

access

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

Monday, September 18, 2023

12:30 p.m.

Access Services
Council Conference Room, 3rd Floor
3449 Santa Anita Avenue
El Monte CA 91731

See [*Note below for remote public link.](#)

Committee Members: D. Barnes, Chair
T. DeVera
M. Gombert

	<u>DISPOSITION</u>
1. CALL TO ORDER	ACTION
2. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT	INFORMATION
3. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD EASTERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4162) (page 5)	ACTION
4. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD APPEALS PROVIDER CONTRACTS (page 15)	ACTION
5. CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE RENEWAL OF AGENCY INSURANCE POLICIES (page 20)	ACTION
6. CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (CARB) ZERO-EMISSION BUS (ZEB) ROLLOUT PLAN	PRESENTATION
7. ADJOURNMENT	ACTION

Access Services does not discriminate on the basis of disability. Accordingly, Access Services seeks to ensure that individuals with disabilities will have an equal opportunity to participate in the range of Access Services events and programs by providing

appropriate auxiliary aids and services for communications. Primary consideration is given to the request of individuals with disabilities. However, the final decision belongs to Access Services. To help ensure the availability of any auxiliary aids and services you require, please make every effort to notify Access Services of your request at least three (3) business days (72 hours) prior to the meeting in which you wish to utilize those aids or services. You may do so by contacting (213) 270-6000.

Note: Access Services Board committee meetings are held pursuant to the Ralph M. Brown Act [Cal. Gov. Code §54950] and are open to the public. The public may view and obtain all written information supporting this agenda provided to the Board committee both initially and supplementally prior to the meeting at the agency's offices located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue, El Monte, California and on its website at <http://accessla.org>. Documents, including Power Point handouts distributed to the Board committee members by staff or Board committee members at the meeting, will simultaneously be made available to the public. Three opportunities are available for the public to address the Board committee during a Board committee meeting: (1) before closed session regarding matters to be discussed in closed session, (2) before a specific agenda item is debated and voted upon and (3) during the time allotted for general public comment. The exercise of the right to address the Board committee is subject to restriction as to time and appropriate decorum. All persons wishing to make public comment must fill out a goldenrod Public Comment Form and submit it to the Secretary of the Board. Public comment is generally limited to three (3) minutes per speaker and the total time available for public comment may be further limited at the discretion of the Chairperson. Persons whose speech is impaired such that they are unable to address the Board at a normal rate of speed may request an accommodation of a limited amount of additional time from the Chair but only by checking the appropriate box on the Public Comment Form. Granting such an accommodation is at the discretion of the Chair. The Board committee cannot and will not respond during the meeting to matters raised under general public comment. Pursuant to provisions of the Brown Act governing these proceedings, no discussion or action may be taken on these matters unless they are listed on the agenda, or unless certain emergency or special circumstances exist. However, the Board committee may direct staff to investigate and/or schedule certain matters for consideration at a future Board committee meeting and staff may respond to all public comments in writing prior to the next Board committee meeting.

Commitment to Civility

To assure civility in its public meetings, staff and the public are also encouraged to engage in respectful dialog that supports freedom of speech and values diversity of opinion. To achieve compliance with these Rules, Directors, staff, and the public are encouraged to:

- Create an atmosphere of respect and civility where Directors, staff, and the public are free to express their ideas;
- Establish and maintain a cordial and respectful atmosphere during discussions;
- Foster meaningful dialogue free of personal attacks;
- Listen with an open mind to all information, including dissenting points of view, regarding issues presented to the Board;
- Recognize that it is sometimes difficult to speak at Board meetings, and out of respect for each person's feelings, allow others to have their say without comment, including booing, whistling or clapping; and
- Adhere to speaking time limit.

Alternative accessible formats are available upon request.

