORK REVIEW - EASTERN REGION | PRESENTATION |
| 10. | SURVEY QUESTIONS REVIEW | PRESENTATION |
| 11. | PROCUREMENT PROCESS REVIEW | PRESENTATION |
| 12. | OPERATIONS UPDATE | PRESENTATION |
| 13. | UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS (page 36) | INFORMATION |
| 14. | EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT | INFORMATION |
| 15. | BOARD MEMBER COMMUNICATION | INFORMATION |
| 16. | NEW BUSINESS SUBSEQUENT TO THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA | DISCUSSION/
POSSIBLE
ACTION |
| 17. | PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS | INFORMATION |

18. **CLOSED SESSION:**

DISCUSSION/
POSSIBLE
ACTION

A) PUBLIC EMERGENCY (COVID-19), GOV. CODE 54957(a)

B) CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL: GOV. CODE §54956.9

1. Anticipated Litigation: Gov. Code §54956.9 (b)

(i) Significant exposure to litigation pursuant to subdivision (b) of Gov. Code §54956.9 (b) a situation where, based on the advice of counsel considering "existing facts and circumstances," there exists a "significant exposure to litigation".

2. Pending Litigation: Gov. Code §54956.9 (d)(1)

(i) Litigation, to which Access Services is a party, has been initiated formally.

1. International Brotherhood of Teamsters Local 848 v. Access Services, Case # LA-CE-1532-M

2. Aviles, Guillermo v. Access Services, Case # 20STCV3752

19. **ADJOURNMENT**

ACTION

Access Services does not discriminate on the basis of disability. Accordingly, Access Services seeks to ensure that individuals with disabilities will have an equal opportunity to participate in the range of Access Services events and programs by providing appropriate auxiliary aids and services for communications. Primary consideration is given to the request of individuals with disabilities. However, the final decision belongs to Access Services. To help ensure the availability of any auxiliary aids and services you require, please make every effort to notify Access Services of your request at least three (3) business days (72 hours) prior to the meeting in which you wish to utilize those aids or services. You may do so by contacting (213) 270-6000.

Note: Access Services Board meetings are held pursuant to the Ralph M. Brown Act [Cal. Gov. Code §54950] and are open to the public. The public may view and obtain all written information supporting this agenda provided to the Board both initially and supplementally prior to the meeting at the agency's offices located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue, El Monte, California and on its website at <http://accessla.org>. Documents, including Power Point handouts distributed to the Board members by staff or Board members at the meeting, will simultaneously be made available to the public. Three opportunities are available for the public to address the Board during a Board meeting: (1) before closed session regarding matters to be discussed in closed session, (2) before a specific agenda item is debated and voted upon regarding that item and (3) general public comment. The exercise of the right to address the Board is subject to restriction as to time and appropriate decorum. All persons wishing to make public

comment must fill out a goldenrod Public Comment Form and submit it to the Secretary of the Board. Public comment is generally limited to three (3) minutes per speaker and the total time available for public comment may be limited at the discretion of the Chairperson. Persons whose speech is impaired such that they are unable to address the Board at a normal rate of speed may request an accommodation of a limited amount of additional time from the Chair but only by checking the appropriate box on the Public Comment Form. Granting such an accommodation is at the discretion of the Chair. The Board of Directors will not and cannot respond during the meeting to matters raised under general public comment. Pursuant to provisions of the Brown Act governing these proceedings, no discussion or action may be taken on these matters unless they are listed on the agenda, or unless certain emergency or special circumstances exist. However, the Board may direct staff to investigate and/or schedule certain matters for consideration at a future Board of Directors Meeting and the staff may respond to all public comments in writing prior to the next Board meeting.

Alternative accessible formats are available upon request.

***NOTE**

NOTICE OF ALTERNATIVE PUBLIC COMMENT PROCEDURES

Pursuant to temporary revised Brown Act requirements, Board members will be participating via webinar. The public may submit written comments on any item on the agenda - 1) through email by addressing it to - board@accessla.org or 2) via US Postal mail by addressing it to - Access Services Board Comments, PO Box 5728, El Monte CA 91734. Please include your name, item number and comments in the correspondence. Comments must be submitted/received no later than 10:00 am on Monday, December 12, 2022, so they can be read into the record as appropriate.

The public may also participate via the Zoom webinar link, or by teleconference. Please review the procedures to do so as follows -

How to Provide Public Comment in a Board Meeting via Zoom

Online

1. Click the Zoom link for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at: https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html. Make sure to use a current, up-to-date browser: Chrome 30+, Firefox 27+, Microsoft Edge 12+, or Safari 7+. Certain functionality may be disabled in older browsers including Internet Explorer. You may also use this direct link - <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/89931759082>
2. Enter an email address and your name. Your name will be visible online while you are speaking.

3. When the Board Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, click on "raise hand." Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Mute all other audio before speaking. Using multiple devices can cause audio feedback.
4. Please note that the "Chat" feature is not enabled during the meeting for general public attendees. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, then please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called, please limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

Note: Members of the public will not be shown on video.

