

access

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

Monday, November 14, 2022

12:30 p.m.

Webinar

Committee Members: L. Burner, Chair
A. Aguilar
M. Gombert

	<u>DISPOSITION</u>
1. CALL TO ORDER	ACTION
2. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT	INFORMATION
3. CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE 2023 BOARD CALENDAR (page 5)	ACTION
4. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD DEMAND FORECASTING SERVICES CONTRACT (AS-4161) (page 8)	ACTION
5. SCOPE OF WORK REVIEW - EASTERN REGION	PRESENTATION
6. ADJOURNMENT	ACTION

Access Services does not discriminate on the basis of disability. Accordingly, Access Services seeks to ensure that individuals with disabilities will have an equal opportunity to participate in the range of Access Services events and programs by providing appropriate auxiliary aids and services for communications. Primary consideration is given to the request of individuals with disabilities. However, the final decision belongs to Access Services. To help ensure the availability of any auxiliary aids and services you require, please make every effort to notify Access Services of your request at least three (3) business days (72 hours) prior to the meeting in which you wish to utilize those aids or services. You may do so by contacting (213) 270-6000.

Note: Access Services Board committee meetings are held pursuant to the Ralph M. Brown Act [Cal. Gov. Code §54950] and are open to the public. The public may view and obtain all written information supporting this agenda provided to the Board committee both initially and supplementally prior to the meeting at the agency's offices located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue, El Monte, California and on its website at <http://accessla.org>. Documents, including Power Point handouts distributed to the Board committee members by staff or Board committee members at the meeting, will simultaneously be made available to the public. Three opportunities are available for the public to address the Board committee during a Board committee meeting: (1) before closed session regarding matters to be discussed in closed session, (2) before a specific agenda item is debated and voted upon and (3) during the time allotted for general public comment. The exercise of the right to address the Board committee is subject to restriction as to time and appropriate decorum. All persons wishing to make public comment must fill out a goldenrod Public Comment Form and submit it to the Secretary of the Board. Public comment is generally limited to three (3) minutes per speaker and the total time available for public comment may be further limited at the discretion of the Chairperson. Persons whose speech is impaired such that they are unable to address the Board at a normal rate of speed may request an accommodation of a limited amount of additional time from the Chair but only by checking the appropriate box on the Public Comment Form. Granting such an accommodation is at the discretion of the Chair. The Board committee cannot and will not respond during the meeting to matters raised under general public comment. Pursuant to provisions of the Brown Act governing these proceedings, no discussion or action may be taken on these matters unless they are listed on the agenda, or unless certain emergency or special circumstances exist. However, the Board committee may direct staff to investigate and/or schedule certain matters for consideration at a future Board committee meeting and staff may respond to all public comments in writing prior to the next Board committee meeting.

Commitment to Civility

To assure civility in its public meetings, staff and the public are also encouraged to engage in respectful dialog that supports freedom of speech and values diversity of opinion. To achieve compliance with these Rules, Directors, staff, and the public are encouraged to:

- Create an atmosphere of respect and civility where Directors, staff, and the public are free to express their ideas;
- Establish and maintain a cordial and respectful atmosphere during discussions;
- Foster meaningful dialogue free of personal attacks;
- Listen with an open mind to all information, including dissenting points of view, regarding issues presented to the Board;

- Recognize that it is sometimes difficult to speak at Board meetings, and out of respect for each person's feelings, allow others to have their say without comment, including booing, whistling or clapping; and
- Adhere to speaking time limit.

Alternative accessible formats are available upon request.

***NOTE**

NOTICE OF ALTERNATIVE PUBLIC COMMENT PROCEDURES

Pursuant to temporary revised Brown Act requirements, Board committee members will be participating via webinar. The public may submit written comments on any item on the agenda - 1) through email by addressing it to - board@accessla.org or 2) via US Postal mail by addressing it to - Access Services Board Comments, PO Box 5728, El Monte CA 91734. Please include your name, item number and comments in the correspondence. Comments must be submitted/received no later than 9:00 am on Monday, November 14, 2022 so they can be read into the record as appropriate.

The public may also participate via the Zoom webinar link, or by teleconference. Please review the procedures to do so as follows -

How to Provide Public Comment in a Board Meeting via Zoom

Online

1. Click the Zoom link for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at: https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html. Make sure to use a current, up-to-date browser: Chrome 30+, Firefox 27+, Microsoft Edge 12+, or Safari 7+. Certain functionality may be disabled in older browsers including Internet Explorer. You may also use this direct link - <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/83347916891>
2. Enter an email address and your name. Your name will be visible online while you are speaking.
3. When the Committee Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, click on "raise hand." Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Mute all other audio before speaking. Using multiple devices can cause audio feedback.
4. Please note that the "Chat" feature is an accessibility tool for comments on items by committee members and the general public attendees who need to use this tool. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, then please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called, please limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

Note: Members of the public will not be shown on video.