*NOTE

The public may also participate via the Zoom webinar link, or by teleconference. Please review the procedures to do so as follows -

How to Provide Public Comment in a Board Meeting via Zoom

Online

1. Click the Zoom link for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at: https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html. Make sure to use a current, up-to-date browser: Chrome 30+, Firefox 27+, Microsoft Edge 12+, or Safari 7+. Certain functionality may be disabled in older browsers including Internet Explorer. You may also use this direct link - <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/85635837663>
2. Enter an email address and your name. Your name will be visible online while you are speaking.
3. When the Committee Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, click on "raise hand." Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Mute all other audio before speaking. Using multiple devices can cause audio feedback.
4. Please note that the "Chat" feature is an accessibility tool for comments on items by committee members and the general public attendees who need to use this tool. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, then please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called, please limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

Note: Members of the public will not be shown on video.

By phone

1. Call the Zoom phone number and enter the webinar ID for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at:
https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html
2. You can also call in using the following information -
Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):
US: +1 669 444 9171 or +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 205 0468 or +1 253 215 8782
or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 719 359 4580 or +1 386 347 5053 or +1 507 473 4847
or +1 564 217 2000 or +1 646 931 3860 or +1 689 278 1000 or +1 929 205 6099
or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 305 224 1968 or +1 309 205 3325 or +1 312 626 6799
or +1 360 209 5623 or 833 548 0276 (Toll Free) or 833 548 0282 (Toll Free) or 877
853 5247 (Toll Free) or 888 788 0099 (Toll Free)
Webinar ID: 856 3583 7663
3. When the Committee Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, press *9 to raise a hand. Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Speakers will be called by the last four digits of their phone number. Please note that phone numbers in their entirety will be visible online while speakers are speaking.
4. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, the please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called, please state your name and limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

SEPTEMBER 11, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: ROGELIO GOMEZ, SENIOR MANAGER OF OPERATIONS
BRUCE FRINK, SENIOR MANAGER, FINANCE PLANNING & ANALYSIS
DAVID CHIA, PROCUREMENT & CONTRACT ADMINISTRATOR

RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD EASTERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER
CONTRACT (AS-4162)

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to execute a contract for specialized ADA paratransit service in the Eastern Region, eligibility transportation service for Access' four service regions in the Los Angeles Basin, and eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute Contract No. AS-4162 for specialized ADA paratransit service in the Eastern Region, eligibility transportation service for the Los Angeles Basin, and eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions for a three-month startup period and five (5) year base period beginning January 1, 2024, and ending on March 31, 2029 (with revenue service beginning on April 1, 2024) with San Gabriel Transit, Inc. (SGT) in an amount not to exceed \$311,619,001.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

This action is consistent with the budget estimates for the proposed contract's base term. Trip volume utilized in producing cost proposals was based on the projected number of trips calculated by Access' paratransit demand consultant HDR Engineering, Inc. Contract payment terms will include start-up costs and the rates listed below. Subject to Board approval, the contract may be extended for up to an additional four (4) years in one (1) year increments. The proposed rates of compensation for the five-year base term submitted by San Gabriel Transit, Inc., are listed below:

Contract Year	Monthly ADA Fixed Rate	ADA & Access to Work Per Trip Rate	Monthly Eligibility Fixed Rate	Eligibility Hourly Rate
1	\$1,156,445	\$44.33	\$132,739	\$45.56
2	\$1,210,811	\$45.87	\$137,770	\$47.50
3	\$1,268,635	\$47.44	\$146,068	\$49.33
4	\$1,329,133	\$49.01	\$154,921	\$51.11
5	\$1,393,339	\$50.51	\$164,370	\$52.71

*Rates for ad hoc (emergency) services are \$73.48/hour for the first year and increase by 3.5% or less each subsequent year: \$76.04 (Year 2); \$78.64 (Year 3); \$81.24 (Year 4) and \$83.73 (Year 5).

