

access

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
Monday, October 23, 2023
General Session: 12:00 p.m.
Closed Session: Immediately Following

Access Services Headquarters
Council Conference Room, 3rd Floor
3449 Santa Anita Avenue
El Monte CA 91731

Long Beach Transit 1963 E Anaheim St Long Beach, CA 90813	3650 Fairland Boulevard Los Angeles CA 90043
---	---

See *Note below for remote public link.

MISSION STATEMENT

Access Services promotes access to all modes of transportation and provides quality and safe ADA paratransit service on behalf of public transit agencies in Los Angeles County.

	<u>DISPOSITION</u>
1. CALL TO ORDER	ACTION
2. REVIEW & APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE BOARD MEETING ON JUNE 26, 2023 (page 7) [Staff Recommendation: Approve minutes as written.]	ACTION [Vote Required: majority of quorum by roll call]
3. REVIEW & APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE BOARD SPECIAL MEETING ON JULY 24, 2023 (page 18) [Staff Recommendation: Approve minutes as written.]	ACTION [Vote Required:

- | | | |
|----|---|-------------------------------------|
| | | majority of quorum
by roll call] |
| 4. | REPORT FROM EX-OFFICIO BOARD MEMBERS | INFORMATION |
| 5. | GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT | INFORMATION |
| 6. | SUPERIOR SERVICE AWARD | PRESENTATION |
| 7. | CONSENT CALENDAR | ACTION |

Items reviewed and approved by the Planning and Development Committee:

- a) Consideration to Award Appeals Provider Contracts (page 21)
[Authorize staff to execute contracts for Eligibility Appeal Services with the four (4) Appeal Specialists outlined below for a total cost not to exceed \$4,186,368. The period of performance for each contract will be five (5) years.]
- b) Consideration to Approve Renewal of Agency Insurance Policies (page 26)
[Approve the purchase of various Agency insurance policies, including property, earthquake, crime, general liability, auto, executive professional liability, Directors and Officers, employment practices, cyber and workers' compensation insurance for a not-to-exceed amount of \$742,416.]

Item reviewed and approved by the External/Stakeholder Relations Committee:

- c) Consideration to Reappoint Transportation Professionals Advisory Committee (TPAC) Members (page 28)
[Approve the reappointment of the eight (Group A) members as detailed in the item below.]

[Staff Recommendation: Approve the Consent Calendar.]

- | | | |
|----|--|--------|
| 8. | CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM, CHANGE RATES AND INCREASE FUNDS - WEST/CENTRAL REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4031) (page 30) | ACTION |
|----|--|--------|

[Staff Recommendation: Authorize an increase in the contract value of \$70,253,807, a change of rates of compensation and an extension in the period of performance for two (2) years, from October 29, 2024, through October 28, 2026, with California Transit, Inc. (CTI).]

- | | | |
|-----|---|--------------|
| 9. | CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM, CHANGE RATES AND INCREASE FUNDS - NORTHERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4059) (page 34) | ACTION |
| | [Staff Recommendation: Authorize an increase in the contract value of \$34,671,498, a change in rates of compensation, and an extension in the period of performance for one (1) year, from August 1, 2024, through July 31, 2025, for Contract AS-4059 with MV Transportation (MV).] | |
| 10. | CONSIDERATION TO AWARD EASTERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4162) (page 38) | ACTION |
| | [Staff Recommendation Authorize staff to execute Contract No. AS-4162 for specialized ADA paratransit service in the Eastern Region, eligibility transportation service for the Los Angeles Basin, and eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions for a three-month startup period and five (5) year base period beginning January 1, 2024, and ending on March 31, 2029 (with revenue service beginning on April 1, 2024), with San Gabriel Transit, Inc. (SGT) in an amount not to exceed \$311,619,001.] | |
| 11. | CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (CARB) ZERO-EMISSION BUS (ZEB) ROLLOUT PLAN (page 48) | ACTION |
| | [Staff Recommendation: Approve Access' CARB Zero-Emission Bus Rollout Plan.] | |
| 12. | CONSIDERATION TO MODIFY BOARD COMMITTEE STRUCTURE (page 52) | ACTION |
| | [Staff Recommendation: Approve the following - | |
| | 1. Eliminate the Performance Monitoring, Planning and Development, and External/Stakeholders Relations Committees. | |
| | 2. Assign the audit and compensation responsibilities to the Board Operations Committee. | |
| | 3. Schedule Board meetings monthly unless cancelled upon approval of the Board Chair. | |
| 13. | OPERATIONS UPDATE | PRESENTATION |
| 14. | UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS (page 54) | INFORMATION |
| 15. | EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT | INFORMATION |
| 16. | BOARD MEMBER COMMUNICATION | INFORMATION |

- | | | |
|-----|--|-----------------------------------|
| 17. | NEW BUSINESS SUBSEQUENT TO THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA | DISCUSSION/
POSSIBLE
ACTION |
| 18. | PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS | INFORMATION |
| 19. | CLOSED SESSION: | DISCUSSION/
POSSIBLE
ACTION |
| | A) CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL: GOV. CODE §54956.9 <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Anticipated Litigation: Gov. Code §54956.9 (b) <ol style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Significant exposure to litigation pursuant to subdivision (b) of Gov. Code §54956.9 (b) a situation where, based on the advice of counsel considering "existing facts and circumstances," there exists a "significant exposure to litigation". 2. Pending Litigation: Gov. Code §54956.9 (d)(1) <ol style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Litigation, to which Access Services is a party, has been initiated formally. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Aviles, Guillermo v. Access Services, Case # 20STCV3752 | |
| | B) CALIFORNIA GOV. CODE § 54956.8 - REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATIONS - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property: APN: 3126-009-976 Access Negotiator: Andre Colaiace/Hector Rodriguez Negotiating Party: City of Lancaster Under Negotiation: Price and terms | |
| | C) PUBLIC EMPLOYEE APPOINTMENT, EMPLOYMENT CAL. GOV. CODE §54957(b) <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Executive Director 2. General Counsel | |
| 20. | ADJOURNMENT | ACTION |

Access Services does not discriminate on the basis of disability. Accordingly, Access Services seeks to ensure that individuals with disabilities will have an equal opportunity to participate in the range of Access Services events and programs by providing appropriate auxiliary aids and services for communications. Primary consideration is given to the request of individuals with disabilities. However, the final decision belongs to Access Services. To help ensure the availability of any auxiliary aids and services you require, please make every effort to notify Access Services of your request at least three (3) business days (72 hours) prior to the meeting in which you wish to utilize those aids or services. You may do so by contacting (213) 270-6000.

Note: Access Services Board meetings are held pursuant to the Ralph M. Brown Act [Cal. Gov. Code §54950] and are open to the public. The public may view and obtain all written information supporting this agenda provided to the Board both initially and supplementally prior to the meeting at the agency's offices located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue, El Monte, California and on its website at <http://accessla.org>. Documents, including Power Point handouts distributed to the Board members by staff or Board members at the meeting, will simultaneously be made available to the public. Three opportunities are available for the public to address the Board during a Board meeting: (1) before a specific agenda item is debated and voted upon regarding that item, (2) general public comment and (3) before closed session regarding matters to be discussed in closed session. The exercise of the right to address the Board is subject to restriction as to time and appropriate decorum. All persons wishing to make public comment must fill out a goldenrod Public Comment Form and submit it to the Secretary of the Board. Public comment is generally limited to three (3) minutes per speaker and the total time available for public comment may be limited at the discretion of the Chairperson. Persons whose speech is impaired such that they are unable to address the Board at a normal rate of speed may request an accommodation of a limited amount of additional time from the Chair but only by checking the appropriate box on the Public Comment Form. Granting such an accommodation is at the discretion of the Chair. The Board of Directors will not and cannot respond during the meeting to matters raised under general public comment. Pursuant to provisions of the Brown Act governing these proceedings, no discussion or action may be taken on these matters unless they are listed on the agenda, or unless certain emergency or special circumstances exist. However, the Board may direct staff to investigate and/or schedule certain matters for consideration at a future Board of Directors Meeting and the staff may respond to all public comments in writing prior to the next Board meeting.

Alternative accessible formats are available upon request.

*NOTE

The public may also participate via the Zoom webinar link, or by teleconference. Please review the procedures to do so as follows -

How to Provide Public Comment in a Board Meeting via Zoom

Online

1. Click the Zoom link for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at: https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html. Make sure to use a current, up-to-date browser: Chrome 30+, Firefox 27+, Microsoft Edge 12+, or Safari 7+. Certain functionality may be disabled in older browsers including Internet Explorer. You may also use this direct link - <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/81427966594>

2. Enter an email address and your name. Your name will be visible online while you are speaking.
3. When the Board Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, click on "raise hand." Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Mute all other audio before speaking. Using multiple devices can cause audio feedback.
4. Please note that the "Chat" feature is not enabled during the meeting for general public attendees. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, then please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called, please limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

Note: Members of the public will not be shown on video.

By phone

1. Call the Zoom phone number and enter the webinar ID for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at:
https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html
2. You can also call in using the following information -
3. Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):
US: +1 669 444 9171 or +1 669 900 6833 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 719 359 4580
or +1 253 205 0468 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 386 347 5053 or +1 507 473 4847
or +1 564 217 2000 or +1 646 931 3860 or +1 689 278 1000 or +1 929 205 6099
or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 305 224 1968 or +1 309 205 3325 or +1 312 626 6799
or +1 360 209 5623 or 877 853 5247 (Toll Free) or 888 788 0099 (Toll Free) or 833
548 0276 (Toll Free) or 833 548 0282 (Toll Free)
Webinar ID: 814 2796 6594
4. When the Board Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, press *9 to raise a hand. Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Speakers will be called by the last four digits of their phone number. Please note that phone numbers in their entirety will be visible online while speakers are speaking.
5. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, then please submit a written comment as outlined above.
6. When called, please state your name and limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.



