

access

PERFORMANCE MONITORING COMMITTEE

Monday, September 19, 2022

11:00 a.m.

Webinar

Committee Members: D. Barnes, Chair
G. Gogreve
J. Troost

	<u>DISPOSITION</u>
1. CALL TO ORDER	ACTION
2. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT	INFORMATION
3. CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM AND CHANGE RATES - NORTHERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4059) (page 5)	ACTION
4. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD TRAVEL TRAINING CONTRACT (AS-4157) (page 8)	ACTION
5. PERFORMANCE UPDATE	PRESENTATION
6. CHIEF OPERATIONS OFFICER REPORT	PRESENTATION
7. ADJOURNMENT	ACTION

Access Services does not discriminate on the basis of disability. Accordingly, Access Services seeks to ensure that individuals with disabilities will have an equal opportunity to participate in the range of Access Services events and programs by providing appropriate auxiliary aids and services for communications. Primary consideration is given to the request of individuals with disabilities. However, the final decision belongs to Access Services. To help ensure the availability of any auxiliary aids and services you require, please make every effort to notify Access Services of your request at least three (3) business days (72 hours) prior to the meeting in which you wish to utilize those aids or services. You may do so by contacting (213) 270-6000.

Note: Access Services Board committee meetings are held pursuant to the Ralph M. Brown Act [Cal. Gov. Code §54950] and are open to the public. The public may view and obtain all written

information supporting this agenda provided to the Board committee both initially and supplementally prior to the meeting at the agency's offices located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue, El Monte, California and on its website at <http://accessla.org>. Documents, including Power Point handouts distributed to the Board committee members by staff or Board committee members at the meeting, will simultaneously be made available to the public. Three opportunities are available for the public to address the Board committee during a Board committee meeting: (1) before closed session regarding matters to be discussed in closed session, (2) before a specific agenda item is debated and voted upon and (3) during the time allotted for general public comment. The exercise of the right to address the Board committee is subject to restriction as to time and appropriate decorum. All persons wishing to make public comment must fill out a goldenrod Public Comment Form and submit it to the Secretary of the Board. Public comment is generally limited to three (3) minutes per speaker and the total time available for public comment may be further limited at the discretion of the Chairperson. Persons whose speech is impaired such that they are unable to address the Board at a normal rate of speed may request an accommodation of a limited amount of additional time from the Chair but only by checking the appropriate box on the Public Comment Form. Granting such an accommodation is at the discretion of the Chair. The Board committee cannot and will not respond during the meeting to matters raised under general public comment. Pursuant to provisions of the Brown Act governing these proceedings, no discussion or action may be taken on these matters unless they are listed on the agenda, or unless certain emergency or special circumstances exist. However, the Board committee may direct staff to investigate and/or schedule certain matters for consideration at a future Board committee meeting and staff may respond to all public comments in writing prior to the next Board committee meeting.

Commitment to Civility

To assure civility in its public meetings, staff and the public are also encouraged to engage in respectful dialog that supports freedom of speech and values diversity of opinion. To achieve compliance with these Rules, Directors, staff, and the public are encouraged to:

- Create an atmosphere of respect and civility where Directors, staff, and the public are free to express their ideas;
- Establish and maintain a cordial and respectful atmosphere during discussions;
- Foster meaningful dialogue free of personal attacks;
- Listen with an open mind to all information, including dissenting points of view, regarding issues presented to the Board;
- Recognize that it is sometimes difficult to speak at Board meetings, and out of respect for each person's feelings, allow others to have their say without comment, including booing, whistling or clapping; and
- Adhere to speaking time limit.

Alternative accessible formats are available upon request.

***NOTE**

NOTICE OF ALTERNATIVE PUBLIC COMMENT PROCEDURES

Pursuant to temporary revised Brown Act requirements, Board committee members will be participating via webinar. The public may submit written comments on any item on the agenda - 1) through email by addressing it to - board@accessla.org or 2) via US Postal mail by addressing it to - Access Services Board Comments, PO Box 5728, El Monte CA 91734. Please include your name, item number and comments in the correspondence. Comments must be submitted/received no later than 9:00 am on Monday, September 19, 2022 so they can be read into the record as appropriate.