The table below details the Total Five-Year final submitted proposed costs:

Proposer - San Gabriel Transit	Startup Costs (S/U)	Total 5 Year Service Cost (incl. S/U)
ADA Service	\$969,764	\$294,544,806
Eligibility Service	\$0.00	\$17,074,195
Total:	\$969,764	\$311,619,001

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

No alternatives were considered as the current contract has no option years available. However, the Board may choose to extend the current contract on a limited-term basis to re-procure the solicitation or allow for additional negotiations. Should the Board choose to extend the current contract, it is important to note that funding for the contract extension would likely have to be solely through local sales tax funds, due to applicable Federal requirements.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If the Board approves the staff recommendation, staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a written contract upon terms and conditions no less favorable to Access than those proposed above. Access would not be legally bound to the contract herein proposed unless and until it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

Under Contract No. AS-3421, San Gabriel Transit, Inc. currently provides specialized ADA paratransit service for the Eastern Region, eligibility transportation service for the Los Angeles Basin, and eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions (including the Antelope Valley and Santa Clarita regions). This contract ends on March 31, 2024. To continue service, Access issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) on February 27, 2023.

Scope of Work Changes

The RFP made changes to the Scope of Work (SOW) that is currently in place in the Eastern Region. These new changes incorporated staff recommendations, contract amendments issued in recent years, and feedback from the Community Advisory Committee. Below are some of the significant changes to the new SOW.

Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)

1. Mean Miles Between Major Mechanical Failures - This standard was updated to more accurately reflect Major Mechanical Failures and is consistent with Access' Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan.
2. On-Time Performance (Eligibility Trips) - New standard; service must meet or exceed 94% for the quarter.
3. Phone Queue Hold Times for Eligibility -New standard; Eligibility Calls on Hold over 5 minutes must not exceed 10.0%.
4. Phone Queue Hold Times (Cancellations) for ADA trips - New standard; Cancellation Calls on Hold over 5 minutes must not exceed 10%.

Liquidated Damages

1. Additional liquidated damages added to address issues that result in poor service quality and responsiveness in line with the new Key Performance Indicators.

Staffing Requirements

1. Added a Deputy General Manager once ridership reaches a certain threshold in the future.
2. Added a Quality Assurance Supervisor to the required staff to focus on overall performance oversight and management of incidents and complaints.
3. Added additional Road Supervisor positions (increasing from twelve (12) to sixteen (16) positions). Road Supervisors respond to collisions and incidents, as well as perform critical passenger transport to avoid late and missed trips.
4. Added a Warranty & Parts Clerk position to be responsible for the management of parts, inventory, and all manufacturer warranty claims. This is a critical position needed to meet federal guidelines, as well as properly manage maintenance costs.

5. Added a Dispatch Manager position to oversee dispatch operations, critical to making same day service adjustments.
6. Added a Call Center Manager position to oversee call center operations, including reservations, Estimated Time of Arrival (ETA) calls, and trip cancellations.
7. Added an IT Database Administrator to oversee all data communicated to Access.

Training Hours

1. The new contract requires higher minimum training hours for Drivers, Dispatchers, Road Supervisors, and Customer Service Representatives:
 - Drivers - increased from 67 to 95 hours.
 - Road Supervisors - increased from 18 to 27 hours.
 - Customer Service Representatives - increased from 20 to 31 hours.
 - Dispatchers - increased from 20 to 55 hours.

Other Enhancements

1. Personnel answering ETA calls shall provide a first call resolution by providing ETAs and resolving real time rider issues.
2. Contractor must appoint a Chief Safety Officer who has authority and responsibility for day-to-day implementation and operation of the Contractor's safety plan.
3. Same standards for the main facility were applied to the satellite facilities, ensuring that performance and safety are consistent regardless of fleet and staff location.
4. Assumable lease as a precaution in case the contractor cannot fulfill its obligations.

Procurement Overview

On February 27, 2023, Access issued Request for Proposals (RFP) No. AS-4162 to retain a qualified transportation service contractor to operate specialized ADA paratransit service in the Eastern Region, eligibility transportation service for the Los Angeles Basin, and eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions. A Pre-Proposal Meeting was held virtually on March 13, 2023. Approximately 30 people attended the virtual meeting. Access issued two addenda to provide additional information, answer proposer questions, and extend the proposal due date.