STATEMENT OF PROCEEDINGS FOR THE
MEETING OF THE ACCESS SERVICES
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Webinar

June 26, 2023

12:00 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chair Gombert at 12:06 p.m.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT REPRESENTING A QUORUM

Present: Chair Martin Gombert, Treasurer Doran Barnes, Secretary Dolores Nason, Directors Adrian Aguilar, Theresa De Vera, Andrew Del Castillo and Giovanna Gogreve.

BOARD MEMBER(S) EXCUSED FROM THE MEETING

Not Present: None

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT VIRTUALLY

Vice Chair Lee Burner, Director John Troost

2. REVIEW & APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE BOARD MEETING ON APRIL 17, 2023

Recommendation: Approval of minutes as written.

Motion made by Director Nason to approve the minutes, seconded by Director Troost. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

3. REPORT FROM EX-OFFICIO BOARD MEMBERS

CAC Chair Yael Hagen reported that in May they received a presentation by Jason Gonsalves on legislation and the Brown Act. Deputy Executive Director Hector Rodriguez presented the FY 2024 Draft Budget and stated that Access will submit a funding request in May and then in June go to the Board for the final budget approval.

Strategic Planner Eric Haack & Great Blue Research presented the results of the survey which focused on the specific types of transportation Access riders might use to get around the Los Angeles area. At the June CAC meeting they had the Officer Nomination Subcommittee led by ADA Coordinator Rycharde Martindale who asked for volunteers to help with the Officer Nominations that are coming up. Director of Planning and Coordination Matthew Avancena gave an update on the planning of the Goals retreat which will be held virtually on August 8. Chief Operations Officer Mike Greenwood spoke on the updates that were made to the Rider's Guide which included information on online reservations and the Where's My Ride app. Information regarding stand signs and scheduling trips to complicated locations were also updated. Manager of Customer Relations Susanna Cadenas spoke about the complaint response letters and the wording in them. Feedback from the CAC included that the letters need to be made more personable. Manager of Eligibility Karen Gilbert spoke about the tethering program and about the questions asked during the evaluation process. Ms. Cadenas also discussed that they reviewed requirements for local organizations to become coupon vendors as well as selling coupons at the next Abilities Expo. Senior Manager of Operations Rogelio Gomez spoke about their efforts and challenges on excessively long trips. They discussed regulations and how they can reduce long rides. Mr. Avancena stated they finished the script for the videos and will be looking for volunteers soon to start filming.

TPAC Chair Diane Amaya reported that the TPAC met on May 11th, 2023. The committee heard the following items. Executive Director Andre Colaiace stated that they went to Washington DC and met with both the FTA Office of Civil Rights and several legislators. One main thing they wanted to do was to discuss funding for the Antelope Valley Paratransit Operations & Maintenance Facility. Mr. Rodriguez went through the budget update and gave an update on the vehicle replacement situation and the electric vehicle demonstration project. Mr. Haack presented the results of the transportation survey they participated in with the help of Great Blue Research. They used it to determine the overall customer satisfaction with other modes of services such as TNCs, taxis, and fixed route services. Project Administrator Faustino Salvador stated that staff assisted with the pickups and drop-offs at the Abilities Expo in March. Access assisted with the Walk Multiple Sclerosis event on April 16th. They also attended the South Los Angeles Regional Center Accessibility Advisory Committee meeting in April.

4. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Afi Bell made a public comment by stating that she has trouble getting early or late rides to her neighborhood and it makes it difficult to get home. She stated that she recently had a seizure in the car in an Uber and the guy was scared and kicked her out. She asked why Access is not the same in Santa Clarita as in LA.

Lisa Anderson made a public comment by stating that the drivers don't approach her like they should. They never wait the extra five minutes they are supposed to, and she gets a no show. Her disability makes it difficult for her to get picked up and her sight is

getting worse. She needs them to help her more. She filed a complaint on June 8th and hasn't gotten a response and it's been over two weeks.

5. SUPERIOR SERVICE AWARD

Project Administrator Faustino Salvador introduced the Superior Service Award winner Eric Rodriguez.

6. CONSENT CALENDAR

Recommendation: Approval of all items on the Consent Calendar.

CONSENT CALENDAR

- a) Consideration to Extend Term and Increase Funds - On-Board Vehicle Camera Recording System Contract (AS-3906)
- b) Consideration to Award Financial Audit Services Contract (AS-4164)
- c) Consideration to Increase Funds for the Renewal of Commercial Business Package Insurance

Public Comment:

None.

Motion made by Director Nason to approve the Consent Calendar, seconded by Director De Vera. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

7. CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE PROPOSED FY2023/24 BUDGET

Deputy Executive Director Hector Rodriguez presented this item.

Public Comment:

None.

Board Member Comments:

Treasurer Barnes asked if the contract amendments that are referenced in the staff recommendation are authorizing contract changes and also whether this includes the MOU with Metro. Mr. Rodriguez responded that it is both. In particular, contract amendments may occur if the taxi commission issues another round of changes to the fare structure.

Director Nason stated that he did a great job of explaining the budget and she thinks it is a large amount of money but understands why. Mr. Rodriguez explained since the minimum wage has gone up, that this is a huge factor.

Treasurer Barnes asked if the Eastern contract, which is out for bid, takes this into account. Mr. Rodriguez responded they have already anticipated what the cost is going to be since internally they already know what the pricing is. It was already accounted for during the fourth quarter of FY24.

Director Gogreve thanked Access staff for working with Metro team. She wanted to mention that in the Metro budget, they did include an additional 5 million for an unexpected increase in ridership.

Board Discussion:

None.

Motion made by Director Gogreve to approve item, seconded by Vice Chair Burner. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

8. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD ARCHITECTURAL & ENGINEERING SERVICES CONTRACT (AS-4165)

Director of Administration F Scott Jewell presented this item.

Public Comment:

Yael Hagen stated that she is excited to see what is going on in the Antelope Valley. She thinks that having these types of facilities in the long run is an extremely important and smart move. It will be easier to handle in cases of a contractor that would move out, or not perform the level of services needed for riders. Overall, it would allow a lot more ability to do some very effective and efficient work all the way around. She asked the Board to continue down this path, and to continue to advocate for more of these facilities throughout the County.

Lisa Anderson had questions on the facility in Antelope Valley and F Scott Jewell stated someone would reach out to answer them.

Kim Hudson made a public comment in support of the building of this facility. She encourages them to start selling coupons at the facility. It's a big struggle for people to find places to purchase coupons, and so this would be one way to widen the scope in this community. She added that they are working in the CAC to increase locations, but it's a hard sell because a lot of organizations don't want to handle the cash and things like that.

Terri Lantz made a public comment by stating that she would like to offer support to Access on this motion because it will enable Access to control their future costs. She also agreed with Kim Hudson stated concerning the sale of coupons and would like to see Access riders be able to have a more direct way of accessing their coupons.

Board Member Comments:

Director Gogreve asked how often HDR is planning to be onsite in Antelope Valley. F Scott Jewell responded that they have a very aggressive schedule for them to hit the ground running by next month. They are contemplating having the eligibility site as part of this operation. They will revisit this on how they will operate the eligibility services in Antelope Valley also. They have a very detailed schedule that he will be happy to provide after the meeting.

Board Discussion:

Director Nason stated that she thinks they are doing a really good job on the contract solicitations, and review and recommendation process. She thanked them for that.

Treasurer Barnes echoed Director Nason's message and he particularly noted the great work in having robust competition and a strong recommendation.

Motion made by Secretary Nason to approve item, seconded by Vice Chair Burner. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

9. CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE SERVICE AREA MAP POLICY

Director of Administration F Scott Jewell presented this item.

Public Comment:

Kim Hudson made a public comment applauding the Board for this recommendation and for keeping the service area as it stands. Access is a vital key to people's independence and well-being, and it would literally be dangerous to cut people off from their medical care and it would significantly decrease people's ability to live their lives independently. She encourages the Board to maintain its current service area.

Terri Lantz made a public comment by thanking the Access Board for taking a stance in supporting its riders. Access is the only viable accessible transportation that many of these individuals have and to take Access away from riders due to the change in service routes would put these people in jeopardy of isolation and would endanger their health and safety. When Metro started discussing their five-year plan, they raised these concerns at every meeting. There were many community leaders that spoke up and many riders as well. She appreciates everything that Access has done and the Board's

commitment to the riders, but also hopes that Metro remembers that they said it was not their intent to have any riders be without transit.

Yael Hagen made a public comment by stating that she supports this motion along with the other speakers. This has been a topic of discussion at their CAC meetings and the other meetings. It has a very small impact on the budget, but it's a huge impact on ridership because it's not only people who live in those areas. Porter Ranch would be as an entire community that would be isolated, but also parts of Northridge, Chatsworth, Granada Hills, Glendale, to name a few. She thanked everybody who supported this, and the ability to maintain the service area.

Board Member Comments:

Treasurer Barnes asked if the budget that was just approved anticipated that the funding was available for this motion to pass. Mr. Jewell responded yes.

Secretary Nason stated that the grandfathering in of the service area map is mandated by federal law. Mr. Jewell responded they are not but they are still meeting the minimum requirements of federal law.

Chair Gombert would like to thank staff for working through this issue. It has been discussed for over a year and there are a lot of comments from the CAC and the riders. He thanked everyone for listening and incorporating those comments with the staff recommendation.

Board Discussion:

Director Gogreve stated that they lucked out with the grant, and she is hoping that they can try to seek out other types of funding in the future to try to address this issue because funding will be limited in the future. Mr. Colaiace stated there might be grants at a federal level that would be able to help them too.

Treasurer Barnes stated that this places them in the position of providing services that go beyond the minimum requirements of the ADA by including the areas that are beyond three quarters of mile. He hopes they don't have to revisit this, and he hopes to continue it, but he just wants to make sure they keep an eye on this since there could be financial challenges.

Director Gogreve stated that she agrees, and they should look at this in the future to make sure that future fiscal issues are addressed.