By phone

1. Call the Zoom phone number and enter the webinar ID for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at:
https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html
2. You can also call in using the following information -
3. Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):
4. US: +1 669 444 9171 or +1 669 900 6833 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 719 359 4580 or +1 253 205 0468 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 305 224 1968 or +1 309 205 3325 or +1 312 626 6799 or +1 360 209 5623 or +1 386 347 5053 or +1 507 473 4847 or +1 564 217 2000 or +1 646 931 3860 or +1 689 278 1000 or +1 929 205 6099 or 877 853 5247 (Toll Free) or 888 788 0099 (Toll Free) or 833 548 0276 (Toll Free) or 833 548 0282 (Toll Free)
Webinar ID: 899 3175 9082
5. When the Board Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, press *9 to raise a hand. Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Speakers will be called by the last four digits of their phone number. Please note that phone numbers in their entirety will be visible online while speakers are speaking.
6. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, then please submit a written comment as outlined above.
7. When called, please state your name and limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.



**STATEMENT OF PROCEEDINGS FOR THE
MEETING OF THE ACCESS SERVICES
BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Webinar

October 17, 2022

12:00 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chair Burner at 12:01 p.m.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT REPRESENTING A QUORUM

Present: Chair Martin Gombert, Vice Chair Lee Burner, Treasurer Doran Barnes, Secretary Dolores Nason, Directors Adrian Aguilar, Andrew Del Castillo, Theresa DeVera, Giovanna Gogreve and John Troost.

BOARD MEMBER(S) EXCUSED FROM THE MEETING

Not Present: None

2. REVIEW & APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE BOARD MEETINGS ON JULY 18, AUGUST 15, SEPTEMBER 7, and SEPTEMBER 19, 2022

Recommendation: Approval of minutes as written.

Motion made by Director Troost to approve the minutes, seconded by Director Aguilar. Director Gogreve abstained on the August 15, 2022, minutes. Director Troost abstained on the August 15, 2022. minutes. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

3. REPORT FROM EX-OFFICIO BOARD MEMBERS

CAC Chair Yael Hagen reported that for the September meeting, she was elected as Chair with Liam Matthews as Vice Chair and that Strategic Planner Eric Haack discussed the upcoming survey. At the October meeting, the CAC discussed working with

Access' outreach department, as well as participating in community meetings and using social media. Vice Chair Liam Matthews spoke about improvements that can be made to the website and making it more accessible to people with disabilities. There was also an operations report and a discussion on statistics and KPIs. Mask mandates were discussed which prompted many public comments from those who believe that the mask mandate should stop and those that believe that it should continue. There was also an update on the CAC subcommittees.

TPAC Chair Diane Amaya reported that the TPAC met on September 8. Manager of Training and Compliance Alvina Narayan provided an overview of Access' Diversity, Equity and Inclusion plan, and Access' efforts to advance the program. Strategic Planner Eric Haack presented on the survey that is designed to determine overall customer satisfaction. He requested feedback from the TPAC members on how to improve the survey. Operations Manager Rogelio Gomez presented the operations report for July 2022. He provided an update on key performance indicators and highlights for each service area. He also provided an update on the ETA requests and online reservations. Director of Planning Matthew Avancena facilitated the TPAC officer elections. Chair Amaya stated that it was proposed to reelect herself as Chairperson and Fayma Ishaq from LA Metro as Vice Chair. Matthew Avancena asked for volunteers to serve on the TNC working group. Gracie Davis and Fayma Ishaq volunteered for this working group.

4. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Julian Vargas made a public comment by asking Access Services to discontinue the mask policy. He stated that the CDC reduced the mandate from "must wear" to "strongly recommend". He believes that it is discrimination to continue to force riders to wear a mask.

Lisa Anderson made a public comment by stating that people who were taking the public bus weren't charging the people a fare. She wanted to know why Access was charging a fare when the public bus is not. She also stated that they limit how many riders are in one vehicle at a time.

David DeLauder made a public comment by stating that they should stop the mask mandate. He is blind and he knows he has been asked not to bring dogs on board in public transport because they have allergies. He wants to be sure it is not something that happens often.

Jaymee Castillo made a public comment by stating that she would like the mask mandate to be optional. Although she is immunocompromised, she doesn't want to ride in a vehicle for two hours with a mask on.

Nancy Urquilla made a public comment by stating that the mask requirement should be optional. She stated that other forms of transportation have stopped the mask mandate and would like Access Services to follow suit.

5. SUPERIOR SERVICE AWARD

Project Administrator Jessica Volanos introduced the Superior Service Award winner Felicia Gibson.

6. CONSENT CALENDAR

Recommendation: Approval of all items on the Consent Calendar.

CONSENT CALENDAR

- d) Consideration to Extend Term and Increase Funds - Legal Services Contract (AS-4039)
- e) Consideration to Approve Renewal of Agency Insurance Policies
- f) Consideration to Approve Additional Agency Holidays
- f) Consideration to Approve Transportation Professionals Advisory Committee Member Reappointments
- g) Consideration to Approve Board and Standing Meeting Calendar Change
- h) Consideration to Approve Amendment to the Executive Director's Employment Agreement
- i) Consideration to Approve Resolution to Continue Public Meetings through Teleconferencing

Public Comment:

None.