Proposals were due on May 22, 2023. Access received one proposal from San Gabriel Transit, Inc. To gather information about proposer interest in the solicitation, Access conducted a market survey of Pre-Proposal Meeting attendees. Attendees identified several major factors that precluded them from proposing. These factors include the lack of appropriate facility sites, limited subcontractor availability, vehicle shortages, and post-pandemic business challenges.

An evaluation panel was convened, and a comprehensive technical evaluation followed. The evaluation panel consisted of five members: three Access staff from the Operations Department, one Access staff from the Eligibility Department, and one external technical expert from Foothill Transit. In addition, three non-voting internal subject matter experts from Access' Finance Department, Fleet Design and Maintenance Department, and Information Technology Department examined the proposal and reported their findings to the evaluation panel.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and associated weights:

	Evaluation Criteria	Maximum Points
1.	Quality of Technical Approach	15
2.	Quality of Safety Approach	5
3.	Qualifications and Availability of Proposed Staff	10
4.	Quality of Proposed Operating Facility	5
5.	Employee Pay and Benefits	20
6.	Financial Qualification of Proposer	5
7.	Proposer's Paratransit Operating Experience	10
8.	State Mandated Bidding Preference	10
9.	Cost/Price Proposal	20
	TOTAL	100

During the period from May 24, 2023, through August 28, 2023, the evaluation panel conducted its independent evaluation of the proposals. A summary of scores is set forth below.

Evaluation Criteria	San Gabriel Transit
1. Quality of Technical Approach	13.02
2. Quality of Safety Approach	4.34
3. Qualifications and Availability of Proposed Staff	8.30
4. Quality of Proposed Operating Facility	3.70
5. Employee Pay and Benefits	16.96
6. Financial Qualifications of Proposer	4.80
7. Proposer's Paratransit Operating Experience	9.20
8. State Mandated Bidding Preference	10.00
9. Cost/Price Proposal (including BAFO)	20.00
Total	90.32

San Gabriel Transit's price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based upon an independent cost estimate (**ICE**), invitation for proposals, financial analysis, fact-finding, and negotiations. A summary of the cost analysis is set forth below:

Proposer	ICE	Original Price
San Gabriel Transit	\$336,594,361	\$311,619,001

Financial Analysis

Over the five-year base term, the average year-to-year change to the fully loaded cost per trip will remain below 2.6%. Additionally, in the first year of the contract, the proposed rate per trip will be 1.5% lower than the adjusted current rate, which includes multiple Covid-era wage and cost adjustments, none of which will be part of the new contract. The proposed rate for the fixed monthly is 20.3% higher than the Year 10 Fixed Monthly Fee. The percentage increase for the Monthly Fixed Fee reflects that the CPI increase over the last three years has been close to 14% and the number of FTEs in the proposal has increased by more than 6% vs. current. The new cost of “As Needed” hourly services will be \$73.28/hour.

The chart below shows the proposed fully loaded per-trip rates for Year 1 for the proposer, as well as the fully loaded per-trip rate for the current Eastern Region contractor. The fully loaded rate is derived by adding the monthly fixed fee and the total cost of trips performed (number of trips x Variable Rate per Trip) and then dividing that total by the number of trips.

**FULLY-LOADED PER TRIP RATES:
ACCESS SERVICE CONTRACTORS**

<u>Service Area</u>	<u>Contractor</u>	<u>Fully-Loaded Rate</u>
Eastern Region Year 10	SGT	\$60.79
Eastern Region Proposed Year 1	SGT	\$60.99 (0.34% Increase)

Disadvantaged Business Enterprises

San Gabriel Transit’s proposal includes two DBE subcontractors. The first DBE subcontractor, JCM and Associates, Inc. (doing business as “Blue Goose Uniforms”),¹ would supply driver and staff uniforms and the second DBE subcontractor, Trans-Global Services, Inc.,² would provide vehicle cleaning services.

¹ JCM and Associates, Inc. is also a Small Business Enterprise and Minority Business Enterprise.