Director Burner asked if the if Route 240, that supported that area, is no longer there. Did someone take it over or is it just not there anymore? Mr. Jewell responded that the 240 dropped down from Rinaldi down to below Devonshire, so it dropped the whole three-quarter mile boundary all the way down to that area. Director Burner stated that

they certainly need to note that as well. Paratransit certainly can't pick up all the services, but they do need fixed route service in that area as well.

Motion made by Director Troost to approve the item, seconded by Secretary Nason. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

10. 2023 TRAVEL MODE CUSTOMER SURVEY

Strategic Planner Eric Haack presented this item.

Public Comment:

Mel Bailey made a public comment by asking if someone has an emergency or for medical appointments if they have considered allowing riders to have a direct ride to the medical appointments only. This is something that could be important to discuss.

Lisa Anderson made a public comment by stating that she has not had travel training since she moved, and nobody has asked her about the survey. Her suggestion is for Access to give priority to people who have doctor's appointments or dialysis.

Yael Hagen made a public comment by stating that she didn't do the survey because nobody asked her to participate, but she does have some concerns. She would have liked to see more open-ended questions. This survey was done during Covid when the rides were mostly for Covid related things. She would have liked to know why people didn't use some of the modes of transportation beyond what the multiple-choice questions or the close ended question answers would've been. Paratransit is part of public transportation in many ways and so the use of automobiles is kind of irrelevant and not fair in this kind of system.

Board Comments:

Director Gogreve made a comment by stating that her first question is what they were going to do with the survey results. Second, is if they are doing enough to provide dial-a-ride services. They should work with the dial-a-ride partners to make sure that that was another option and that was a viable option. She asked if they were doing enough to promote and highlight services like Metro Micro and Dial a Ride. Mr. Colaiace responded that they provide mobility management and provide information to people about dial-a-rides and other options. They can look at the survey information and realize where they need to improve. This is how staff decided to start using TNCs.

Treasurer Barnes stated that looking at the data clearly illustrates they have opportunities. They do need to be aware that those opportunities are complex. There is a heightened opportunity to partner with those local services. If they start encouraging riders to use those other services and they get a spike, that could have a budget impact that those services may or may not be prepared to handle. An example

of this is Monrovia program that partnered with TNCs to provide local mobility services that was such a successful program that it completely blew their budget out.

Director DeVera stated that she is only riding Access because the Metro Micro pick up and drop off is not feasible for her. It is too difficult because of a hill. Metro Micro also needs some understanding of different levels of disability and who they are picking up, because she is paying \$2.75 to go down the hill, because Metro Micro can't pick her up closer to her house where it is level. Mr. Colaiace stated that they have had a lot of dialogue with Metro Micro.

Director Gogreve stated that this survey provides a lot of valuable information they could use moving forward. She would like to see it in their strategic plan as they continue to talk about this as Board members and as representatives of all the member agencies.

Chair Gombert stated this information helped engage TNCs for transportation services. He was surprised at the low amount of dial-a-ride usage and if you talk to most of the dial-a-ride providers that provide senior and disabled service with few exceptions, they're at most 50 to 60% of pre-COVID use. There is extra room for these local dial-a-ride services for people making local trips.

This was an informational item only.

11. OPERATIONS UPDATE

Chief Operations Officer Mike Greenwood presented this item.

Public Comment:

Mel Bailey made a public comment by stating that he is glad TNCs are now being used. He would like them to be better at making a call out to the rider they are picking up. Concerning the complaint ratio that was presented, they should investigate it more because he finds the number to be very low.

Lisa Anderson asked how she could apply to the pilot program. Mr. Jewell responded that someone would reach out to her after the meeting.

Yael Hagen made a public comment by congratulating the staff for working diligently on this and she recognizes that it's definitely not for everyone, but it will ultimately help everyone and that really is the goal.

Board Comments:

Treasurer Barnes thanked everyone. In hearing the update, it's a little bit like fare-capping where they are starting this new thing that is intended to make the program

better. I expect we're going to see a few bumps in the road as we go. They will have to get through that learning experience, and they are going to have to do that together. Mr. Greenwood stated that New Jersey Transit is going through those issues now and sharing their experience with him, so he is hoping to avoid those same issues.

Secretary Nason was surprised that there are no cameras that protect the rider. It protects the agency, helps prevent lawsuits. Mr. Greenwood responded that it was one of the first things that concerned him when they started talking about this program, but Uber and Lyft do not have cameras on their vehicles. That's the choice of their business model. Director Nason asked if they would install them eventually and Mr. Greenwood responded they would not.

Director Gogreve asked what the NTD requirement was. Mr. Greenwood stated the reporting requirement from the Feds is one they are going to have to pay close attention to. Director Gogreve asked if they would know the reason, they opt-in and opt-out, in the form. Mr. Greenwood responded that the form does ask some questions including why they are opting out, but they don't have to disclose that information. Director Gogreve asked if they have a plan moving forward to what happens with no-shows and if there's a certain number that they can have. Mr. Greenwood responded that they won't have that same sort of information coming from Uber or Lyft. The contractor is finalizing their operational plans for the no-show policy.

12.UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS

Director of Administration, F Scott Jewell presented this item.

Public Comment:

Yael Hagen stated that for a future agenda item, they should talk about increasing the quarter of a mile to a mile and a half. This is in the ADA regulations, and she asks the Board to please consider that as a future item.

Board Comments:

None.

13.EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Executive Director Andre Colaiace stated that they recently met with the Metro's internal Olympic committee to fund a facility project that will eventually benefit the agency in the long run. He stated that Andrew Del Castillo will be leaving the Board and he is sorry to see him go but wishes him luck.

Public Comment:

None.

Board Comments:

None.

14. BOARD MEMBER COMMUNICATION

Director De Vera stated that she wanted to thank all the Access staff, Board members, providers, who came out to support her when her dad passed. It shows that Access is truly a family and he loved riding Access. She is a long-time rider and he knew she was always safe with Access.

Director Del Castillo thanked all staff and fellow Board members for keeping them all well informed and diligently working to implement the Board's direction and the daily operations of Access for the riders. He appreciates their support in helping him and being very responsive to all of my various inquiries throughout his service. Finally, he wanted to mention that it has been very educational and an honor to serve on the Board.

Director Troost thanked Andre Colaiace, Hector Rodriguez, Giovanna Gogreve and the rest of his staff for their great job on the budget.

Secretary Nason wanted to remind everyone that Disabled Resources Center is having their annual awards event on July 27th. They sent out invitations, but if anybody would like one, to contact her. She added that she was proud of Access' staff and the things they presented today.

Director Gogreve congratulated Eric Rodriguez from MV on a great job that he's doing and to keep up the good work. She also congratulated Andrew Del Castillo and wished him the best of luck in all his future endeavors.

Treasurer Barnes stated that he will soon have his 20th year of service in this organization. He wanted to point that out because having seen the organization over almost the last two decades, the evolution, the growth, the spirit of innovation, and the focus on quality, that's a day in and day out endeavor. The entire team, and the providers, make it all happen. As they hear about the programs and the efforts, this is all about moving the program forward, improving quality, serving the community better.

CAC Chair Hagen made a comment by stating that she thinks more work does need to be done in letting people know the reality of what other systems are out there. One of the things that is happening with micro transit is accessibility issues. It's not a curb-to-curb service. This presents the same barrier to accessibility that makes somebody

eligible for Access Services. Dial-a-rides have their own issues, but even TNCs are great for emergencies or for same-day spontaneous rides, but it's not sustainable. You can't go to work five days a week and have two trips a day on TNC, that's not sustainable financially, for most people.

TPAC Chair Amaya thanked everyone and wanted to congratulate Access' staff for their hard work. She congratulated Eric Rodriguez for his award for outstanding customer service and for proving to be an asset to MV. She also wanted to congratulate staff for achieving a very important milestone progress on the contract award for the A&E services for the new operations and maintenance facility in Antelope Valley.

Chair Gombert stated that he echoed all the other comments that were made by the Board members. Another comment is that he attended both the regional connector opening the previous Friday and also the Friday before that for the opening of the Torrance Transit Center. Congratulations to both the Metro and Torrance teams. Great efforts, great presentations of both events.

15. NEW BUSINESS SUBSEQUENT TO THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

No new business was heard subsequent to the posting of the agenda.

16. PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS

Mel Bailey made a public comment by stating that he didn't get a chance to look at the agenda. He wanted to comment on the TNC and the survey, but he forgot to mention it earlier. He will make his comments at another time.

17. CLOSED SESSION REPORT

No action was taken.

18. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:14 p.m.

Approved

Dolores Nason, Secretary

Date



STATEMENT OF PROCEEDINGS FOR THE
MEETING OF THE ACCESS SERVICES
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Webinar

July 24, 2023

11:00 a.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chair Gombert at 11:02 a.m.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT REPRESENTING A QUORUM

Present: Chair Martin Gombert, Treasurer Doran Barnes, Secretary Dolores Nason, Directors Theresa De Vera, Valerie Gibson and Giovanna Gogreve.

BOARD MEMBER(S) EXCUSED FROM THE MEETING

Not Present: None

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT VIRTUALLY

Vice Chair Lee Burner, Director John Troost

2. BOARD OFFICER ELECTIONS

Legal Counsel Vincent Ewing presented this item.

Public Comment:

None.

Board Member Comments:

None.

Board Discussion:

None.

Motion made by Director Troost to approve item, seconded by Director Gogreve. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

3. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

None

4. CONSENT CALENDAR

a. Consideration to Approve Board and Standing Meeting Calendar Change

Public Comment:

Yael Hagen commented that she would further comment on this in the future. She also added that there was value in discussing items in a smaller group and that the ridership relies on the Board to have a thoughtful conversation on these items.

Item pulled for discussion by Vice Chair Barnes.

Board Member Comments:

Vice Chair Barnes opined that during the pandemic, the process of having alternate Board and Board committee meetings each month worked well but now with the return of in person requirements, he felt that it has been difficult to hear items from other committees. These items should be equally heard by the Board and other reports and presentations should also be heard in the future.

Director Nason stated that she agreed with Vice Chair Barnes comments.