Motion made by Treasurer Barnes to approve the Consent Calendar item, seconded by Director DeVera. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

7. CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM AND CHANGE RATES - NORTHERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4059)

Deputy Executive Director Hector Rodriguez, Manager of Procurement and Contracts Brian Selwyn and Senior Manager of Operations Rogelio Gomez presented this item.

Public Comment:

None.

Board Discussion:

Director Gogreve asked for examples of emergencies. Mr. Rodriguez responded that if there were evacuations for a fire or flood that would require them to pick up stranded people outside of their service area rather than just ADA paratransit. Director Gogreve responded that she was concerned about the on-time performance, missed trips and reduced service complaints. Mr. Rodriguez responded that any non-performance or failure to meet a KPI, is subject to the liquidated damage clause in their contract. Mr. Gomez responded that they are in contact daily with the contractor. Director Gogreve asked if the riders are given any sort of remediation for excessively long trips or missed trips. Mr. Gomez responded that Access does not.

Board Member Comments:

Treasurer Barnes stated he supported the item, and he knows that they are long contracts and encourages Access to look at contracts that maybe don't run as long. It seems like the whole economic environment will change drastically in the next few years. Mr. Colaiace responded they would definitely look into it.

Motion made by Secretary Nason to approve item, seconded by Director Gogreve. Via Roll Call Vote - Director Aguilar abstained, all others were in favor, motion passed.

8. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD TRAVEL TRAINING CONTRACT (AS-4157)

Strategic Planner Eric Haack and Manager of Procurement and Contract Administration Brian Selwyn presented this item.

Public Comment:

Lisa Anderson made a public comment by asking for information on Metro Micro, because she heard they had to have a Tap Card that has money on it or use a debit card. She would like to try it. Mr. Haack stated that he will reach out to her.

Board Discussion:

Director Aguilar asked how much staff MMP was planning to add to the contract and where those positions will be located. Mr. Haack responded that this was in anticipation of doing more one-on-one travel training. Mr. Selwyn added that they were also requiring a full-time call center manager, which is something that's new. Mr. Haack responded that he would reach out to Director Aguilar for more clarification.

Director Gogreve asked if they were going to continue to do the virtual training. She believes this will be a benefit to riders. Mr. Haack responded that when someone seeks travel training the preferred method is to do it in person. The RFP was written should they not be able to do it in person, they have the option to fall back into the virtual

mode. Director Gogreve responded that it would be great to keep some of it just as an option for those who can be intimidated by going out and asked if this is something they can discuss at a later date.

Director Gogreve asked Mr. Selwyn if they reached out to some of the advocacy groups or the people that they partner with to get other companies to bid. Mr. Selwyn responded that they work with GCAP to see if they could expand the field.

Board Member Comments:

None.

Motion made by Director Gogreve to approve item, seconded by Director DeVera. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

9. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD CUSTOMER SERVICE CALL CENTER CONTRACT (AS-4160)

Deputy Executive Director Hector Rodriguez, Procurement Administrator David Chia, and Manager of Customer Relations Susanna Cadenas presented this item.

Public Comment:

None.

Board Discussion:

Director Gogreve asked if they had some sort of retention policy for their employees. She also asked about the incentives offered to their employees and any hiring practices that they may have. Ms. Cadenas responded by stating that they did not. They will be adding some new incentives to their contract where they will be promoting staff from within. They also have incentives, in the form of bonuses, related to performance.

Director Gogreve made a comment by stating that they should have a competitive starting wage so that they do not keep having those problems and that it is important to keep the existing employees. Mr. Chia stated that they have increased wages. Director Gogreve asked if this was vetted or passed on to the CAC and TPAC for their approval or review or comment. Mr. Colaiace responded that they got feedback from them when they presented the scope of work.

Director Aguilar asked what the justification was for the large monthly fee increase. He stated that inflation's up, but he finds that 35% is significantly higher than expected. Mr. Rodriguez responded that the starting wage is basically one of the factors that influenced the 35% increase. The starting wage went up by 8%, then you add inflation, which adds about another 8%. On top of that, there are three staff that have been

added. They were also adding 24/7 supervisor coverage that basically expands the number of staff required to fully staff the contract. Those are factors that went into the overall increase of 35%. Ms. Cadenas responded it was one part-time employee for every 4 full-time employees.

Director DeVera stated that when the Board first approved this, the riders were not really in favor of ALTA and just to hear that the rider voice was not consulted in the decision, is not ok. Mr. Colaiace stated that they have brought various items to the CAC to get feedback and also brought new concepts about what they wanted to do. From his perspective, they consulted with the CAC on what they were going to do in this RFP.

Board Member Comments:

Director DeVera stated that anything that has to do with customer service should go before the riders in a public hearing or a meeting. Customer service is the face of Access, and they should allow them to speak about what is working and what's not working.

Secretary Nason stated that she agrees with Director DeVera because at the retreat, they spoke about the importance of bringing things to the CAC and TPAC. This situation shows that they were not really doing this, and it is something to be conscious of in the future.