² Trans-Global Services, Inc. is also a Small Business Enterprise, Minority Business Enterprise, and Women Business Enterprise.

Overview of Recommended Proposer

Headquartered in El Monte, San Gabriel Transit is a regional transportation provider that specializes in ADA paratransit services in Los Angeles County. San Gabriel Transit is the incumbent operator of Access' Eastern Region service, the incumbent provider of eligibility transportation service in the Los Angeles Basin, and the incumbent provider of eligibility appointment scheduling for all service regions (including the Antelope Valley and Santa Clarita). It has provided paratransit services to Access for nearly 30 years. Notably, it implemented the Reservation, Scheduling, and Dispatch Software (RSDS), 5M, for the Eastern Region, which has been adopted by Access for use in other service regions.

San Gabriel Transit has presented a robust Work Plan that meets the requirements of the Scope of Work. The Work Plan includes a Management and Staffing Plan, Training Program, Safety Plan, Operations Plan, Subcontractor Management Plan, Facility Plan, Technology Plan, and Quality Assurance Program.

The Management and Staffing Plan provides a management team of highly experienced personnel. The management team includes a General Manager, Operations Manager, Maintenance Manager, Safety Manager, Call Center Manager, Dispatch Manager, Customer Service Manager, and two Risk Managers. Collectively, the management team possesses well over 150 years of combined industry experience.

The plan utilizes the ADP Workforce Now Recruitment platform. This platform provides San Gabriel Transit access to numerous job sites, immediate job candidate searches, and job advertisement opportunities. The plan implements several staff incentive programs that incorporate safety, monthly performance, and retention bonuses.

The plan offers competitive wages and benefits with San Gabriel Transit paying 90% of health insurance, dental, and vision coverage. The plan provides a 401(k) plan that offers employer matching contributions, term life insurance, and discounted cellphone services.

The Training Program implements TAPTCO's Paratransit Operator Development Course, a comprehensive curriculum that integrates classroom lessons, closed courses, and behind-the-wheel training. The course covers 29 performance standards to prepare drivers for the road.

Additional training subjects include disabilities, sensitivity and empathy, mobility devices, tablet operation, radio and communication equipment, bloodborne pathogens, vehicle inspection, visually impaired passengers, service animals, customer service, conflict management, de-escalation, on-board camera system operation, and emergency preparedness.

The Safety Plan includes a performance assessment process that involves the identification of safety goals, analysis of safety data, development of action plans, progress monitoring, and performance review. Critical to the process is the Safety Committee. This committee is comprised of the Safety Manager, Call Center Manager, Lead Road Supervisor, Drivers, Customer Service Representatives, and Technicians. The committee meets regularly to review safety data, identify hazards, and recommend solutions.

The Safety Plan includes driver safety training and driver monitoring through the Department of Motor Vehicles' Employer Pull Notice (EPN) program. The EPN program allows San Gabriel Transit to screen drivers' license status, accidents, and other relevant activities.

The Operations Plan sets forth a comprehensive strategy to ensure on-time performance. Under the plan, San Gabriel Transit would deploy the 5M application to alert drivers of important time intervals to help them plan their trips and manage time. San Gabriel Transit would issue tablets that provide turn-by-turn instruction to minimize driver confusion. San Gabriel Transit would enlist a combined subcontractor taxi fleet of over 250 vehicles to support service and use LADOT-certified taxis for non-ADA trips under Access' Flex Pilot Project.

The Operations Plan also includes a peak service plan that anticipates time periods of high demand. Under the peak service plan, San Gabriel Transit would boost driver staffing, offer overtime, and leverage subcontractor taxi fleets to meet increased demand.

The Subcontractor Management Plan implements an array of oversight activities to ensure compliance. The plan requires tailored taxi driver training, background screening, and taxi driver spot-checks. The plan also requires monthly audits of driver files, vehicle maintenance records, and organizational documents.

