

# access

## PERFORMANCE MONITORING COMMITTEE

Monday, September 18, 2023

11:00 a.m.

Access Services Council Conference Room, 3rd Floor 3449 Santa Anita Avenue El Monte CA 91731
Long Beach Transit 1963 E Anaheim St Long Beach, CA 90813

See [\\*Note below for remote public link.](#)

Committee Members: L. Burner, Chair  
V. Gibson  
G. Gogreve

---

	<u>DISPOSITION</u>
1. CALL TO ORDER	ACTION
2. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT	INFORMATION
3. CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM, CHANGE RATES AND INCREASE FUNDS - WEST/CENTRAL SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4031) (page 5)	ACTION
4. CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM, CHANGE RATES AND INCREASE FUNDS - NORTHERN SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4059) (page 9)	ACTION
5. PERFORMANCE UPDATE	PRESENTATION
6. CHIEF OPERATIONS OFFICER REPORT	PRESENTATION
7. ADJOURNMENT	ACTION

Access Services does not discriminate on the basis of disability. Accordingly, Access Services seeks to ensure that individuals with disabilities will have an equal opportunity to participate in the range of Access Services events and programs by providing appropriate auxiliary aids and services for communications. Primary consideration is given to the request of individuals with disabilities. However, the final decision belongs to Access Services. To help ensure the availability of any auxiliary aids and services you require, please make every effort to notify Access Services of your request at least three (3) business days (72 hours) prior to the meeting in which you wish to utilize those aids or services. You may do so by contacting (213) 270-6000.

Note: Access Services Board committee meetings are held pursuant to the Ralph M. Brown Act [Cal. Gov. Code §54950] and are open to the public. The public may view and obtain all written information supporting this agenda provided to the Board committee both initially and supplementally prior to the meeting at the agency's offices located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue, El Monte, California and on its website at <http://accessla.org>. Documents, including Power Point handouts distributed to the Board committee members by staff or Board committee members at the meeting, will simultaneously be made available to the public. Three opportunities are available for the public to address the Board committee during a Board committee meeting: (1) before closed session regarding matters to be discussed in closed session, (2) before a specific agenda item is debated and voted upon and (3) during the time allotted for general public comment. The exercise of the right to address the Board committee is subject to restriction as to time and appropriate decorum. All persons wishing to make public comment must fill out a goldenrod Public Comment Form and submit it to the Secretary of the Board. Public comment is generally limited to three (3) minutes per speaker and the total time available for public comment may be further limited at the discretion of the Chairperson. Persons whose speech is impaired such that they are unable to address the Board at a normal rate of speed may request an accommodation of a limited amount of additional time from the Chair but only by checking the appropriate box on the Public Comment Form. Granting such an accommodation is at the discretion of the Chair. The Board committee cannot and will not respond during the meeting to matters raised under general public comment. Pursuant to provisions of the Brown Act governing these proceedings, no discussion or action may be taken on these matters unless they are listed on the agenda, or unless certain emergency or special circumstances exist. However, the Board committee may direct staff to investigate and/or schedule certain matters for consideration at a future Board committee meeting and staff may respond to all public comments in writing prior to the next Board committee meeting.

### **Commitment to Civility**

To assure civility in its public meetings, staff and the public are also encouraged to engage in respectful dialog that supports freedom of speech and values diversity of

opinion. To achieve compliance with these Rules, Directors, staff, and the public are encouraged to:

- Create an atmosphere of respect and civility where Directors, staff, and the public are free to express their ideas;
- Establish and maintain a cordial and respectful atmosphere during discussions;
- Foster meaningful dialogue free of personal attacks;
- Listen with an open mind to all information, including dissenting points of view, regarding issues presented to the Board;
- Recognize that it is sometimes difficult to speak at Board meetings, and out of respect for each person's feelings, allow others to have their say without comment, including booing, whistling or clapping; and
- Adhere to speaking time limit.

Alternative accessible formats are available upon request.