Director Gogreve agreed with the previous comments and asked if it was necessary to have meetings every month. Executive Director Andre Colaiace stated that in that case staff would consult with the Board Chair to possibly cancel a meeting.

Executive Director Colaiace suggested that we bring this idea back for discussion and action for the September/October Board cycle.

Treasurer Burner suggested that this idea be discussed during closed session.

Director Gogreve stated she values hearing the other Directors' perspective on items collectively.

Director Gibson felt that she felt closed off from the other committees and by moving to only full Board meetings a number of concerns will be addressed.

Board Discussion:

Chair De Vera commented that hearing items twice in a cycle was repetitive and that the Board would be more effective as a group of nine rather than three.

Motion made by Vice Chair Barnes to approve the item with the addition of bringing back the Board governance issue in the next Board cycle, seconded by Director Gombert. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

5. NEW BUSINESS SUBSEQUENT TO THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

No new business was heard subsequent to the posting of the agenda.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS

There was no public comment.

7. CLOSED SESSION:

No action was taken.

8. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Director Gombert, seconded by Vice Chair Barnes to adjourn.

The meeting adjourned at 11:40 a.m.

Approved

Dolores Nason, Secretary

Date

OCTOBER 16, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: KAREN GILBERT, MANAGER OF ELIGIBILITY
BRIAN SELWYN, MANGER OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT
ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD APPEALS PROVIDER CONTRACTS

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to exercise the award of four (4) individual contracts for Eligibility Appeal Specialists. This item was reviewed and approved by the Planning and Development Committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute contracts for Eligibility Appeal Services with the four (4) Appeal Specialists outlined below for a total cost not to exceed \$4,186,368. The period of performance for each contract will be five (5) years.

Contract No.	Contractor	Type of Appeals	Contract Amounts Not to Exceed	Contract Start Date
AS-4101-1	Alfred L. Glover, DPM	Medical	\$271,916	May 1, 2024
AS-4101-2	Medical Management Mission (MMM)	Medical	\$2,429,848	Feb 1, 2024
AS-4101-3	Lori Petrie, Ph.D. Center, Inc.	Mental Health	\$820,646	Sept. 1, 2024
AS-4101-4	Abraham Ishaaya, MD (dba Olympic Medical Evaluations)	Medical	\$663,958	Feb 1, 2024

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The funds being requested have been programmed for the current budget year and will be appropriately budgeted for the subsequent out-years. The funding for these services comes from Prop C Discretionary Funds. Further details are contained in the background section below.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

Access is mandated by the ADA to provide eligibility appeal services. Whereas some transit agencies utilize an appeals panel (usually comprised of agency staff and consumer advocates) to make appeal decisions, Access has traditionally used independent contractors in a variety of professional fields in relation to mental, physical and other disabilities. This avoids any issues with lack of expertise and/or conflict of interest. Appeals are usually made when an applicant has been denied eligibility which is a very small percentage of all applications.

With the procurement of this service and the award of contracts to four firms, the agency will be able to meet the anticipated demand for this service over the next several years. The agency also has one other appeal specialist currently under contract and has recently re-released an open solicitation to attract other specialists who may be interested in providing this service on behalf of Access.

BACKGROUND:

Request for Quotations (RFQ) No. AS-4168 was issued on May 25, 2023, and four (4) Eligibility Appeal Specialists responded thereto. Given the potential for occasional spikes in the demand for requests for initial eligibility assessments, staff believes that it is prudent to be able to look outside our current eligibility contractor for additional vendors who might meet temporary or emergency needs. As a result, proposers have all agreed to provide this service where possible, albeit on a limited basis, when called upon to do so.

All proposals submitted were deemed responsive and the proposers responsible and fully capable of undertaking the work outlined in the subject RFQ and staff is recommending award accordingly. Each of the respondents is an incumbent Eligibility Appeal Specialist for Access Services and a summary of their qualifications and experience is as follows:

Dr. Alfred L. Glover is a partner in the Diabetic Foot Center in Inglewood, a practice he joined in 2002. He has nearly thirty-five years of experience in the practice of podiatric medicine and holds affiliations with, among other facilities, the VA Hospital (Westwood), Orthopedic Hospital, and the US Naval Hospital (Camp Pendleton). Of relevance to the work to be undertaken as an eligibility appeals specialist, he has a great deal of experience working with service members, establishing their fitness for

active duty and individuals with diabetes. He has also created a professional team consisting of a physical therapist, psychotherapist and medical doctor who are available to augment the work he will perform in reviewing eligibility appeals. Dr. Glover's location in Inglewood will provide a needed geographical balance for those who file appeals in this area.

Medical Management Mission (MMM) is one of the more recent eligibility appeals contractors, having begun working with Access in 2015. Given MMM's interest in providing initial evaluations on an as-needed basis, as well as continuing to serve as an eligibility appeals specialist, the company was very interested in submitting a proposal in response to the new RFQ. At this time, MMM is the only medical firm performing appeals services on behalf of Access in the San Fernando Valley. (It also performs appeals evaluations at its office in West Hollywood.) All of its appeal specialists are physicians who have been in practice for at least twenty years. Their areas of specialization range from internal medicine and nephrology to pain management and oncology. Staff is very pleased with the practice's performance.

Dr. Lori Petrie is a licensed clinical psychologist in private practice in West Los Angeles with more than twenty years of experience working with Access eligibility appellants and over thirty years in the field of psychology. Among her professional roles, Dr. Petrie has worked with clients of all ages in a variety of clinical settings and has served as Associate Professor in the Department of Psychiatry at Harbor-UCLA Medical Center. Her performance has been consistent with the expectations, requirements, and terms of the four contracts which she has had with Access.

Abraham Ishaaya, MD acquired Olympic Medical Evaluations (OME) in August 2018 and, per Board approval at its September 24, 2018, meeting, has served as an Access contractor under the latter name since October 1, 2018. As a result of this acquisition, the two practices have, in effect, merged services, giving the new entity an enhanced ability to serve the needs of current and future clinic patients and Access evaluation appeals clients alike. Dr. Ishaaya runs an established medical evaluation clinic, recognized for its ability to complete and process medical evaluations related to identification of impairments and their respective functional capacity. OME has been working with Access for over two decades.

The contract costs are based on the rates for the evaluations, as well as the cost of no-shows and cancellations. As stated above, all proposers have agreed to provide initial evaluations on an as-needed basis. The cost for this service is equivalent to the cost of the appeal evaluation for the applicable year in which the service is performed.

For each of the proposed new contracts, increases in these rates from the first year of the current contract to the final year of the new contract average no more than 4.7% per year. While the most recent annual change in the CPI for the Los Angeles Area (March-May 2023 vs. March-May 2022) was 3.6%, the significant fluctuations in the CPI

over the past few years - at times approaching a double-digit increase - and increases in the costs of labor, rent and medical equipment, the proposed rates are still deemed fair and reasonable.

Access Services projects that a total of 8,139 appeal evaluations may be completed by these contractors between February 1, 2024, and July 31, 2029.

PROJECTED APPEALS BY CONTRACTOR:

FY 2024-2029

Name of Specialist	# of Appeal Evaluations: 2024 - 2029	Totals
Alfred L. Glover, DPM (Medical)	914	\$271,916
MMM (Medical)	4,283	\$2,429,848
Dr. Lori Petrie (Psychology)	1,450	\$820,646
Abraham Ishaaya, MD (Medical)	1,492	\$663,958
TOTAL	8,139	\$4,186,368

**2024-2029 projections are based on pre-pandemic numbers from year 2019.*

The specific rates of compensation proposed for each of the appeal specialists for the five-year contract period are presented in Table A below.

The following is a breakdown of eligible riders by service area -

Service Area	Total	% of Total
Antelope Valley	4,750	4%
Eastern	33,324	30%
Northern	14,917	14%
Santa Clarita	936	1%
Southern	34,102	31%
West Central	19,407	18%
Out of Service Area	1,902	2%
Total	109,338	100%

**TABLE A:
PROPOSED RATES FOR CONTRACT YEARS 1-5**

Contractor Rates:	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
Alfred L. Glover, DPM (AS 4168-1)					
Eligibility Appeal Evaluation	\$274.00	\$284.00	\$294.00	\$304.00	\$314.00
Initial Eligibility Evaluation	\$274.00	\$284.00	\$294.00	\$304.00	\$314.00
No Show / Cancellation	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00
MMM (AS-4168-2)					
Eligibility Appeal Evaluation	\$516.48	\$542.30	\$561.82	\$582.05	\$603.00
Initial Eligibility Evaluation	\$516.48	\$542.30	\$561.82	\$582.05	\$603.00
No Show / Cancellation	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00
Lori Petrie (AS-4168-3)					
Eligibility Appeal Evaluation	\$518.00	\$536.85	\$555.97	\$575.98	\$596.72
Initial Eligibility Evaluation	\$518.00	\$536.85	\$555.97	\$575.98	\$596.72
No Show / Cancellation	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$100.00
Abraham Ishaaya, MD (AS 4168-4)					
Eligibility Appeal Evaluation	\$422.13	\$430.98	\$440.28	\$450.04	\$460.29
Initial Eligibility Evaluation	\$422.13	\$430.98	\$440.28	\$450.04	\$460.29
No Show / Cancellation	\$42.20	\$44.30	\$46.50	\$48.33	\$51.27

OCTOBER 16, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: HECTOR RODRIGUEZ, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE RENEWAL OF AGENCY INSURANCE POLICIES

ISSUE:

Board approval is requested to purchase various Agency insurance policies for the policy year beginning November 1, 2023. This item was reviewed and approved by the Planning and Development Committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the purchase of various Agency insurance policies, including property, earthquake, crime, general liability, auto, executive professional liability, Directors and Officers, employment practices, cyber and workers' compensation insurance for a not-to-exceed amount of \$742,416.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The approved budget for Fiscal Year 2023/24 includes the cost of these policies. The funding for these policies comes from Prop C 40% Discretionary funds. The cost of the policies for the current year is \$618,680. Staff expects increases in several policies, such as auto, cyber security and Workers Compensation.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

No alternatives were considered. In order to protect the agency from liability, it is necessary to purchase these policies on an annual basis.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, the staff would be authorized, but not required, to purchase the above policies at terms no less favorable to Access than those proposed above.