The Facility Plan offers three facilities located in El Monte, Sun Valley, and Central Los Angeles. The El Monte facility would serve as San Gabriel Transit's headquarters. It features approximately four acres of developed land, a vehicle washing area, vehicle maintenance area, and a 4,500 square foot building to oversee operations. The Sun Valley facility and Central Los Angeles facility would serve as satellite sites with the former strategically positioned for certification trips in northern service areas and the latter strategically positioned for certification trips in southern service areas.

Improvements would be made to all facilities. In El Monte, San Gabriel Transit would implement pavement slurry sealing, vehicle maintenance bay upgrades, and call center reconfigurations. At each facility, San Gabriel Transit would also install upgraded security camera systems. These upgrades would include additional cameras, night vision capability, and access to real-time camera footage through desktop and mobile applications.

The Technology Plan utilizes software systems that meet scope requirements. The plan uses the 5M application for Reservations, Scheduling, and Dispatch Software services. The plan employs the on-board video camera system, SmartDrive, to monitor driver behavior and document safety events. The plan implements Collective Data Asset Management for vehicle maintenance management. This software enables San Gabriel Transit to schedule vehicle maintenance activities, manage parts inventory, and generate reports for analysis. In addition, the plan includes an IT System Engineer and IT Database Administrator to coordinate IT operations.

Finally, the Quality Assurance Program establishes a complete framework to ensure that service standards are met. The program includes a Quality Assurance Supervisor who implements internal audits, record reviews, and mitigation strategies. The Quality Assurance Supervisor would inspect street operations, call center operations, customer service, safety, vehicle maintenance, and overall systems performance. If an issue arises, the Quality Assurance Supervisor would utilize a range of remedial measures that include enhanced oversight, corrective actions, and recovery plans.

The program would conduct performance monitoring regularly at cross-functional levels. San Gabriel Transit would implement road supervisor observations, on-board video camera footage review, complaint analysis, call recording review, unannounced inspections, and other performance evaluations to identify issues, track trends, and address problems.

San Gabriel Transit is highly qualified to provide regular ADA paratransit service in the Eastern Region and eligibility services across Access' service regions. It presents a robust proposal for performing the Scope of Work. San Gabriel Transit is the recommended proposer for the RFP.

As the incumbent operator in the Eastern Region, San Gabriel Transit has delivered reliable service in recent years for Access riders in the region. The chart below shows San Gabriel Transit's performance in Access' 13 KPI categories in FY23, and through August of FY24 which shows a strong beginning for this fiscal year.

Key Performance Indicator	Standard	FY23	FY24*
On-Time Performance	≥ 91%	91.2%	93.6%
Excessively Late Trips	≤ 0.10%	0.04%	0.00%
Excessively Long Trips	≤ 5%	1.1%	1.1%
Missed Trips	≤ 0.75%	0.31%	0.19%
Denials	0	0	0
Access to Work On-Time Performance	≥ 94%	95.5%	97.7%
Average Initial Hold Time (Reservations)	≤ 120 seconds	34	35
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (Reservations)	≤ 5%	1.3%	1.8%
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (ETAs)	≤ 10%	0.5%	0.2%
Complaints Per 1,000 Trips	≤ 4.0	1.9	1.7
Preventable Incidents per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.25	0.15	0.10
Preventable Collisions per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.75	0.73	1.47
Miles Between Road Calls	≥ 25,000	31,011	**

#

*Preliminary data through 8/31/2023

**Final numbers pending

SEPTEMBER 11, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: KAREN GILBERT, MANAGER OF ELIGIBILITY
 BRIAN SELWYN, MANGER OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT
 ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD APPEALS PROVIDER CONTRACTS

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to exercise the award of four (4) individual contracts for Eligibility Appeal Specialists.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute contracts for Eligibility Appeal Services with the four (4) Appeal Specialists outlined below for a total cost not to exceed \$4,186,368. The period of performance for each contract will be five (5) years.