Director Gogreve stated that they should bring this to their advisory bodies to get their input before they make a huge decision that affects the customers and riders. Mr. Colaiace stated that they usually bring the scope to them but he will be sure to take another look at the process. Director Gogreve stated that she was on that panel as a TPAC member and there was a Board member on the panel that selected ALTA. It would be good to have someone representing TPAC or CAC on the panel or the Board. Mr. Colaiace stated that a Metro employee was on the procurement panel.

Director Troost stated that they should involve someone like the Los Angeles County Commission on Disabilities. Mr. Colaiace stated that staff will take this all under advisement.

Treasurer Barnes stated that they should get a refresher on the procurement process when making decisions on any scope of work and when bringing an item before the Board. Mr. Colaiace responded they would do that.

Motion made by Director Aguilar to approve item, seconded by Secretary Nason. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

10. BOARD RETREAT REVIEW

Ms. Teri Fisher of Insight Strategies presented this item.

Public Comment:

None.

Board Comments:

Director DeVera stated that the Board retreat was very eye-opening. She thanked Teri for facilitating it and appreciated that everyone worked as a team. The Board and staff were very optimistic about the future.

Treasurer Barnes stated that it was a good day and he echoed everything Director DeVera said. There was true power in coming together and working as a team. They certainly need to do more sessions like that. They did cover a lot of ground but left a lot to be covered.

11. OPERATIONS UPDATE

Chief Operations Officer Mike Greenwood presented this item.

Public Comment:

Jaymee Castillo made a public comment by stating that there is a bug on the Where's My Ride app. She uses a screen reader and there is an inconsistency between the mileage and travel minutes. This confuses the driver, the rider and creates problems. She would like someone to check this feature out.

Board Comments:

Director Gogreve thanked Mr. Greenwood for the presentation and thinks that they are moving in the right direction, especially with the drivers. She asked how many more drivers they would need to get rid of the deficit. Mr. Greenwood responded that they received an update from the contractors last week and the deficit has increased to about 120 drivers at two of the contractors. As the peak season hit, the need for drivers also increased because the ridership increased. On the taxi side, they are still offering incentives and they have also made some adjustments to account for the rise in the city's taxi rates. The contractors have not had much luck attracting new taxi drivers to join the Access driver ranks.

Treasurer Barnes stated that the Operations report had some very good news concerning the drivers, especially with the way the industry is struggling right now. He also knows the phenomenal increases in costs for vehicles is something they are going

to have to wrestle with. Mr. Colaiace stated that he directed staff to look at a non-Buy America path for vehicles because they have to look at everything. With the non-Buy America route, they can get vehicles easier and at less cost.

Treasurer Barnes stated that he would encourage them to continue to buy American products to the greatest extent they can but given the situation, they need to take what they can get. Mr. Colaiace responded that there are still many American-made parts on many of the vehicles but that being able to purchase these would be a huge help.

12. UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS

Director of Administration F Scott Jewell presented this item.

Public Comment:

None.

Board Comments:

None.

13. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Executive Director Andre Colaiace stated that he attended the APTA conference in Seattle and met with a number of different vendors, including various transportation network companies. They got a lot of information about how their peer agencies were using these companies around the United States. They will be discussing this with the TNC working group. On a very sad note, the Access family unfortunately lost two people who have contributed greatly to the success of the agency, CAC member Michael Arrigo and Access' Manager of Eligibility David Foster.

Public Comment:

None.

Board Comments:

None.

14. BOARD MEMBER COMMUNICATION

CAC Chair Yael Hagen stated that there were two things she forgot to mention in her report. They were very sad about the loss and passing of Michael Arrigo and it was very nice to see him on the video. She also added that the two people that were appointed for the TNC working group were herself and Rachele Goeman. She thanked Rachele

Goeman and Gordon Cardona for their leadership as past Chair and Vice Chairs of the CAC. One of their main goals as incoming Chairs was to improve communication with the Board and have a better partnership. She encouraged the Board to attend their meetings.

Director Del Castillo stated that he would like to be better educated in the processes of how they do their contracts. As a rider he would like to know the procurement process from proposal to approval and what factors contribute to the contractors being more responsive to all of the riders. He is really impressed by all the work that does go into it.

Director Troost echoed Yael Hagen's comments. He also thanked Andre Colaiace for the presentations during the meeting and tributes to Michael Arrigo and David Foster.

Director DeVera echoed what Director Gogreve said concerning the compensation of riders when experiencing long or excessively long trips. This should be an agenda item in the future as something they need to do for riders as a small token for their troubles. Michael Arrigo was her CAC appointee in the past and he was such a humble person. He and David Foster will be greatly missed.

Secretary Nason stated that every year her staff has an annual retreat, and it's supposed to be a time of both learning and team building. This year, they did it on mobility and travel training. They took the LA Metro train to Universal Studios from Long Beach and took shuttles to the Universal Studio City Walk. She explained their travel and stated they had a nice Italian lunch at the end. If they could do this trip across the county, then anybody can.