The public may also participate via the Zoom webinar link, or by teleconference. Please review the procedures to do so as follows -

How to Provide Public Comment in a Board Meeting via Zoom

Online

1. Click the Zoom link for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at: https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html. Make sure to use a current, up-to-date browser: Chrome 30+, Firefox 27+, Microsoft Edge 12+, or Safari 7+. Certain functionality may be disabled in older browsers including Internet Explorer. You may also use this direct link - <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/89727990046>
2. Enter an email address and your name. Your name will be visible online while you are speaking.
3. When the Committee Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, click on "raise hand." Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Mute all other audio before speaking. Using multiple devices can cause audio feedback.
4. Please note that the "Chat" feature is an accessibility tool for comments on items by committee members and the general public attendees who need to use this tool. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, then please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called, please limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

Note: Members of the public will not be shown on video.

By phone

1. Call the Zoom phone number and enter the webinar ID for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at: https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html
2. You can also call in using the following information -
Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):
US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 929 205 6099 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 312 626 6799 or 833 548 0276 (Toll Free) or 833 548 0282 (Toll Free) or 877 853 5247 (Toll Free) or 888 788 0099 (Toll Free)
Webinar ID: 897 2799 0046
3. When the Committee Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, press *9 to raise a hand. Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called upon to speak. Speakers will be

called by the last four digits of their phone number. Please note that phone numbers in their entirety will be visible online while speakers are speaking.

4. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called upon, please state your name and limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

SEPTEMBER 12, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS, PERFORMANCE MONITORING COMMITTEE

**FROM: BRUCE FRINK, SENIOR MANAGER, FINANCIAL PLANNING & ANALYSIS
ROGELIO GOMEZ, SENIOR MANAGER OF OPERATIONS
BRIAN SELWYN, MANAGER OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION**

RE: CONSIDERATION TO EXTEND TERM AND CHANGE RATES - NORTHERN REGION SERVICE PROVIDER CONTRACT (AS-4059)

ISSUE:

The Northern Region service area base contract period will end on July 31, 2023 and Board action is required to approve the first option year.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize a change in rates of compensation, and an extension in the period of performance for one (1) year, from August 1, 2023, through July 31, 2024, for Contract AS-4059 with MV Transportation (MV).

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

This action is consistent with the budget estimates for the proposed contract's one (1) year extension.

Trip volume for ADA paratransit service is based on the projected number of trips calculated by Access' consultant HDR Engineering Inc.

Trip Growth	Trips	% Decrease
Year 6 (8/1/23-7/31/24)	441,814	(48.8%)

Payment terms of the contract are a firm fixed monthly fee (Fixed) and a fixed rate per trip (Variable) for ADA service (please see table below). In addition, as delineated in the same table, the Contractor is compensated for two other services on an as-needed basis. As stipulated in the subject contract, the proposed increases in the rates of compensation for the option year may be no greater than the most recent three-month average of the year-over-year increase in the Consumer Price Index for the Los Angeles Area at the time rates were negotiated. For the three most recent months for which data is published (April-June 2022), the average year-over-year increase in the CPI was 8.17% (*US Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics*).

The current and proposed rates are as follows:

	Current (8/22-7/23)	Year 6 (8/23-7/24)
ADA Service - Fixed (monthly)	\$852,065.00	\$921,678.71
ADA Service - Variable (per trip)	\$39.86	\$43.12
As Needed Service - Variable (per hour)	\$47.76	\$51.66
Ripple Text Notification - Fixed (monthly, as requested by Access)	\$600.17	\$649.20

Based on the proposed rates of compensation and trip projections, the fully loaded cost per trip for ADA service in Year 6 of the subject contract will be \$68.17.

This action will not result in an increase in the previously approved contract amount of \$185,989,905.

The funding for these services comes from a combination of Federal Section 5310, Measure M, and Prop C Discretionary Funds.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

The Board, at its discretion, may direct staff to issue a request for proposal (RFP) for services in the Northern Region. As the contractor has generally met performance targets during its base contract term, staff does not recommend this option as pricing is likely to increase through an open competitive process.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved, contingent on subsequent approval of the full Access Board, staff will be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into an amendment of the existing contract with MV Transportation, under terms that are no less favorable to Access Services than those proposed herein. Access Services would not be legally bound to this contract unless it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity’s legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

The Northern Region service contract, AS-4059, commenced on May 1, 2018, with full service beginning on August 1, 2018. The base term of the contract runs through July 31, 2023 and allows for four (4) additional option years, the first of which is sought for approval. At the direction of the Board, staff has prepared a Board report one year in advance of the contract's expiration to allow the Board and staff sufficient time to vet other avenues should the Board choose not to exercise the option year.