Contract No.	Contractor	Type of Appeals	Contract Amounts Not to Exceed	Contract Start Date
AS-4101-1	Alfred L. Glover, DPM	Medical	\$271,916	May 1, 2024
AS-4101-2	Medical Management Mission (MMM)	Medical	\$2,429,848	Feb 1, 2024
AS-4101-3	Lori Petrie, Ph.D. Center, Inc.	Mental Health	\$820,646	Sept. 1, 2024
AS-4101-4	Abraham Ishaaya, MD (dba Olympic Medical Evaluations)	Medical	\$663,958	Feb 1, 2024

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The funds being requested have been programmed for the current budget year and will be appropriately budgeted for the subsequent out-years. Further details are contained in the background section below.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

Access is mandated by the ADA to provide eligibility appeal services. With the procurement of this service and the award of contracts to four firms, the agency will be able to meet the anticipated demand for this service over the next several years. The agency also has one other appeal specialist currently under contract and has recently re-released an open solicitation to attract other specialists who may be interested in providing this service on behalf of Access.

BACKGROUND:

Request for Quotations (RFQ) No. AS-4168 was issued on May 25, 2023, and four (4) Eligibility Appeal Specialists responded thereto. Given the potential for occasional spikes in the demand for requests for initial eligibility assessments, staff believes that it is prudent to be able to look outside our current eligibility contractor for additional vendors who might meet temporary or emergency needs. As a result, proposers have all agreed to provide this service where possible, albeit on a limited basis, when called upon to do so.

All proposals submitted were deemed responsive and the proposers responsible and fully capable of undertaking the work outlined in the subject RFQ and staff is recommending award accordingly. Each of the respondents is an incumbent Eligibility Appeal Specialist for Access Services and a summary of their qualifications and experience is as follows:

Dr. Alfred L. Glover is a partner in the Diabetic Foot Center in Inglewood, a practice he joined in 2002. He has nearly thirty-five years of experience in the practice of podiatric medicine and holds affiliations with, among other facilities, the VA Hospital (Westwood), Orthopedic Hospital, and the US Naval Hospital (Camp Pendleton). Of relevance to the work to be undertaken as an eligibility appeals specialist, he has a great deal of experience working with service members, establishing their fitness for active duty and individuals with diabetes. He has also created a professional team consisting of a physical therapist, psychotherapist and medical doctor who are available to augment the work he will perform in reviewing eligibility appeals. Dr. Glover's location in Inglewood will provide a needed geographical balance for those who file appeals in this area.

Medical Management Mission (MMM) is one of the more recent eligibility appeals contractors, having begun working with Access in 2015. Given MMM's interest in providing initial evaluations on an as-needed basis, as well as continuing to serve as an eligibility appeals specialist, the company was very interested in submitting a proposal in response to the new RFQ. At this time, MMM is the only medical firm performing appeals services on behalf of Access in the San Fernando Valley. (It also performs appeals evaluations at its office in West Hollywood.) All of its appeal specialists are physicians who have been in practice for at least twenty years. Their areas of specialization range from internal medicine and nephrology to pain management and oncology. Staff is very pleased with the practice's performance.

Dr. Lori Petrie is a licensed clinical psychologist in private practice in West Los Angeles with more than twenty years of experience working with Access eligibility appellants and over thirty years in the field of psychology. Among her professional roles, Dr. Petrie has worked with clients of all ages in a variety of clinical settings and has served as Associate Professor in the Department of Psychiatry at Harbor-UCLA Medical Center. Her performance has been consistent with the expectations, requirements, and terms of the four contracts which she has had with Access.

Abraham Ishaaya, MD acquired Olympic Medical Evaluations (OME) in August 2018 and, per Board approval at its September 24, 2018 meeting, has served as an Access contractor under the latter name since October 1, 2018. As a result of this acquisition, the two practices have, in effect, merged services, giving the new entity an enhanced ability to serve the needs of current and future clinic patients and Access evaluation appeals clients alike. Dr. Ishaaya runs an established medical evaluation clinic, recognized for its ability to complete and process medical evaluations related to identification of impairments and their respective functional capacity. OME has been working with Access for over two decades.