Director Gogreve stated that she started her career with David Foster in 1995. They both lived in the same community, so they did a lot of things together. They carpoled and played tennis and he watched her kids grow up. He worked really hard to make Access a better place and he left way too early. It hurts her heart and she stated that he was a great guy. Michael Arrigo was such a wonderful guy. She had known him for a long time, and he was so loved by a lot of people, not only in his community, but all over. They will both be greatly missed. She thanked the Superior Service Award winner.

Director DeVera thanked F Scott Jewell for pushing her uphill during the conference in Seattle and all the help with registration.

Treasurer Barnes stated that Seattle was a great city but definitely presented some mobility challenges for everyone. He stated they have a closed session in a moment but would like to adjourn the meeting in recognition and celebration of the lives of David Foster and Michael Arrigo.

15. NEW BUSINESS SUBSEQUENT TO THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

No new business was heard subsequent to the posting of the agenda.

16. PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS

There was no public comment.

17. CLOSED SESSION REPORT

Director of Administration F Scott Jewell stated that no action was taken by the Board.

18. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Director Aguilar, seconded by Director DeVera to adjourn in the memory of Michael Arrigo and David Foster.

The meeting adjourned at 2:17 p.m.

Approved

Dolores Nason, Secretary

Date



STATEMENT OF PROCEEDINGS FOR THE
SPECIAL MEETING OF THE ACCESS
SERVICES BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Webinar

November 15, 2022

1:00 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Chair Gombert at 1:06 p.m.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT REPRESENTING A QUORUM

Present: Chair Gombert, Vice Chair Burner, Treasurer Barnes, Secretary Nason, Directors Aguilar, Del Castillo, DeVera and Troost

BOARD MEMBER(S) EXCUSED FROM THE MEETING

Not Present: Director Gogreve

2. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

3. CONSENT CALENDAR

Recommendation: Approval of all items on the Consent Calendar.

- a) Consideration to Approve Resolution to Continue Public Meetings through Teleconferencing

Public Comments

None.

Motion made by Secretary Nason to approve the Consent Calendar, seconded by Director Troost. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

4. PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS

Public Comments

None.

5. CLOSED SESSION REPORT

Director of Administration F Scott Jewell stated that the Board authorized staff to enter into a disposition and developer agreement with the City of Lancaster for the purchase of parcels APN 3126-009-975 and 3126-009-974 for the amount of \$664,507.80. **Motion made by Director DeVera and seconded by Secretary Nason. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.**

6. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Secretary Nason, seconded by Director Aguilar to adjourn.

The meeting adjourned at 1:17 p.m.

Approved

Dolores Nason, Secretary

Date

DECEMBER 5, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM AND INCREASE FUNDS - TAP CARD PRODUCTION MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING (MOU)

ISSUE:

Additional funding is required to continue the production of Access Rider ID/TAP cards under the existing MOU with Metro. This item was reviewed by the Performance Monitoring Committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize an additional \$400,000 for the production and issuance of Access Rider ID/TAP cards for the period of February 1, 2023 - January 31, 2024.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

This action will result in an increase in the previously approved contract amount of \$2,119,000 to \$2,519,000. Approximately \$75,000 of the requested funds are necessary to cover a higher number of card replacements for the current period. The reimbursement agreement is based on a per card cost of \$4.50 plus shipping that is invoiced by Metro on a quarterly basis. There is no increase to the card cost for this extension. The funding for this agreement comes from Prop C Discretionary funds.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

Regional production of TAP cards is handled by Metro for all TAP-participating transit operators in the county in order to maintain uniformity and security. Metro has competitively bid and negotiated the contracts for the production of the cards and is currently utilizing two companies for those services. Accordingly, no other alternatives were considered.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and extend the MOU with Metro for the production and

issuance of Access Rider ID/TAP cards upon terms and conditions no less favorable to Access Services than those proposed above. Access Services would not be legally bound to the contract unless the terms are incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

In September 2014, the Board authorized a number of changes to the Access Rider ID/TAP Card program which included an agreement with Metro for the production of the Access Rider ID/TAP card. In December 2022, the Board extended the agreement through January 2023. It is now necessary to increase funds and extend the term to continue production for another year through January 2024.

Due to COVID-19 pandemic issues, new and renewal eligibilities were restricted to a one-year extension as riders were evaluated virtually and functional in-person evaluations were not possible from late March 2020 through March 2022. Since the Access Rider ID/TAP cards are hard coded with the eligibility expiring date, it has been necessary for the cards to also be issued more frequently. Staff anticipates this higher usage level to continue through 2023 but at a lower pace as rider's renewal eligibilities are cycled back to the standard three-year process.

DECEMBER 5, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE 2023 BOARD CALENDAR

ISSUE:

Staff is presenting to the Board for its review and approval the attached list of scheduled Board and Standing Committee Meetings for calendar year 2023. This item was reviewed and approved by the Planning and Development Committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Review and approve the proposed Board and Standing Committee Meeting calendar for 2023.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

None.

DISCUSSION:

The standing committee structure dictates an alternating monthly schedule for the committee and full Board meetings.

All meetings, with the exception of the Annual meeting, are scheduled to take place at Access Services located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue in El Monte. However, due to pandemic conditions, all meetings will be held virtually until further notice.