### \*NOTE

The public may also participate via the Zoom webinar link, or by teleconference. Please review the procedures to do so as follows -

How to Provide Public Comment in a Board Meeting via Zoom

Online

1. Click the Zoom link for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at: [https://accessla.org/news\\_and\\_events/agendas.html](https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html). Make sure to use a current, up-to-date browser: Chrome 30+, Firefox 27+, Microsoft Edge 12+, or Safari 7+. Certain functionality may be disabled in older browsers including Internet Explorer. You may also use this direct link - <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/87876404886>
2. Enter an email address and your name. Your name will be visible online while you are speaking.
3. When the Committee Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, click on "raise hand." Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Mute all other audio before speaking. Using multiple devices can cause audio feedback.
4. Please note that the "Chat" feature is an accessibility tool for comments on items by committee members and the general public attendees who need to use this tool. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, then please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called, please limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

Note: Members of the public will not be shown on video.

#### By phone

1. Call the Zoom phone number and enter the webinar ID for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at:  
[https://accessla.org/news\\_and\\_events/agendas.html](https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html)
2. You can also call in using the following information -  
Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):  
US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 669 444 9171 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 719 359 4580 or +1 253 205 0468 or +1 386 347 5053 or +1 507 473 4847 or +1 564 217 2000 or +1 646 931 3860 or +1 689 278 1000 or +1 929 205 6099 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 305 224 1968 or +1 309 205 3325 or +1 312 626 6799 or +1 360 209 5623 or 833 548 0282 (Toll Free) or 877 853 5247 (Toll Free) or 888 788 0099 (Toll Free) or 833 548 0276 (Toll Free)  
Webinar ID: 878 7640 4886
3. When the Committee Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, press \*9 to raise a hand. Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called upon to speak. Speakers will be called by the last four digits of their phone number. Please note that phone numbers in their entirety will be visible online while speakers are speaking.
4. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called upon, please state your name and limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

SEPTEMBER 11, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: BRUCE FRINK, SENIOR MANAGER OF FINANCE  
VICENTE PENA, PROJECT ADMINISTRATOR  
BRIAN SELWYN, MANAGER OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM, CHANGE RATES AND INCREASE FUNDS - WEST/CENTRAL SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4031)

**ISSUE:**

Board action is required to exercise the final option years for the West/Central region service provider contract.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Authorize an increase in the contract value of \$70,253,807, a change of rates of compensation and an extension in the period of performance for two (2) years, from October 29, 2024 through October 28, 2026 with California Transit, Inc. (CTI).

**IMPACT ON BUDGET:**

This action is consistent with the budget estimates for the proposed contract’s two one-(1) year extensions.

Trip volume for ADA paratransit service is based on the projected number of trips calculated by Access’ former consultant, HDR Engineering Inc.

	Projected Trips
Year 8 (10/29/24-10/28/25)	639,700
Year 9 (10/29/25-10/28/26)	693,698

Payment terms of the contract will be a firm fixed monthly fee and a variable fixed rate per trip for ADA service. The proposed increase in the rates for ADA service for the two option years is based on three primary factors: the most recent three-month average of the year-over-year increase in the Consumer Price Index for the Los Angeles Area at the time rates were negotiated (3.6%); the fact that the volume of trips decreased by at

least 20% from the trip volume originally projected, which, per the subject contract, permits negotiation of the rate previously approved by the Board; and, finally, a significant increase in the monthly facility lease cost, which began in Year 6 of the contract.

Based on the above-stated factors, Access has negotiated an annual increase in the per trip rate of 4.87% in both Years 8 and 9 of the contract and an annual increase in the fixed monthly rate - which includes the aforementioned facility lease cost of 12.9% in Year 8 and 4.26% in Year 9. (The increase in the monthly fixed rate, excluding the facility lease, would be 4.58% in Year 8 and 4.60% in Year 9.) Finally, matching the most recent three-month average annual increase in the CPI, staff proposes an annual increase for both the Emergency Services Hourly Rate and the Braille Starter Hourly Salary of 3.6% in both Year 8 and Year 9 of the contract.

The following chart provides more detail on the proposed rate increases:

	Year 7 (10/29/23- 10/28/24)	Year 8 (10/29/24- 10/28/25)	Year 9 (10/29/25- 10/28/26)
ADA Service - Fixed (monthly)	\$582,436.41	\$657,571.00	\$685,584.00
ADA Service - Variable (per trip)	\$37.76	\$39.60	\$41.53
Emergency Services Hourly Rate	\$54.71	\$56.68	\$58.72
<i>Braille Starter Hourly Salary (Inc. in Fixed Rate)</i>	<i>\$19.71</i>	<i>\$20.41</i>	<i>\$21.15</i>

Based on the proposed rates of compensation and trip projections, the fully loaded cost per trip for ADA service in Years 8 and 9 of the subject contract will be \$51.93 and \$53.38, respectively, with no adjustment for Covid related rate increases. Factoring in the following: 1) 10% negotiated rate adjustment for trip volume falling below 80% of the trip volume state in the RFP; 2) wage increase for hourly staff; 3) Covid cleaning procedures and 4) taxi rate adjustment, the projected fully-loaded cost per trip for ADA service in Years 8 and 9 will be \$60.48 and \$62.43, respectively.