The contract costs are based on the rates for the evaluations, as well as the cost of no-shows and cancellations. As stated above, all proposers have agreed to provide initial evaluations on an as-needed basis. The cost for this service is equivalent to the cost of the appeal evaluation for the applicable year in which the service is performed.

For each of the proposed new contracts, increases in these rates from the first year of the current contract to the final year of the new contract average no more than 4.7% per year. While the most recent annual change in the CPI for the Los Angeles Area (March - May 2023 vs. March-May 2022) was 3.6%, the significant fluctuations in the CPI over the past few years - at times approaching a double-digit increase - and increases in the costs of labor, rent and medical equipment, the proposed rates are still deemed fair and reasonable.

Access Services projects that a total of 8,139 appeal evaluations may be completed by these contractors between February 1, 2024 and July 31, 2029.

PROJECTED APPEALS BY CONTRACTOR:

FY 2024-2029

Name of Specialist	# of Appeal Evaluations: 2024 - 2029	Totals
Alfred L. Glover, DPM (Medical)	914	\$271,916
MMM (Medical)	4,283	\$2,429,848
Dr. Lori Petrie (Psychology)	1,450	\$820,646
Abraham Ishaaya, MD (Medical)	1,492	\$663,958
TOTAL	8,139	\$4,186,368

**2024-2029 projections are based on pre-pandemic numbers from year 2019.*

The specific rates of compensation proposed for each of the appeal specialists for the five-year contract period are presented in Table A below.

**TABLE A:
PROPOSED RATES FOR CONTRACT YEARS 1-5**

Contractor Rates:	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
Alfred L. Glover, DPM (AS 4168-1)					
Eligibility Appeal Evaluation	\$274.00	\$284.00	\$294.00	\$304.00	\$314.00
Initial Eligibility Evaluation	\$274.00	\$284.00	\$294.00	\$304.00	\$314.00
No Show / Cancellation	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00
MMM (AS-4168-2)					
Eligibility Appeal Evaluation	\$516.48	\$542.30	\$561.82	\$582.05	\$603.00
Initial Eligibility Evaluation	\$516.48	\$542.30	\$561.82	\$582.05	\$603.00
No Show / Cancellation	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$50.00
Lori Petrie (AS-4168-3)					
Eligibility Appeal Evaluation	\$518.00	\$536.85	\$555.97	\$575.98	\$596.72
Initial Eligibility Evaluation	\$518.00	\$536.85	\$555.97	\$575.98	\$596.72
No Show / Cancellation	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$100.00
Abraham Ishaaya, MD (AS 4168-4)					
Eligibility Appeal Evaluation	\$422.13	\$430.98	\$440.28	\$450.04	\$460.29
Initial Eligibility Evaluation	\$422.13	\$430.98	\$440.28	\$450.04	\$460.29
No Show / Cancellation	\$42.20	\$44.30	\$46.50	\$48.33	\$51.27

SEPTEMBER 11, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: HECTOR RODRIGUEZ, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE RENEWAL OF AGENCY INSURANCE POLICIES

ISSUE:

Board approval is requested to purchase various Agency insurance policies for the policy year beginning November 1, 2023.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the purchase of various Agency insurance policies, including property, earthquake, crime, general liability, auto, executive professional liability, Directors and Officers, employment practices, cyber and workers' compensation insurance for a not-to-exceed amount of \$742,416.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The approved budget for Fiscal Year 2023/24 includes the cost of these policies. The funding for these policies comes from Prop C 40% Discretionary funds. The cost of the policies for the current year is \$618,680. Staff expects increases in several policies, such as auto, cyber security and Workers Compensation.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

No alternatives were considered. In order to protect the agency from liability, it is necessary to purchase these policies on an annual basis.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, the staff would be authorized, but not required, to purchase the above policies at terms no less favorable to Access than those proposed above.

BACKGROUND:

SullivanCurtisMonroe (SCM), Access' insurance broker, is in the process of soliciting quotes for the various insurance policies. Upon Committee approval, staff will

authorize SCM to purchase the policies with an effective date of no later than November 1, 2023, and November 30, 2023, for the Workers' Compensation policy.