BACKGROUND:

SullivanCurtisMonroe (SCM), Access' insurance broker, is in the process of soliciting quotes for the various insurance policies. Upon Committee approval, staff will authorize SCM to purchase the policies with an effective date of no later than November 1, 2023, and November 30, 2023, for the Workers' Compensation policy.

OCTOBER 16, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: MATTHEW AVANCENA, DIRECTOR, PLANNING AND COORDINATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO REAPPOINT TRANSPORTATION PROFESSIONALS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (TPAC) MEMBERS

ISSUE:

Eight Transportation Professionals Advisory Committee (TPAC) members have terms that will expire on October 28, 2023. The reappointments recommended below are for two-year terms beginning October 2023. These terms will expire in October 2025. This item was reviewed and approved by the External/Stakeholder Relations Committee.

RECOMMENDATION

Approve the reappointment of the following eight (Group A) members.

- Silva Baghdanian, Glendale Beeline
- Rhoda Tong, East L.A. Regional Center
- Gracie Davis, Orange County Transportation Authority
- Fayma Ishaq, Metro
- LaShawn King Gillespie, Foothill Transit
- Diane Amaya, Beach Cities Transit
- James Lee, Torrance Transit
- Janna Smith, L.A. Department of Transportation

IMPACT ON BUDGET

None

BACKGROUND

TPAC was created in September 2001 by the Access Services Board of Directors to provide input regarding operational and policy issues. TPAC is comprised of two sets of members, Group A and Group B, which serve two-year terms. Group A members have term expiration dates which occur on odd numbered years. Group B members have term expiration dates which occur on even numbered years. TPAC meets bi-

monthly and is comprised of representatives from social service, community transportation and fixed-route transportation providers.

OCTOBER 16, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: BRUCE FRINK, SENIOR MANAGER OF FINANCE
VICENTE PENA, PROJECT ADMINISTRATOR
BRIAN SELWYN, MANAGER OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM, CHANGE RATES AND INCREASE FUNDS - WEST/CENTRAL REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4031)

ISSUE:

Board action is required to exercise the final option years for the West/Central region service provider contract. This item was reviewed and approved by the Performance Monitoring Committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize an increase in the contract value of \$70,253,807, a change of rates of compensation and an extension in the period of performance for two (2) years, from October 29, 2024, through October 28, 2026, with California Transit, Inc. (CTI).

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

This action is consistent with the budget estimates for the proposed contract’s two one-(1) year extensions.

Trip volume for ADA paratransit service is based on the projected number of trips calculated by Access’ former consultant, HDR Engineering Inc.

	Projected Trips
Year 8 (10/29/24-10/28/25)	639,700
Year 9 (10/29/25-10/28/26)	693,698

Payment terms of the contract will be a firm fixed monthly fee and a variable fixed rate per trip for ADA service. The proposed increase in the rates for ADA service for the two option years is based on three primary factors: the most recent three-month average

of the year-over-year increase in the Consumer Price Index for the Los Angeles Area at the time rates were negotiated (3.6%); the fact that the volume of trips decreased by at least 20% from the trip volume originally projected, which, per the subject contract, permits negotiation of the rate previously approved by the Board; and, finally, a significant increase in the monthly facility lease cost, which began in Year 6 of the contract.

Based on the above-stated factors, Access has negotiated an annual increase in the per trip rate of 4.87% in both Years 8 and 9 of the contract and an annual increase in the fixed monthly rate - which includes the aforementioned facility lease cost of 12.9% in Year 8 and 4.26% in Year 9. (The increase in the monthly fixed rate, excluding the facility lease, would be 4.58% in Year 8 and 4.60% in Year 9.) Finally, matching the most recent three-month average annual increase in the CPI, staff proposes an annual increase for both the Emergency Services Hourly Rate and the Braille Starter Hourly Salary of 3.6% in both Year 8 and Year 9 of the contract.

The following chart provides more detail on the proposed rate increases:

	Year 7 (10/29/23- 10/28/24)	Year 8 (10/29/24- 10/28/25)	Year 9 (10/29/25- 10/28/26)
ADA Service - Fixed (monthly)	\$582,436.41	\$657,571.00	\$685,584.00
ADA Service - Variable (per trip)	\$37.76	\$39.60	\$41.53
Emergency Services Hourly Rate	\$54.71	\$56.68	\$58.72
<i>Braille Starter Hourly Salary (Inc. in Fixed Rate)</i>	<i>\$19.71</i>	<i>\$20.41</i>	<i>\$21.15</i>

Based on the proposed rates of compensation and trip projections, the fully loaded cost per trip for ADA service in Years 8 and 9 of the subject contract will be \$51.93 and \$53.38, respectively, with no adjustment for Covid related rate increases. Factoring in the following: 1) 10% negotiated rate adjustment for trip volume falling below 80% of the trip volume projected in the RFP; 2) wage increase for hourly staff; 3) Covid cleaning procedures and 4) taxi rate adjustment, the projected fully loaded cost per trip for ADA service in Years 8 and 9 will be \$60.48 and \$62.43, respectively.

This action will result in an increase in the previously approved contract amount of \$206,629,803 to \$276,883,610. This is inclusive of an additional \$70,253,807 in funding to cover the projected increase in trips for FY25, FY26, and the first four months of FY27. The increase in the contract amount will be programmed into the FY25 budget and will be appropriately programmed for subsequent out-years.

The funding for these services comes from a combination of Measure M, Federal Section 5307, and Prop C Discretionary Funds.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

The Board, at its discretion, may direct staff to issue an RFP for services in the West/Central Region. As the contractor has generally met its performance targets, staff does not recommend this option as pricing is likely to increase significantly.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, staff will be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into an amendment of the existing contract with CTI, under terms that are no less favorable to Access Services than those proposed herein. Access Services would not be legally bound to this contract unless it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

The West/Central region service contract, AS-4031, was awarded to CTI on May 15, 2017. The base term of the contract ran through October 28, 2022, and the contract allows for four (4) additional option years. Option years six (6) and seven (7) were exercised on December 14, 2021. This proposed action involves the exercise of the eighth and ninth (final) option years.

California Transit Inc. (CTI) has served the West Central service area since 2007. Early in FY23, CTI had difficulties hiring vehicle operators because of a tight labor market, which resulted in a slight decline in On Time Performance. However, CTI was able to overcome the hiring challenges by increasing wages and enhancing its recruiting and hiring practices. CTI creatively restructured its hiring and retention bonus and explored less traditional recruiting sources.

Current Operational Performance

Despite the earlier challenges, CTI met 8 out of 10 Key Performance Indicators in FY23 and has started FY 24 with strong numbers.

The contractor's performance results for FY23 and FY24 are listed below.

Key Performance Indicator	Standard	FY23	FY24 YTD*
On Time Performance	≥ 91%	89.3%	91.7%
Excessively Late Trips	≤ 0.10%	0.06%	0.01%
Denials	0	0	0
Access to Work On Time Performance	≥ 94%	96.0%	98.8%
Average Hold Time (Reservations)	≤ 120	35	38
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (Reservations)	≤ 5%	1.5%	2.2%
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (ETA)	≤ 10%	0.6%	0.3%
Complaints Per 1,000 Trips	≤ 4.0	3.1	2.9
Preventable Collisions per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.75	0.83	0.80
Miles Between Road Calls	≥ 25,000	28,740	41,642

*Preliminary data through August 2023

Ridership recovery is reflected in the following table -

Region	Jul-19	Jul-23	% Recovery
Southern	100,452	89,529	89.10%
Eastern	90,498	78,896	87.20%
West/Central	47,239	43,871	92.90%
Northern	54,332	36,900	67.90%
Antelope Valley	13,310	11,620	87.30%
Santa Clarita	3,710	2,590	69.80%
Systemwide	309,541	263,456	85.20%

OCTOBER 16, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: BRUCE FRINK, SENIOR MANAGER, FINANCIAL PLANNING & ANALYSIS
 JESSICA VOLANOS, PROJECT ADMINISTRATOR
 BRIAN SELWYN, MANAGER OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM, CHANGE RATES AND INCREASE FUNDS - NORTHERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4059)

ISSUE:

Board action is required to exercise the second option year for the Northern region service provider contract. This item was reviewed and approved by the Performance Monitoring Committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize an increase in the contract value of \$34,671,498, a change in rates of compensation, and an extension in the period of performance for one (1) year, from August 1, 2024, through July 31, 2025, for Contract AS-4059 with MV Transportation (MV).

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

This action is consistent with the budget estimates for the proposed contract’s one (1) year extension.

Trip volume for ADA paratransit service is based on the projected number of trips calculated by Access’ consultant HDR Engineering Inc.

	Trips
Year 7 (8/1/24-7/31/25)	472,267

Payment terms of the contract are a firm fixed monthly fee (Fixed) and a fixed rate per trip (Variable) for ADA service (please see table below). In addition, as delineated in the same table, the Contractor is compensated for two other services on an as-needed basis. As stipulated in the subject contract, the proposed increases in the rates of

compensation for the option year should not exceed the most recent three-month average of the year-over-year increase in the Consumer Price Index for the Los Angeles Area at the time rates were negotiated. (For the three most recent months for which data is published (March-May 2023), the average year-over-year increase in the CPI was 3.6% (*US Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics*)). In addition, per the contract, the fact that the volume of trips decreased by at least 20% from the originally projected trip volume allows the rate, previously approved by the Board, to be negotiated.