This action will result in an increase in the previously approved contract amount of \$206,629,803 to \$276,883,610. This is inclusive of an additional \$70,253,807 in funding to cover the projected increase in trips for FY25, FY26, and the first four months of FY27. The increase in the contract amount will be programmed into the FY25 budget and will be appropriately programmed for subsequent out-years.

The funding for these services comes from a combination of Measure M, Federal Section 5310, and Prop C Discretionary Funds.

**ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:**

The Board, at its discretion, may direct staff to issue an RFP for services in the West/Central Region. As the contractor has generally met its performance targets, staff does not recommend this option as pricing is likely to increase significantly.

**EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, staff will be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into an amendment of the existing contract with CTI, under terms that are no less favorable to Access Services than those proposed herein. Access Services would not be legally bound to this contract unless it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

**BACKGROUND:**

The West/Central region service contract, AS-4031, was awarded to CTI on May 15, 2017. The base term of the contract ran through October 28, 2022, and the contract allows for four (4) additional option years. Option years six (6) and seven (7) were exercised on December 14, 2021. This proposed action involves the exercise of the eighth and ninth (final) option years.

California Transit Inc. (CTI) has served the West Central service area since 2007. Early in FY23 CTI experienced the struggles of a tight labor market, which resulted in a slight decline in On Time Performance. However, CTI was able to overcome the hiring challenges by increasing wages and enhancing its recruiting and hiring practices. CTI creatively restructured its hiring and retention bonus and explored less traditional recruiting sources.

**Current Operational Performance**

Despite the earlier challenges, CTI met 8 out of 10 Key Performance Indicators in FY23 and has started FY 24 with strong numbers.

The contractor's performance results for FY23 and FY24 are listed below.

Key Performance Indicator	Standard	FY23	FY24 YTD*
On Time Performance	≥ 91%	89.3%	91.8%
Excessively Late Trips	≤ 0.10%	0.06%	0.01%
Denials	0	0	0
Access to Work On Time Performance	≥ 94%	96.0%	99.1%
Average Hold Time (Reservations)	≤ 120	35	39
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (Reservations)	≤ 5%	1.5%	2.4%
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (ETA)	≤ 10%	0.6%	0.4%
Complaints Per 1,000 Trips	≤ 4.0	3.1	2.8
Preventable Collisions per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.75	0.83	0.88
Miles Between Road Calls	≥ 25,000	28,740	**

\*Preliminary data through August 2023

\*\*Final numbers pending.



SEPTEMBER 11, 2023

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS, PERFORMANCE MONITORING COMMITTEE

FROM: BRUCE FRINK, SENIOR MANAGER, FINANCIAL PLANNING & ANALYSIS  
 JESSICA VOLANOS, PROJECT ADMINISTRATOR  
 BRIAN SELWYN, MANAGER OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM, CHANGE RATES AND INCREASE FUNDS - NORTHERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4059)

**ISSUE:**

Board action is required to exercise the second option year for the Northern region service provider contract.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Authorize an increase in the contract value of \$34,671,498, a change in rates of compensation, and an extension in the period of performance for one (1) year, from August 1, 2024, through July 31, 2025, for Contract AS-4059 with MV Transportation (MV).

**IMPACT ON BUDGET:**

This action is consistent with the budget estimates for the proposed contract’s one (1) year extension.

Trip volume for ADA paratransit service is based on the projected number of trips calculated by Access’ consultant HDR Engineering Inc.