Current Operational Performance

The contractor's performance results for FY22 and FY23 are listed below.

Key Performance Indicator	Standard	FY22	FY23*
On-Time Performance	≥ 91%	87.1%	90.7%
Excessively Late Trips	≤ 0.10%	0.30%	0.07%
Excessively Long Trips	≤ 5%	3.3%	4.0%
Missed Trips	≤ 0.75%	0.91%	0.75%
Denials	0	1	0
Access to Work On-Time Performance	≥ 94%	97.3%	97.9%
Average Initial Hold Time (Reservations)	≤ 120 seconds	99	84
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (Reservations)	≤ 5%	6.3%	4.1%
Calls On Hold > 5 Min (ETA)	≤ 10%	3.0%	1.8%
Complaints Per 1,000 Trips	≤ 4.0	3.6	4.0
Preventable Incidents per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.25	0.11	0.00
Preventable Collisions per 100,000 miles	≤ 0.75	0.59	0.35
Miles Between Road Calls	≥ 25,000	54,211	43,279**

* Through 8/31/2022

**Through July 2022

In FY22, the Northern Region contractor experienced significant operational challenges due to the COVID-19 pandemic and certain labor market conditions, including a reduction in available taxi subcontractors and difficulties in hiring employee drivers. In the past year, MV has added two new subcontractors to assist them with operational performance; one of those subcontractors is SilverRide, a transportation network company (TNC) that now has a dozen drivers doing Access trips. In conjunction with the FY23 budget, MV raised employee driver wages and currently has the highest starting driver wages (\$22.00 per hour) of any Access contractor. MV is now fully staffed with drivers and has shown considerable progress in performance so far in FY23, meeting 12 of 13 KPIs as of the end of August 2022.

SEPTEMBER 12, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

**FROM: ERIC HAACK, STRATEGIC PLANNER
BRIAN SELWYN, MANAGER OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT
ADMINISTRATION**

RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD TRAVEL TRAINING CONTRACT (AS-4157)

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to exercise the award of a travel training services contract.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute Contract No. AS-4157 with Mobility Management Partners, Inc. (MMP) for travel training services in an amount not-to-exceed \$7,363,504.44 for a five-year period beginning March 1, 2023.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The costs associated with this contract will be appropriately budgeted in FY 2023 and the subsequent out years. The funding for this service is allocated from local funds and the level of expenditure remains within the expected levels. At Access' sole discretion, this contract may be extended for up to three (3) additional years in one-year increments.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

No alternatives were considered. Over the past two decades, Access staff has learned that travel training is an important tool to enhance customer mobility options and reduce overall paratransit trip demand by providing specialized instruction to Access-eligible customers on how to safely and effectively navigate local public transit resources. Travel training is a specialized field that requires experience working with persons with physical and cognitive disabilities and also a familiarity with local transit resources and ADA regulations. Access does not possess the in-house expertise to perform this function and thus the engagement of a firm possessing this technical expertise is truly warranted.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a written agreement upon terms and conditions no less favorable to

Access than those proposed herein. Access would not be legally bound to the contract herein proposed unless and until it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

As stated above, travel training is an important tool that enhances customer mobility options and reduces overall paratransit trip demand by providing instruction on public transit resources to Access-eligible customers. This does not prevent Access-eligible customers from using Access, but it gives these customers an option of choosing fixed route for some of their trips when they are physically able to do so. Travel training provides information on how an individual can safely and confidently use bus and rail services that that person may never have utilized before.

Individual travel training provides one-on-one instruction with an instructor and an Access-eligible customer (and their personal care attendant or companion if desired). Training is provided so a customer may take a bus and/or rail route to reach a destination that the customer would otherwise reach using Access. Understanding how to use fixed route to reach this, and other, destinations encourages the Access customer to rely less on Access for their travel needs.

Access staff has regularly analyzed the results of travel training by examining the post-training data provided by Access' contractor as well as using Access trip and Free Fare TAP data. The results generally reveal that customers who complete travel training sessions will use fixed route resources for some of their trips and utilize paratransit resources less frequently than the average paratransit-riding customer.