2023 Meeting Calendar

Annual

Date	Meeting Type	Time
Wednesday November 1 st	Annual Meeting*	11:00 am

*At California Endowment Center

Board

<u>Date</u>	<u>Meeting Type</u>	<u>Time</u>
Monday February 27 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday April 17 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday June 26 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday August 28 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday October 23 rd	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday December 18 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm

Committees

<u>Date</u>	<u>Meeting Type</u>	<u>Time</u>
Monday March 6 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Monday May 1 st	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Wednesday July 5 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Tuesday September 5 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Monday October 30 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Tuesday December 19 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm

<u>Date</u>	<u>Meeting Type</u>	<u>Time</u>
Monday January 23 rd	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday March 27 th	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday May 22 nd	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday July 24 th	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday September 18 th	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday November 27 th	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm

DECEMBER 5, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

**FROM: MATTHEW AVANCENA, DIRECTOR, PLANING AND COORDINATION
KIMBERLIE NIMORI, PROCUREMENT COORDINATOR**

**RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD DEMAND FORECASTING SERVICES
CONTRACT (AS-4161)**

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to exercise the award of a demand (ridership) forecasting services contract. This item was reviewed and approved by the Planning and Development Committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute Contract No. AS-4161 with Hollingsworth Consulting LLC (Hollingsworth) for demand forecasting services in an amount not-to-exceed \$250,000 for a five-year period beginning July 1, 2023.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The costs associated with this contract will be appropriately budgeted for FY 2023 and the subsequent out years and includes a contingency of \$29,600 for other services. The funding for this service is allocated from local Proposition C sales tax funds. At Access' sole discretion, this contract may be extended for up to five (5) additional years in one-year increments.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

None. As the ADA Complementary Paratransit provider for L.A. County, Access is obligated to forecast ridership demand based on sound economic, demographic, statistical and scientific principles and use that forecast to design and implement its service to meet all forecasted demand. Staff does not possess the expertise to perform this function in-house.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a written agreement upon terms and conditions no less favorable to Access than those proposed herein. Access would not be legally bound to the contract herein proposed unless and until it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

On May 20, 2013, the Board approved staff's recommendation to award Contract No. AS-3393 for demand forecasting services to HDR Engineering, Inc. for a five base year period with the option to extend the term for an additional five years in one-year increments. All options have been exercised and Contract No. AS-3393 expires on June 30, 2023.

Access staff released an RFP in order to find a firm capable of providing ridership demand projections on an on-going basis. Part of the impetus for originally soliciting such assistance involved the issuance of a clarification letter on October 25, 2002, by the U.S. Department of Justice on behalf of the Department of Transportation in the case of *Anderson, et al. v. Rochester-Genesee Regional Transp. Auth., et al.* That letter made clear the federal regulatory interpretation that transit agencies must "design, fund, and implement a next-day service to meet the foreseeable needs of all ADA-eligible individuals," generally referred to as the "zero denials" rule. Staff believes it necessary to continue to receive assistance to project passenger demand, based on sound economic, demographic, statistical and scientific principles to the maximum extent possible. Staff has utilized ridership projections developed by a consulting firm since 2003.

Ridership projections developed by the consultant are needed to establish Access' annual operating budget including the development of its Short Range and/or Long-Range Transportation Plans. In the past, staff has asked the consulting firm to analyze the impacts on ADA ridership when FTA implemented its Origin-to-Destination service, the economic downturn from 2007 to 2009 after the bursting of the U.S. housing bubble and the global financial crisis (the Great Recession), the COVID-19 pandemic and other socio-economic and demographic changes in the County.

Other forecasting services that staff may request from the consultant include the continuing impacts of COVID-19 on Access' ridership, potential fare changes from the County's largest fixed route provider L.A. Metro, a possible economic recession in the near term, the 2026 FIFA World Cup and the L.A. Summer Olympics in 2028.

Procurement Overview

On August 22, 2022, Access issued Request for Proposals (RFP) No. AS-4161 to select a qualified consultant to conduct and develop a comprehensive forecasting methodology for ADA complementary paratransit ridership and eligibility projections in Los Angeles County. Over 200 companies either clicked on or downloaded the RFP from either the Access website or from the nationwide e-procurement service, Public Purchase. We also worked with our consultant GCAP to ensure that the solicitation was made known to firms which are certified as a disadvantaged business by one or more government jurisdictions. Access issued one addenda, providing responses to proposer questions. By the September 21, 2022 deadline, Access received proposals from the following firms:

1. HDR Engineering, Inc. (HDR)
2. Hollingsworth Consulting LLC (Hollingsworth) (SBE)

Both proposals were deemed responsive and the proposers responsible. As part of their proposals, the proposers (both prime contractors and if applicable, their subcontractors) were also asked to provide information regarding their status as a disadvantaged business, indicating whether they were certified in one or more the following categories: Small Business Enterprise, Women Business Enterprise, Disadvantaged Business Enterprise, Minority Business Enterprise, Disabled Veterans Business Enterprise, or other. Hollingsworth reported being certified as a Small Business Enterprise.