	<b>Trips</b>
Year 7 (8/1/24-7/31/25)	472,267

Payment terms of the contract are a firm fixed monthly fee (Fixed) and a fixed rate per trip (Variable) for ADA service (please see table below). In addition, as delineated in the same table, the Contractor is compensated for two other services on an as-needed basis. As stipulated in the subject contract, the proposed increases in the rates of

compensation for the option year should not exceed the most recent three-month average of the year-over-year increase in the Consumer Price Index for the Los Angeles Area at the time rates were negotiated. (For the three most recent months for which data is published (March-May 2023), the average year-over-year increase in the CPI was 3.6% (*US Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics*)). In addition, per the contract, the fact that the volume of trips decreased by at least 20% from the originally projected trip volume allows the rate, previously approved by the Board, to be negotiated.

The current and proposed rates are as follows:

	<b>Current: Year 6 (8/23-7/24)</b>	<b>Proposed: Year 7 (8/24-7/25)</b>
ADA Service - Fixed (monthly)	\$921,678.71	\$954,859.14
ADA Service - Variable (per trip)	\$43.12	\$44.67
As Needed Service - Variable (per hour)	\$51.66	\$53.52
Ripple Text Notification - Fixed (monthly, as requested by Access)	\$649.20	\$672.57

Based on the proposed rates of compensation and trip projections, the fully loaded cost per trip for ADA service in Year 7 of the subject contract will be \$68.95, with no adjustment for COVID-19 related rate increases. Factoring in the following: 1) 10% negotiated rate adjustment for trip volume below 80% of the trip volume projected in the RFP; 2) wage increase for hourly staff; 3) COVID-19 cleaning procedures and 4) taxi rate adjustment, the projected fully loaded cost per trip for ADA service in Year 7 will be \$83.72.

This action will result in an increase of \$34,671,498 to the previously approved contract amount of \$185,989,905.

The funding for these services comes from a combination of Federal Section 5310, Measure M, and Prop C Discretionary Funds.

**ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:**

The Board, at its discretion, may direct staff to issue a request for proposals (RFP) for services in the Northern Region. As the contractor has generally met performance targets during its base contract term, staff does not recommend this option as pricing is likely to increase significantly through an open competitive process.

**EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

If this staff recommendation is approved, contingent on subsequent approval of the full Access Board, staff will be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into an amendment of the existing contract with MV Transportation, under terms that are no less favorable to Access Services than those proposed herein. Access Services would not be legally bound to this contract unless it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

### **BACKGROUND:**

The Northern Region service contract, AS-4059, commenced on May 1, 2018, with full service beginning on August 1, 2018. The base term of the contract runs through July 31, 2023, and the contract allows for four (4) additional option years. Staff is seeking approval for the second option year. At the direction of the Board, staff has prepared a Board report one year in advance of the contract's expiration to allow the Board and staff sufficient time to explore other avenues should the Board choose not to exercise the option year.

### **Current Operational Performance**

MV Transportation has served our Northern region customers for over 20 years and has been a dedicated partner to Access and the community. At the beginning of FY23, MV brought on General Manager Shawn Brophy, who continues to work to improve operational performance by increasing driver resources through MV's corporate recruiter and expanding MV's subcontract resources. One of those subcontractors is SilverRide, a transportation network company (TNC) that now has more than 75 drivers performing Access trips.

In conjunction with the FY23 budget, MV raised employee driver wages and currently has the highest starting driver wages (\$22.00 per hour) of any Access service contractor. MV is now fully staffed with drivers and has shown considerable progress in performance in FY23 and so far in FY24. The company is meeting all 13 KPIs as of the end of August 2023.

The contractor's performance results for FY23 and FY24 are listed below.

Key Performance Indicator	Standard	FY23	FY24*
On-Time Performance	≥ 91%	90.5%	93.7%
Excessively Late Trips	≤ 0.10%	0.10%	0.05%
Excessively Long Trips	≤ 5%	5.1%	3.3%
Missed Trips	≤ 0.75%	0.69%	0.56%
Denials	0	1	0
Access to Work On-Time Performance	≥ 94%	95.4%	99.0%
Average Initial Hold Time (Reservations)	≤ 120 seconds	83	114
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (Reservations)	≤ 5%	3.6%	4.3%
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (ETA)	≤ 10%	2.4%	6.7%
Complaints Per 1,000 Trips	≤ 4.0	3.6	2.8
Preventable Incidents per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.25	0.08	0.31
Preventable Collisions per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.75	0.55	0.66
Miles Between Road Calls	≥ 25,000	56,027	**

\*Preliminary data through 8/31/2023

\*\*Final numbers pending