The contractor was asked to provide the following work:

- 1) **Individual Travel Training** - The contractor will be responsible for conducting three hundred (300) one-on-one individual travel trainings in the first year and up to five hundred (500) one-on-one individual travel trainings in the fifth year. In light of the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic, Access has permitted the contractor to separate the full travel trainings into a virtual travel training for instruction that can be provided over a remote (i.e. Zoom-like) meeting and an in-person section for elements where an instructor need be present (i.e. accompanying the trainee on-board a bus trip). These trainings will provide instructions and in-the-field experience to Access-eligible customers to develop the skills and confidence necessary to use accessible fixed route public transportation. The contractor will also conduct follow-up telephone surveys with graduates of the individual travel training programs at 1 week, 1 month, 2 month and 6 month intervals to respond to any questions the graduate may have and to record the frequency that the graduate is using fixed route following the training.
- 2) **Orientation and Mobility Training** - The contractor will provide up to twelve (12) trainings annually for customers with a visual impairment.
- 3) **Group Travel Training (Optional)** - Access may request that the contractor provide up to twenty (20) group travel training workshops per year, if demand for such workshops is demonstrated by a community, social service agency, or similar organization.
- 4) **Travel Buddy Pilot (Optional)** - The contractor, at Access' request, may be tasked with providing up to twelve (12) annual travel trainings to persons with disabilities through a program similar to LA Metro's *On the Move Riders Program*.

- 5) **Outreach Meetings** - The contractor is expected to conduct an average of twelve (12) outreach meetings per year.
- 6) **Call Center Calls** - The contractor will conduct up to 39,000 calls to recent Access eligibility applicants in order to learn more about the applicant and gauge their interest in receiving travel training, as well as Access customers who are Medi-Cal eligible to provide them with alternative transportation resources that are available to them through their health insurance coverage.

The contractor will also provide monthly documentation of the results of their Individual Travel Trainings, post-training telephone surveys, and Post-Eligibility Evaluation calls. This data will assist with Access’ ongoing evaluation of the success of the Travel Training program.

Procurement Overview

A Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued on April 14, 2022, to all vendors registered on the Access’ website. The RFP was also posted on Access’ eProcurement system, *Public Purchase*. Questions from potential proposers were received and one addendum, containing responses to questions, was issued on May 11, 2022.

One proposal was received from Management Partners (MMP), who is currently providing this service for Access. Shortly after the deadline for receipt of proposals, a market survey was conducted to determine the reasons why firms who downloaded the RFP ultimately decided not to submit a proposal. Of the 143 firms who downloaded the RFP, including firms certified as a disadvantaged business by one or more government jurisdictions, the primary reasons for not submitting a proposal fell into two categories: the firm did not have sufficient staffing needed to undertake the work or the firm did not have the needed expertise, regardless of staffing, to undertake the work.

While MMP does not qualify as a disadvantaged business, we did work with our consultant, GCAP, to ensure that the solicitation was made known to firms which are so certified.

A request for clarification and a Best and Final Offer was issued on June 29, 2022.

MMP’s proposal was carefully reviewed and deemed responsive and the firm responsible. The proposal was evaluated by a panel comprised of two (2) Access in-house staff and one (1) outside rater who is from a transportation agency in an adjacent county. Following are the criteria used to evaluate the proposal and the scores provided by the members of the evaluation panel.

	Evaluation Criteria	Weight	Score
1	Qualifications and Availability of Proposed Staff	40%	36.00
2	Quality of Technical Approach	30%	27.90
3	Qualifications of the Firm	15%	14.25
4	Cost/Price of Proposal (Per BAFO)	15%	15.00
	Total	100%	93.15

Financial Overview

MMP's price for the five-year base term was determined to be fair and reasonable based upon financial analysis, including consideration of the Los Angeles area year-over-year cost of living increase; a comparison of proposed rates of compensation and the current rates for the same service; fact-finding; and an Independent Cost Analysis.