The current and proposed rates are as follows:

	Current: Year 6 (8/23-7/24)	Proposed: Year 7 (8/24-7/25)
ADA Service - Fixed (monthly)	\$921,678.71	\$954,859.14
ADA Service - Variable (per trip)	\$43.12	\$44.67
As Needed Service - Variable (per hour)	\$51.66	\$53.52
Ripple Text Notification - Fixed (monthly, as requested by Access)	\$649.20	\$672.57

Based on the proposed rates of compensation and trip projections, the fully loaded cost per trip for ADA service in Year 7 of the subject contract will be \$68.95, with no adjustment for COVID-19 related rate increases. Factoring in the following: 1) 10% negotiated rate adjustment for trip volume below 80% of the trip volume projected in the RFP; 2) wage increase for hourly staff; 3) COVID-19 cleaning procedures and 4) taxi rate adjustment, the projected fully loaded cost per trip for ADA service in Year 7 will be \$83.72.

This action will result in an increase of \$34,671,498 to the previously approved contract amount of \$185,989,905.

The funding for these services comes from a combination of Federal Section 5307, Measure M, and Prop C Discretionary Funds.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

The Board, at its discretion, may direct staff to issue a request for proposals (RFP) for services in the Northern Region. As the contractor has generally met performance targets during its base contract term, staff does not recommend this option as pricing is likely to increase significantly through an open competitive process.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved, contingent on subsequent approval of the full Access Board, staff will be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into an amendment of the existing contract with MV Transportation, under terms that are no less favorable to Access Services than those proposed herein. Access Services would not be legally bound to this contract unless it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

The Northern Region service contract, AS-4059, commenced on May 1, 2018, with full service beginning on August 1, 2018. The base term of the contract runs through July 31, 2023, and the contract allows for four (4) additional option years. Staff is seeking approval for the second option year. At the direction of the Board, staff has prepared a Board report one year in advance of the contract's expiration to allow the Board and staff sufficient time to explore other avenues should the Board choose not to exercise the option year.

Current Operational Performance

MV Transportation has served our Northern region customers for over 20 years and has been a dedicated partner to Access and the community. At the beginning of FY23, MV brought on General Manager Shawn Brophy, who continues to work to improve operational performance by increasing driver resources through MV's corporate recruiter and expanding MV's subcontract resources. One of those subcontractors is SilverRide, a transportation network company (TNC), that now has more than 75 drivers performing Access trips.

In conjunction with the FY23 budget, MV raised employee driver wages and currently has the highest starting driver wages (\$22.00 per hour) of any Access service contractor. MV is now fully staffed with drivers and has shown considerable progress in performance in FY23 and so far in FY24. The company is meeting all 13 KPIs as of the end of August 2023.

The contractor's performance results for FY23 and FY24 are listed below.

Key Performance Indicator	Standard	FY23	FY24*
On-Time Performance	≥ 91%	90.5%	93.5%
Excessively Late Trips	≤ 0.10%	0.10%	0.05%
Excessively Long Trips	≤ 5%	5.1%	3.6%
Missed Trips	≤ 0.75%	0.69%	0.57%
Denials	0	1	0
Access to Work On-Time Performance	≥ 94%	95.4%	98.6%
Average Initial Hold Time (Reservations)	≤ 120 seconds	83	113
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (Reservations)	≤ 5%	3.6%	5.2%
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (ETA)	≤ 10%	2.4%	9.6%
Complaints Per 1,000 Trips	≤ 4.0	3.6	2.7
Preventable Incidents per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.25	0.08	0.25
Preventable Collisions per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.75	0.55	0.91
Miles Between Road Calls	≥ 25,000	56,027	55,064

*Preliminary data through August 2023

Ridership recovery is reflected in the following table -

Region	Jul-19	Jul-23	% Recovery
Southern	100,452	89,529	89.10%
Eastern	90,498	78,896	87.20%
West/Central	47,239	43,871	92.90%
Northern	54,332	36,900	67.90%
Antelope Valley	13,310	11,620	87.30%
Santa Clarita	3,710	2,590	69.80%
Systemwide	309,541	263,456	85.20%

OCTOBER 16, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: ROGELIO GOMEZ, SENIOR MANAGER OF OPERATIONS
BRUCE FRINK, SENIOR MANAGER, FINANCE PLANNING & ANALYSIS
DAVID CHIA, PROCUREMENT & CONTRACT ADMINISTRATOR

RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD EASTERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER
CONTRACT (AS-4162)

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to execute a contract for specialized ADA paratransit service in the Eastern Region, eligibility transportation service for Access' four service regions in the Los Angeles Basin, and eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions. This item was reviewed and approved by the Planning and Development Committee.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute Contract No. AS-4162 for specialized ADA paratransit service in the Eastern Region, eligibility transportation service for the Los Angeles Basin, and eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions for a three-month startup period and five (5) year base period beginning January 1, 2024, and ending on March 31, 2029 (with revenue service beginning on April 1, 2024), with San Gabriel Transit, Inc. (SGT) in an amount not to exceed \$311,619,001.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

This action is consistent with the budget estimates for the proposed contract's base term. Trip volume utilized in producing cost proposals was based on the projected number of trips calculated by Access' paratransit demand consultant HDR Engineering, Inc. Contract payment terms will include start-up costs and the rates listed below. Subject to Board approval, the contract may be extended for up to an additional four (4) years in one (1) year increments. The proposed rates of compensation for the five-year base term submitted by San Gabriel Transit, Inc., are listed below:

Contract Year	Monthly ADA Fixed Rate	ADA & Access to Work Per Trip Rate	Monthly Eligibility Fixed Rate	Eligibility Hourly Rate
1	\$1,156,445	\$44.33	\$132,739	\$45.56
2	\$1,210,811	\$45.87	\$137,770	\$47.50
3	\$1,268,635	\$47.44	\$146,068	\$49.33
4	\$1,329,133	\$49.01	\$154,921	\$51.11
5	\$1,393,339	\$50.51	\$164,370	\$52.71

*Rates for ad hoc (emergency) services are \$73.48/hour for the first year and increase by 3.5% or less each subsequent year: \$76.04 (Year 2); \$78.64 (Year 3); \$81.24 (Year 4) and \$83.73 (Year 5).

The table below details the Total Five-Year final submitted proposed costs:

Proposer - San Gabriel Transit	Startup Costs (S/U)	Total 5 Year Service Cost (incl. S/U)
ADA Service	\$969,764	\$294,544,806
Eligibility Service	\$0.00	\$17,074,195
Total:	\$969,764	\$311,619,001

The funding for these services comes from a combination of Federal Section 5307, Measure M, and Prop C Discretionary Funds.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

No alternatives were considered as the current contract has no option years available. However, the Board may choose to extend the current contract on a limited-term basis to re-procure the solicitation or allow for additional negotiations. Should the Board choose to extend the current contract, it is important to note that funding for the contract extension would likely have to be solely through local sales tax funds, due to applicable Federal requirements.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If the Board approves the staff recommendation, staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a written contract upon terms and conditions no

less favorable to Access than those proposed above. Access would not be legally bound to the contract herein proposed unless and until it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

Under Contract No. AS-3421, San Gabriel Transit, Inc. currently provides specialized ADA paratransit service for the Eastern Region, eligibility transportation service for the Los Angeles Basin, and eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions (including the Antelope Valley and Santa Clarita regions). This contract ends on March 31, 2024. To continue service, Access issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) on February 27, 2023.

Scope of Work Changes

The RFP made changes to the Scope of Work (SOW) that is currently in place in the Eastern Region. These new changes incorporated staff recommendations, contract amendments issued in recent years, and feedback from the Community Advisory Committee. Below are some of the significant changes to the new SOW.

Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)

1. Mean Miles Between Major Mechanical Failures - This standard was updated to more accurately reflect Major Mechanical Failures and is consistent with Access' Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan.
2. On-Time Performance (Eligibility Trips) - New standard; service must meet or exceed 94% for the quarter.
3. Phone Queue Hold Times for Eligibility - New standard; Eligibility Calls on Hold over 5 minutes must not exceed 10.0%.
4. Phone Queue Hold Times (Cancellations) for ADA trips - New standard; Cancellation Calls on Hold over 5 minutes must not exceed 10%.

Liquidated Damages

1. Additional liquidated damages added to address issues that result in poor service quality and responsiveness in line with the new Key Performance Indicators.

Staffing Requirements

1. Added a Deputy General Manager once ridership reaches a certain threshold in the future.
2. Added a Quality Assurance Supervisor to the required staff to focus on overall performance oversight and management of incidents and complaints.

3. Added additional Road Supervisor positions (increasing from twelve (12) to sixteen (16) positions). Road Supervisors respond to collisions and incidents, as well as perform critical passenger transport to avoid late and missed trips.
4. Added a Warranty & Parts Clerk position to be responsible for the management of parts, inventory, and all manufacturer warranty claims. This is a critical position needed to meet federal guidelines, as well as properly manage maintenance costs.
5. Added a Dispatch Manager position to oversee dispatch operations, critical to making same day service adjustments.
6. Added a Call Center Manager position to oversee call center operations, including reservations, Estimated Time of Arrival (ETA) calls, and trip cancellations.
7. Added an IT Database Administrator to oversee all data communicated to Access.

Training Hours

1. The new contract requires higher minimum training hours for Drivers, Dispatchers, Road Supervisors, and Customer Service Representatives:
 - Drivers - increased from 67 to 95 hours.
 - Road Supervisors - increased from 18 to 27 hours.
 - Customer Service Representatives - increased from 20 to 31 hours.
 - Dispatchers - increased from 20 to 55 hours.

Other Enhancements

1. Personnel answering ETA calls shall provide a first call resolution by providing ETAs and resolving real time rider issues.
2. Contractor must appoint a Chief Safety Officer who has authority and responsibility for day-to-day implementation and operation of the Contractor's safety plan.
3. Same standards for the main facility were applied to the satellite facilities, ensuring that performance and safety are consistent regardless of fleet and staff location.
4. Assumable lease as a precaution in case the contractor cannot fulfill its obligations.