Shortly after the deadline for receipt of proposals, a market survey was conducted to determine the reasons why firms who downloaded the RFP ultimately decided not to submit a proposal. Of the firms who downloaded the RFP, the primary reasons for not submitting a proposal fell into two categories: the firm did not have sufficient staffing needed to undertake the work or work involved was outside of their area of expertise, regardless of staffing, to undertake the work.

A request for clarification and a Best and Final Offer were issued on October 11, 2022.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and associated weights:

Evaluation Criteria	Maximum
1. Technical expertise and experience of proposed consultant staff	45
2. Understanding of the issues and of the local and Federal environments	30
3. Ability to meet project deadlines	15
4. Cost Proposal Reasonableness, including allocation of cost elements	10
TOTAL	100

An evaluation panel was convened and a comprehensive technical evaluation by three members of Access staff followed. During the period from September 21, 2022 through October 18, 2022, the evaluation panel conducted its evaluation of the proposals. Based on the evaluation criteria, Hollingsworth ranked the highest. A summary of scores is set forth below.

Evaluation Criteria	HDR	Hollingsworth
1. Technical expertise and experience of proposed consultant staff	35.85	35.85
2. Understanding of the issues and of the local and Federal environments	24.20	21.70
3. Ability to meet project deadlines	8.00	12.25
4. Cost Proposal	8.56	10.00
TOTAL	76.61	79.80

COST ANALYSIS

Hollingsworth's price for the five-year base term was determined to be fair and reasonable. In addition to proposing the lowest cost, the final negotiated cost proposed by Hollingsworth for the five-year base period is lower than the Independent Cost Estimate of \$410,662.

Hollingsworth's proposed average hourly rate of \$100.00 for the five-year base term is lower than the current average hourly rate of \$143.69 and compares favorably with the

most recent year-over-year increase in the Consumer Price Index for the Los Angeles area of 7.8% (*U.S. Consumer Price Index, Los Angeles Region, September 2022*).

Proposer	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Five Year Total
HDR	\$55,112.91	\$48,211.52	\$49,754.29	\$51,346.43	\$52,989.51	\$257,414.66
Hollingsworth	\$45,200.00	\$43,800.00	\$43,800.00	\$43,800.00	\$43,800.00	\$220,400.00

RECOMMENDED CONTRACTOR

Hollingsworth Consulting LLC’s primary areas of expertise include data analytics and Lean Six Sigma processes. The project team consists of Brad Hollingsworth, PE who will serve as the Project Manager and Dusan Sormaz, PhD who will serve as the technical lead.

Brad Hollingsworth is a certified Lean Six Sigma Master Black Belt and registered Professional Engineer. He brings nearly two decades of experience leading improvement projects in the manufacturing, healthcare, and public service sectors.

Dusan Sormaz, PhD is the owner of IMPSystems LLC. He brings over 27 years of experience as a Professor of Industrial and Systems Engineering at Ohio University. Sormaz earned his doctorate in Industrial and Systems Engineering from the University of Southern California (USC) as well as a master’s degree in Computer Science at USC.

DECEMBER 5, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: MATTHEW AVANCENA, DIRECTOR, PLANNING AND COORDINATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEMBER REAPPOINTMENTS

ISSUE:

Seven Community Advisory Committee (CAC) members are about to complete their terms, which will expire on January 31, 2023. The reappointments recommended below are for two-year terms beginning February 1, 2023, and expiring on January 31, 2025. The CAC bylaws require Board reappointment for CAC members. This item was reviewed and approved by the External/Stakeholders Relations Committee.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff requests the Board to reappoint the following Group B members.

Last Name	First Name	Access User	Affiliation
Almalel	Olivia	Yes	Access Customer
Aroch	Maria	Yes	Southern California Rehabilitation Services - Independent Living Center
Conrad	Michael	Yes	Metro Accessibility Advisory Committee
Goeman	Rachele	Yes	California Council of The Blind Greater Long Beach
Hudson	Kimberly	Yes	Access Customer
Johnson	Jan	Yes	Access Customer
Matthews	Liam	Yes	Southern California Rehabilitation Services - Independent Living Center

IMPACT ON BUDGET

None

BACKGROUND

One of two advisory committees created by the Access Services Board of Directors, the CAC provides community input and advice to the Board and staff concerning operational and policy issues to impact and improve Access' transportation program.

The CAC is comprised of two sets of members, Group A and Group B, which serve two-year terms. Group A members have term expiration dates which occur in even numbered years. Group B members have term expiration dates which occur in odd numbered years. CAC meets monthly and is comprised of Access riders, disability rights advocates and representatives from social service and other non-profit agencies.

DECEMBER 5, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE RESOLUTION TO CONTINUE PUBLIC MEETINGS THROUGH TELECONFERENCING

ISSUE:

Pursuant to state law (Assembly Bill 361), Board approval is required to continue meeting through teleconferencing (virtually). This item was not reviewed or approved by any committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the following resolution - "The Access Board of Directors has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency; and the following circumstances exist: (i) The state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of the members to meet safely in person; and (ii) State or local officials continue to impose or recommend measures to promote social distancing. Hence, teleconferencing for Access Board and committee meetings will continue for the next thirty (30) days."