MMP has proposed a cost not-to-exceed \$7,363,504.44 for the contract five-year base-term. The cost components of the contract are as follows:

COST CATEGORY	PROPOSED RATE YEAR 1	CURRENT RATE	RATE CHANGE	AVG. RATE CHANGE OVER FIVE YEARS
FIXED RATES				
Start-Up Costs	\$12,000.00	N/A	N/A	N/A
Monthly Fixed Fee	\$27,855.40	\$25,320.39	10.01%	4.81%
VARIABLE RATES				
Individual Travel Training: Virtual	\$479.20	\$456.86	4.89%	-1.19%
Individual Travel Training: In-Person	\$1,118.15	\$1,066.02	4.89%	-1.19%
O&M Training	\$3,816.00	Not Offered	N/A	4.81%
Outreach Meetings	\$477.11	Not Offered	N/A	4.78%
Call-Center Calls	\$8.13	\$7.70	5.58%	4.78%
<i>Optional Group Travel Training</i>	\$1,769.57	\$1,716.29	3.10%	4.81%
<i>Optional Travel Buddy Pilot</i>	\$2,854.15	Not Offered	N/A	4.81%

As demonstrated in the preceding table, the proposed increase in the variable rates for cost categories that are found in the current Travel Training contract compares favorably with the most recent year-over-year increase in the Consumer Price Index for the Los Angeles area of 8.60% (*U.S. Consumer Price Index, Los Angeles Region, June 2022.*)

The proposed start-up cost, which covers the purchase of office equipment, including workstations, computers, phones, licenses and miscellaneous electronic equipment needed to meet the need for staff expansion under the new scope of work, are considered fair and reasonable. The proposed increase in the monthly fixed fee, which is 1.41% above the change in the CPI, is also considered fair and reasonable given the greater demand for staffing, including a full time Call Center Manager.

After the first year of the contract, MMP is proposing a modest annual increase of no more than 4.81% in any one cost category. The rate for the two individual travel training cost categories, which makes up nearly half of the total annual contract cost, actually declines an average of 1.19% per year.

Overview of Recommended Proposer

Mobility Management Partners (MMP) is a private, non-profit company headquartered in Camarillo, California that has been in business since 2009. MMP is a division of R&D Transportation Services, Inc., a provider of transportation management and consulting services to regional centers and school districts throughout California and elsewhere.

MMP and Access have a long and successful relationship in the field of travel training and providing mobility management solutions for Access customers. MMP has been a partner with Access since 2008 and throughout that time, MMP has worked closely with Access to provide useful information about alternative transportation services to Access customers.

Through this partnership, Access and MMP have been able to develop - and refine - analysis of the ways in which successful Travel Training program can impact Access' paratransit service. MMP and Access have developed analyses that have been shared with other industry partners (most recently at the Autumn 2021 CalACT conference). These analyses have revealed that persons who are provided with the knowledge and confidence to use fixed route buses and trains for some of their trips will often make use of such services, thus reducing the demand for paratransit trips.

MMP is a recognized national leader in the field of travel training, with many partnerships throughout southern California. In addition to MMP's solid partnership with Access, the former also operates travel training services for the Orange County Transportation Authority (OCTA) and provides paratransit eligibility services for the Ventura County Transportation Commission (VCTC). Further demonstrating their breadth of experience in the field of paratransit, MMP provides the equivalent of Access' Marking and Tethering service for L.A. Metro's Safely Transporting All Riders (STAR) program.

Outside of southern California, MMP, in partnership with Transdev, recently began providing travel training services for Chicago's Regional Transportation Authority (RTA).

Over the years, MMP and Access have developed an excellent working relationship. This relationship has been very helpful when circumstances have required MMP to modify their model in order to reflect changes in Access' own operating model or larger changes in the global environment

When Access was interested in developing Group Travel Training workshops that had not existed before in Los Angeles County, MMP and Access were able to work together to develop a new service, designing practices for this new program so that it could succeed.

More recently, when the COVID-19 pandemic impacted all aspects of life in southern California, Access and MMP worked together to develop a modified one-on-one travel training service. This modified service was developed around the concept of reducing the amount of time that Access customers and MMP may operate in the same space. Virtual (i.e. Zoom) meetings were developed where important instruction could be provided while both trainer and trainee were safely separated from one another. Finally, during the height of the COVID-19 pandemic, MMP served as a valuable resource, providing information to Access customers on how to travel to COVID testing sites, when Access was not permitted to provide transportation to these facilities.

Given MMP's well-documented expertise in the field and their long-standing and successful relationship with Access, staff supports the recommendation of the evaluation panel to have MMP continue to serve as Access' travel training services contractor.