Procurement Overview

On February 27, 2023, Access issued Request for Proposals (RFP) No. AS-4162 to retain a qualified transportation service contractor to operate specialized ADA paratransit service in the Eastern Region, eligibility transportation service for the Los Angeles Basin, and eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions. A Pre-Proposal Meeting was held virtually on March 13, 2023. Approximately 30 people attended the virtual meeting. Access issued two addenda to provide additional information, answer proposer questions, and extend the proposal due date.

Proposals were due on May 22, 2023. Access received one proposal from San Gabriel Transit, Inc. To gather information about proposer interest in the solicitation, Access conducted a market survey of Pre-Proposal Meeting attendees. Attendees identified several major factors that precluded them from proposing. These factors include the lack of appropriate facility sites, limited subcontractor availability, vehicle shortages, and post-pandemic business challenges.

An evaluation panel was convened, and a comprehensive technical evaluation followed. The evaluation panel consisted of five members: three Access staff from the Operations Department, one Access staff from the Eligibility Department, and one external technical expert from Foothill Transit. In addition, three non-voting internal subject matter experts from Access' Finance Department, Fleet Design and Maintenance Department, and Information Technology Department examined the proposal and reported their findings to the evaluation panel.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and associated weights:

	Evaluation Criteria	Maximum Points
1.	Quality of Technical Approach	15
2.	Quality of Safety Approach	5
3.	Qualifications and Availability of Proposed Staff	10
4.	Quality of Proposed Operating Facility	5
5.	Employee Pay and Benefits	20
6.	Financial Qualification of Proposer	5
7.	Proposer's Paratransit Operating Experience	10
8.	State Mandated Bidding Preference	10
9.	Cost/Price Proposal	20
	TOTAL	100

During the period from May 24, 2023, through August 28, 2023, the evaluation panel conducted its independent evaluation of the proposals. A summary of scores is set forth below.

Evaluation Criteria	San Gabriel Transit
1. Quality of Technical Approach	13.02
2. Quality of Safety Approach	4.34
3. Qualifications and Availability of Proposed Staff	8.30
4. Quality of Proposed Operating Facility	3.70
5. Employee Pay and Benefits	16.96
6. Financial Qualifications of Proposer	4.80
7. Proposer's Paratransit Operating Experience	9.20
8. State Mandated Bidding Preference	10.00

9. Cost/Price Proposal (including BAFO)	20.00
Total	90.32

San Gabriel Transit’s price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based upon an independent cost estimate (**ICE**), invitation for proposals, financial analysis, fact-finding, and negotiations. A summary of the cost analysis is set forth below:

Proposer	ICE	Original Price
San Gabriel Transit	\$336,594,361	\$311,619,001

Financial Analysis

Over the five-year base term, the average year-to-year change to the fully loaded cost per trip will remain below 2.6%. Additionally, in the first year of the contract, the proposed rate per trip will be 1.5% lower than the adjusted current rate, which includes multiple Covid-era wage and cost adjustments, none of which will be part of the new contract. The proposed rate for the fixed monthly is 20.3% higher than the Year 10 Fixed Monthly Fee. The percentage increase for the Monthly Fixed Fee reflects that the CPI increase over the last three years has been close to 14% and the number of FTEs in the proposal has increased by more than 6% vs. current. The new cost of “As Needed” hourly services will be \$73.28/hour.

The chart below shows the proposed fully loaded per-trip rates for Year 1 for the proposer, as well as the fully loaded per-trip rate for the current Eastern Region contractor. The fully loaded rate is derived by adding the monthly fixed fee and the total cost of trips performed (number of trips x Variable Rate per Trip) and then dividing that total by the number of trips.

FULLY-LOADED PER TRIP RATES: ACCESS SERVICE CONTRACTORS

<u>Service Area</u>	<u>Contractor</u>	<u>Fully-Loaded Rate</u>
Eastern Region Year 10	SGT	\$60.79
Eastern Region Proposed Year 1	SGT	\$60.99 (0.34% Increase)

Disadvantaged Business Enterprises

San Gabriel Transit’s proposal includes two DBE subcontractors. The first DBE subcontractor, JCM and Associates, Inc. (doing business as “Blue Goose Uniforms”),¹

¹ JCM and Associates, Inc. is also a Small Business Enterprise and Minority Business Enterprise.

would supply driver and staff uniforms and the second DBE subcontractor, Trans-Global Services, Inc.,² would provide vehicle cleaning services. Overall, DBE participation is two (2) percent of the total contract amount.

Overview of Recommended Proposer

Headquartered in El Monte, San Gabriel Transit is a regional transportation provider that specializes in ADA paratransit services in Los Angeles County. San Gabriel Transit is the incumbent operator of Access' Eastern Region service, the incumbent provider of eligibility transportation service in the Los Angeles Basin, and the incumbent provider of eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions (including the Antelope Valley and Santa Clarita). It has provided paratransit services to Access for nearly 30 years. Notably, it implemented the Reservation, Scheduling, and Dispatch Software (RSDS), 5M, for the Eastern Region, which has been adopted by Access for use in other service regions.

San Gabriel Transit has presented a robust Work Plan that meets the requirements of the Scope of Work. The Work Plan includes a Management and Staffing Plan, Training Program, Safety Plan, Operations Plan, Subcontractor Management Plan, Facility Plan, Technology Plan, and Quality Assurance Program.

The Management and Staffing Plan provides a management team of highly experienced personnel. The management team includes a General Manager, Operations Manager, Maintenance Manager, Safety Manager, Call Center Manager, Dispatch Manager, Customer Service Manager, and two Risk Managers. Collectively, the management team possesses well over 150 years of combined industry experience.

The plan utilizes the ADP Workforce Now Recruitment platform. This platform provides San Gabriel Transit access to numerous job sites, immediate job candidate searches, and job advertisement opportunities. The plan implements several staff incentive programs that incorporate safety, monthly performance, and retention bonuses.

The plan offers competitive wages and benefits with San Gabriel Transit paying 90% of health insurance, dental, and vision coverage. The plan provides a 401(k) plan that offers employer matching contributions, term life insurance, and discounted cellphone services.

The Training Program implements TAPTCO's Paratransit Operator Development Course, a comprehensive curriculum that integrates classroom lessons, closed

² Trans-Global Services, Inc. is also a Small Business Enterprise, Minority Business Enterprise, and Women Business Enterprise.

courses, and behind-the-wheel training. The course covers 29 performance standards to prepare drivers for the road.

Additional training subjects include disabilities, sensitivity and empathy, mobility devices, tablet operation, radio and communication equipment, bloodborne pathogens, vehicle inspection, visually impaired passengers, service animals, customer service, conflict management, de-escalation, on-board camera system operation, and emergency preparedness.

The Safety Plan includes a performance assessment process that involves the identification of safety goals, analysis of safety data, development of action plans, progress monitoring, and performance review. Critical to the process is the Safety Committee. This committee is comprised of the Safety Manager, Call Center Manager, Lead Road Supervisor, Drivers, Customer Service Representatives, and Technicians. The committee meets regularly to review safety data, identify hazards, and recommend solutions.

The Safety Plan includes driver safety training and driver monitoring through the Department of Motor Vehicles' Employer Pull Notice (EPN) program. The EPN program allows San Gabriel Transit to screen drivers' license status, accidents, and other relevant activities.

The Operations Plan sets forth a comprehensive strategy to ensure on-time performance. Under the plan, San Gabriel Transit would deploy the 5M application to alert drivers of important time intervals to help them plan their trips and manage time. San Gabriel Transit would issue tablets that provide turn-by-turn instruction to minimize driver confusion. San Gabriel Transit would enlist a combined subcontractor taxi fleet of over 250 vehicles to support service and use LADOT-certified taxis for non-ADA trips under Access' Flex Pilot Project.

The Operations Plan also includes a peak service plan that anticipates time periods of high demand. Under the peak service plan, San Gabriel Transit would boost driver staffing, offer overtime, and leverage subcontractor taxi fleets to meet increased demand.

The Subcontractor Management Plan implements an array of oversight activities to ensure compliance. The plan requires tailored taxi driver training, background screening, and taxi driver spot-checks. The plan also requires monthly audits of driver files, vehicle maintenance records, and organizational documents.

The Facility Plan offers three facilities located in El Monte, Sun Valley, and Central Los Angeles. The El Monte facility would serve as San Gabriel Transit's headquarters. It features approximately four acres of developed land, a vehicle washing area, vehicle maintenance area, and a 4,500 square foot building to oversee operations. The Sun Valley facility and Central Los Angeles facility would serve as satellite sites with the

former strategically positioned for certification trips in northern service areas and the latter strategically positioned for certification trips in southern service areas.

Improvements would be made to all facilities. In El Monte, San Gabriel Transit would implement pavement slurry sealing, vehicle maintenance bay upgrades, and call center reconfigurations. At each facility, San Gabriel Transit would also install upgraded security camera systems. These upgrades would include additional cameras, night vision capability, and access to real-time camera footage through desktop and mobile applications.

The Technology Plan utilizes software systems that meet scope requirements. The plan uses the 5M application for Reservations, Scheduling, and Dispatch Software services. The plan employs the on-board video camera system, SmartDrive, to monitor driver behavior and document safety events. The plan implements Collective Data Asset Management for vehicle maintenance management. This software enables San Gabriel Transit to schedule vehicle maintenance activities, manage parts inventory, and generate reports for analysis. In addition, the plan includes an IT System Engineer and IT Database Administrator to coordinate IT operations.

Finally, the Quality Assurance Program establishes a complete framework to ensure that service standards are met. The program includes a Quality Assurance Supervisor who implements internal audits, record reviews, and mitigation strategies. The Quality Assurance Supervisor would inspect street operations, call center operations, customer service, safety, vehicle maintenance, and overall systems performance. If an issue arises, the Quality Assurance Supervisor would utilize a range of remedial measures that include enhanced oversight, corrective actions, and recovery plans.

The program would conduct performance monitoring regularly at cross-functional levels. San Gabriel Transit would implement road supervisor observations, on-board video camera footage review, complaint analysis, call recording review, unannounced inspections, and other performance evaluations to identify issues, track trends, and address problems.