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

None.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

The Board may opt to revert to in-person meetings, which would be applicable to all Board and committee (including CAC and TPAC) meetings. Board/committee members could elect to attend remotely, however the locations from which they attend would be subject to Brown Act requirements (posting of the address of the remote location along with allowing for public participation from that location). Public participation would also revert to the in-person requirement.

BACKGROUND:

During the pandemic, the Access Board and its committees have been able to meet via teleconference (virtually) due to a State of California executive order that suspended certain Brown Act provisions. While that order has expired, recently

enacted state legislation (AB 361), allows for the continuation of virtual meetings provided that the Board makes the determination as stated in the above recommendation. This determination must be made by the Board every 30 days.

Under current Los Angeles County Department of Health guidelines, masking is recommended indoors regardless of vaccination status in public and office settings when there is more than one (1) person in a room. In addition, social distancing for indoor operations and events is still recommended. These directives provide justification for the above recommendation.

Due to the thirty-day requirement, staff will schedule Special Board Meetings to renew the resolution as appropriate.

DECEMBER 5, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS, PERFORMANCE MONITORING COMMITTEE

FROM: MIKE GREENWOOD, CHIEF OPERATIONS OFFICE

RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AGENCY SAFETY PLAN (PTASP)

ISSUE:

As a recipient of Federal 5307 funding, Access is required to implement a safety plan in accordance with 49 CFR Part 673. While this requirement has been in place since FY20, Access was not a recipient of 5307 funding until FY23. This item was reviewed by the Performance Monitoring Committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve Access' Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan (PTASP), which documents Access' processes and activities related to Safety Management System (SMS) implementation in compliance with federal regulations.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

None.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

None. The Board may elect to not approve the PTASP, but the action is not recommended because such action could potentially subject Access to regulatory oversight by the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) which could potentially include withholding of federal funds for non-compliance with the FTA's Public Transportation Safety Program.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved, staff will be authorized to implement Safety Management Systems (SMS) in support of the PTASP. In support of SMS and the PTASP, contract amendments would be issued to each operating contractor detailing requirements and outlining process changes. Many of the elements of SMS are already in place, but not formalized in a plan.

BACKGROUND:

On July 19, 2019, the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) implemented a requirement that all public transit agencies that receive federal funding create, approve, and implement their own Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan no later than July 20, 2020. The regulation requires that agencies who currently operate more than 100 vehicles during revenue hours have an approved Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan. The plan must be based on Safety Management System (SMS) principals and must name an Accountable Executive who is responsible for carrying out the Safety Management Policy of the agency and ensuring that the plan is effective. The Accountable Executive is also able to take action, as necessary, to address substandard performance in the agency's SMS policy. The Executive Director has been designated as the Accountable Executive.

The regulation also requires that a Chief Safety Officer (CSO) be named on the document. This individual should be adequately trained and have the authority and responsibility for day-to-day implementation and operation of SMS. The CSO must report directly to the Accountable Executive and must be a full-time employee of the transit system. The Chief Operations Officer has been designated as Access' Chief Safety Officer.

The regulation also requires that the agency prioritize areas of primary safety focus in order to ensure improvement in these areas using the principles of SMS. The basic requirement is that each agency track and manage:

- Total number and rate of injuries per total vehicle revenue mile;
- Total number and rate of fatalities per total vehicle revenue mile;
- Total number and rate of safety events per total vehicle revenue mile; and
- Mean distance between major mechanical failures.

SMS is a comprehensive, collaborative approach to managing safety. It brings management and front-line workers together to control risk better, detect and correct safety problems earlier, share and analyze safety data more effectively, and measure safety performance more precisely.

While the FTA does not dictate other performance areas or targets, each agency is required to specify those within its PTASP, identify trends that are occurring within the system, and look for opportunities for improvement. Access will continue to track and manage Preventable Collisions per 100,000 miles and Preventable Incidents per 100,000 miles, as well as modify its current Miles between Road Calls key performance indicator (KPI) to the new, but related KPI - Mean Distance Between Major Mechanical Failures.

Access works with its contractors on the development and implementation of its safety programs and all requirements of the PTASP will flow down, through contract

amendments, to its contractors. The PTASP includes all aspects of Access' current SMS programs which include the 'four pillars" of SMS: Safety Management Policy, Safety Risk Management, Safety Assurance, and Safety Promotion.

Several new elements of the PTASP, not required in 2020, but effective by July 31, 2022, will also be incorporated into Access' Plan. Those include:

- The establishment of strategies to minimize exposure to infectious diseases;
- The establishment of a safety committee that includes front-line employees; and
- The establishment of strategies to reduce assaults on transit workers.

DECEMBER 5, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS
FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION
RE: UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS

ISSUE:

The following items are tentatively scheduled to be addressed by the Board and its committees through February 2023.

January 23, 2023 - Board Committee Meetings

Agenda Items:	Disposition:
Budget Update	Presentation
FY2023/24 Funding Request	Action
Fixed Route Service Area Impacts	Presentation

February 27, 2023 - Board Meeting

Agenda Items:	Disposition:
Committee Items Approval	Action