San Gabriel Transit is highly qualified to provide regular ADA paratransit service in the Eastern Region and eligibility services across Access' service regions. It presents a robust proposal for performing the Scope of Work. San Gabriel Transit is the recommended proposer for the RFP.

As the incumbent operator in the Eastern Region, San Gabriel Transit has delivered reliable service in recent years for Access riders in the region. The chart below shows San Gabriel Transit's performance in Access' 13 KPI categories in FY23, and through August of FY24 which shows a strong beginning for this fiscal year.

Key Performance Indicator	Standard	FY23	FY24*
On-Time Performance	≥ 91%	91.2%	93.6%
Excessively Late Trips	≤ 0.10%	0.04%	0.00%
Excessively Long Trips	≤ 5%	1.1%	1.1%
Missed Trips	≤ 0.75%	0.31%	0.19%
Denials	0	0	0
Access to Work On-Time Performance	≥ 94%	95.5%	97.7%
Average Initial Hold Time (Reservations)	≤ 120 seconds	34	35
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (Reservations)	≤ 5%	1.3%	1.9%
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (ETAs)	≤ 10%	0.5%	0.2%
Complaints Per 1,000 Trips	≤ 4.0	1.9	1.7
Preventable Incidents per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.25	0.15	0.10
Preventable Collisions per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.75	0.73	1.43
Miles Between Road Calls	≥ 25,000	31,011	42,307

#

*Preliminary data through August 2023

Ridership recovery is reflected in the following table -

Region	Jul-19	Jul-23	% Recovery
Southern	100,452	89,529	89.10%
Eastern	90,498	78,896	87.20%
West/Central	47,239	43,871	92.90%
Northern	54,332	36,900	67.90%
Antelope Valley	13,310	11,620	87.30%
Santa Clarita	3,710	2,590	69.80%
Systemwide	309,541	263,456	85.20%

OCTOBER 16, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS
FROM: ERIC HAACK, MANAGER OF PLANNING
RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES
BOARD (CARB) ZERO-EMISSION BUS (ZEB) ROLLOUT PLAN

SUMMARY:

The California Air Resources Board (CARB) in 2019 passed guidance requiring all public transit agencies to gradually transition their bus fleets to zero-emission technologies. A component of this is that agencies must draft (and receive Board approval) for a Zero-Emission Bus (ZEB) Rollout Plan. This item was reviewed and approved by the Planning and Development Committee.

RECOMMENDATION

Approve Access' CARB Zero-Emission Bus Rollout Plan.

IMPACT ON BUDGET

As described in the Rollout Plan, at this time, there are no zero-emission vehicles that could be introduced to Access' fleet that meet Buy America and Altoona testing requirements.

The ZEB Rollout Plan sets up aspirational goals for the agency to pursue once zero-emission vehicle technology can be introduced to Access' existing fleet.

Any purchases of vehicles and/or fueling/charging infrastructure would need to be considered and approved by the Board when such technologies are available for purchase.

BACKGROUND:

The California Air Resources Board (CARB) introduced the Innovative Clean Transit (ICT) Regulation Implementation Guidance in October 2019. The guidance requires all public transit agencies to gradually transition their bus fleets to zero-emission technologies.

In the CARB guidance “bus” applies to any standard (i.e. 40’ bus), articulated, double-decker bus or cutaway vehicle that exceeds 14,000 lbs. Gross Vehicle Weight Rating (GVWR).

The ZEB Rollout Plan has nine (9) elements:

1. Transit Agency Information
2. Rollout Plan General Information (such as when the Plan will be adopted)
3. Technology Portfolio (what fueling technology does the agency employ)
4. Current Bus Fleet Composition
5. Facilities and Infrastructure Modifications
6. Providing Service to Disadvantaged Communities
7. Workforce Training
8. Potential Funding Sources
9. Start-up and Scale-up Challenges

Small Agency ZEB Requirements

CARB provides two categories of transit agencies, those that operate 100 or more buses in normal daily service (large agencies) and all other agencies (small agencies). CARB has identified Access as a Small Agency for purposes of the ZEB Rollout Plan, due to the fact that Access owns and operates only 48 cutaway vehicles that are (or exceed) 14,000 lbs.

Small agencies, starting in 2026 are supposed to have 25% of their new bus purchases be zero-emission vehicles. For 2027 and 2028 small agencies, when they make new bus purchases, 25% of the purchased buses are supposed to be zero-emission buses.

Starting in 2029 all transit agencies (both large agencies and small agencies) are supposed to have 100% of all new bus purchases be zero-emission buses, with a goal that by 2040 transit agencies will operate only Zero-Emission buses in their fleets.

Access’ History of Adopting New Technology

Access has a long history of working with vehicle manufacturers to develop vehicles that work better for paratransit service.

Access’ Fleet Department staff worked with manufacturers to redesign the Dodge Caravan to permit a lower floor and a less steep climb into the passenger compartment of the minivan.

Access has continued to work with vehicle manufacturers to introduce improvements to such vehicles as the MV-1 and more recently the Ram ProMaster, both to be purpose-built paratransit vehicles.

In 2012 Access was among the first paratransit systems to adopt Compressed Natural Gas (CNG) as a fuel alternative for some of its fleet, a cleaner, more environmentally friendly alternative than conventional gasoline.

Access is also currently a leader in the development of Autonomous Vehicle technology for paratransit service with ongoing testing of AV vehicles to be introduced to Access' service in the future.

Access anticipates that it will continue to be a leader in adopting new fueling/charging technologies for paratransit, and will continue to work with vehicle manufacturers to ensure that new vehicle designs that are environmentally friendly will also provide safe and comfortable rides for Access' paratransit passengers.

Principal Challenges to Introducing Zero-Emission Vehicles to Access' Fleet

At this time, Access faces three (3) main challenges ahead of introducing zero-emission vehicles to its paratransit fleet.

1) Vehicles

Currently, there are no zero-emission vehicles that have met Buy America and Altoona testing requirements that could replace Access' existing larger (14,000 lbs.) cutaway vehicles. There are no vehicles that are immediately close to meeting these critical requirements, so Access cannot say what vehicle type (or fueling technology) it will adopt in the future.

Until there is a vehicle option that meets Buy America and Altoona testing, and a that vehicle will be capable of being a satisfactory replacement for Access' existing larger cutaway vehicles, Access will be prevented from introducing zero-emission vehicles.

Despite this, Access staff will continue to work with vehicle manufacturers in order to accelerate the development of a suitable vehicle option for our paratransit service.

2) Infrastructure (fueling/charging) Technology

Related to the issue provided above, so long as there are no available zero-emission vehicles that Access may purchase, Access cannot be certain what infrastructure (fueling/charging) technology will be employed. As the investment in charging stations for vehicles, and/or hydrogen fueling stations, can be expected to be considerable, it would be prudent for Access to delay this investment until it knows what vehicle and its fuel/charging source will be adopted.

As mentioned above, Access staff will continue to work with vehicle manufacturers in order to accelerate the development of an appropriate vehicle replacement for Access' larger cutaway vehicles.

3) Provider-Owned or Leased Facilities

The third challenge facing Access related to adopting zero-emission technology, is that Access, at present, does not own any vehicle facilities in its service area. All vehicle storage and maintenance facilities are owned (or leased) by Access contracted service providers.

Because of the private ownership of the vehicle facilities, Access cannot compel its service providers to install fueling or charging technology onto their yards. For one, Access may pay for the installation of the infrastructure, but then not have control of the technology based on private property. Additionally, and perhaps more importantly, if Access were to end its contractual relationship with a service provider or purchase a new yard for the service provider to operate out of, any technology installed on the private property site would have to be abandoned or destroyed, as likely it would not be able to be easily removed from the original contractor site.

At this time, Access is in the early stages of architectural design related to a purchased property in the Antelope Valley with the expectation that this property will become a facility for the service provider in the Antelope Valley to operate its service.

The site is projected to open as early as 2025, and at that time this Access-owned location may be a good site to introduce zero-emission fueling or charging infrastructure technology

OCTOBER 16, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS
FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION
RE: CONSIDERATION TO MODIFY BOARD COMMITTEE STRUCTURE

ISSUE:

Staff has been requested by the Board to develop an alternative to the current governance structure. This item was reviewed and approved by the Board Operations Committee.

RECOMMENDATION

Approve the following -

1. Eliminate the Performance Monitoring, Planning and Development, and External/Stakeholders Relations Committees.
2. Assign the audit and compensation responsibilities to the Board Operations Committee.
3. Schedule Board meetings monthly unless cancelled upon approval of the Board Chair.

IMPACT ON BUDGET

None.

BACKGROUND

In November 2019, the Board approved the creation of a new Board committee structure based upon recommendations of the High Impact Governing Work Session Steering Committee, whose members included the Board officers, legal counsel, and Access' Executive Director. The new structure included the Performance Monitoring, Planning and Development, External/Stakeholders Relations and Board Operations Committees. Implementation of this structure began in March 2020 and was fully implemented by October 2020. Due to pandemic restrictions, all meetings were conducted remotely via Zoom until April 2023.

While the committee structure proved effective during the pandemic, Board members raised concerns about not hearing about issues equally if they were not assigned to a

particular committee. While issues could be brought forward again at a full Board meeting, the Board has expressed a desire to return to a structure where all issues are presented to the Board collectively at one monthly meeting for discussion and possible action.

The above recommendation will achieve the Board's desire in this respect. The Board Operations Committee (comprised of the Board Officers) will remain as structured and will also function as the Audit and Compensation committee.

NEXT STEPS

If approved, the committee meetings on November 27, 2023, will be cancelled and the next full Board meeting will occur on December 4, 2023.

OCTOBER 16, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION

RE: UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS

ISSUE:

The following items are tentatively scheduled to be addressed by the Board and its committees through December 2023.

November 1, 2023 - Annual Meeting

December 4, 2023 - Board Meeting

Agenda Items:	Disposition:
Eligibility Services Contract Award	Action
Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan (PTASP) Update	Action
Access to Work Program Changes	Action