By phone

1. Call the Zoom phone number and enter the webinar ID for the meeting you wish to join. Meeting information can be found at:
https://accessla.org/news_and_events/agendas.html
2. You can also call in using the following information -
Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):
US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 669 444 9171 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 719 359 4580
or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 564 217 2000 or +1 646 931 3860 or +1 929 205 6099
or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 309 205 3325 or +1 312 626 6799 or +1 360 209 5623
or +1 386 347 5053 or 833 548 0282 (Toll Free) or 877 853 5247 (Toll Free) or 888
788 0099 (Toll Free) or 833 548 0276 (Toll Free)
Webinar ID: 833 4791 6891
3. When the Committee Chair calls for the item on which you wish to speak, press *9 to raise a hand. Speakers will be notified shortly before they are called to speak. Speakers will be called by the last four digits of their phone number. Please note that phone numbers in their entirety will be visible online while speakers are speaking.
4. If you cannot use the "raise hand" feature, the please submit a written comment as outlined above.
5. When called, please state your name and limit your remarks to three minutes. An audio signal will sound at the three-minute mark and the Chair will have the discretion to mute you at any point after that. After the comment has been given, the microphone for the speaker's Zoom profile will be muted.

NOVEMBER 7, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS
FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION
RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE 2023 BOARD CALENDAR

ISSUE:

Staff is presenting to the Board for its review and approval the attached list of scheduled Board and Standing Committee Meetings for calendar year 2023.

RECOMMENDATION:

Review and approve the proposed Board and Standing Committee Meeting calendar for 2023.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

None.

DISCUSSION:

The standing committee structure dictates an alternating monthly schedule for the committee and full Board meetings.

All meetings, with the exception of the Annual meeting, are scheduled to take place at Access Services located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue in El Monte. However, due to pandemic conditions, all meetings will be held virtually until further notice.

2023 Meeting Calendar

Annual

Date	Meeting Type	Time
Wednesday November 1 st	Annual Meeting*	11:00 am

*At California Endowment Center

Board

<u>Date</u>	<u>Meeting Type</u>	<u>Time</u>
Monday February 27 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday April 17 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday June 26 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday August 28 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday October 23 rd	Board Meeting	12:00 pm
Monday December 18 th	Board Meeting	12:00 pm

Committees

<u>Date</u>	<u>Meeting Type</u>	<u>Time</u>
Monday March 6 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Monday May 1 st	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Wednesday July 5 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Tuesday September 5 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Monday October 30 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm
Tuesday December 19 th	Board Operations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm

<u>Date</u>	<u>Meeting Type</u>	<u>Time</u>
Monday January 23 rd	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday March 27 th	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday May 22 nd	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday July 24 th	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday September 18 th	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm
Monday November 27 th	Performance Monitoring Planning and Development External/Stakeholder Relations	11:00 am - 12:00 pm 12:30 pm - 1:30 pm 2:00 pm - 3:00 pm

NOVEMBER 7, 2022

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

**FROM: MATTHEW AVANCENA, DIRECTOR, PLANING AND COORDINATION
KIMBERLIE NIMORI, PROCUREMENT COORDINATOR**

**RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD DEMAND FORECASTING SERVICES
CONTRACT (AS-4161)**

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to exercise the award of a demand (ridership) forecasting services contract.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute Contract No. AS-4161 with Hollingsworth Consulting LLC (Hollingsworth) for demand forecasting services in an amount not-to-exceed \$250,000 for a five-year period beginning July 1, 2023.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The costs associated with this contract will be appropriately budgeted for FY 2023 and the subsequent out years and includes a contingency of \$29,600 for other services. The funding for this service is allocated from local Proposition C sales tax funds. At Access' sole discretion, this contract may be extended for up to five (5) additional years in one-year increments.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

None. As the ADA Complementary Paratransit provider for L.A. County, Access is obligated to forecast ridership demand based on sound economic, demographic, statistical and scientific principles and use that forecast to design and implement its service to meet all forecasted demand. Staff does not possess the expertise to perform this function in-house.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a written agreement upon terms and conditions no less favorable to Access than those proposed herein. Access would not be legally bound to the contract herein proposed unless and until it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

On May 20, 2013, the Board approved staff's recommendation to award Contract No. AS-3393 for demand forecasting services to HDR Engineering, Inc. for a five base year period with the option to extend the term for an additional five years in one-year increments. All options have been exercised and Contract No. AS-3393 expires on June 30, 2023.

Access staff released an RFP in order to find a firm capable of providing ridership demand projections on an on-going basis. Part of the impetus for originally soliciting such assistance involved the issuance of a clarification letter on October 25, 2002, by the U.S. Department of Justice on behalf of the Department of Transportation in the case of *Anderson, et al. v. Rochester-Genesee Regional Transp. Auth., et al.* That letter made clear the federal regulatory interpretation that transit agencies must "design, fund, and implement a next-day service to meet the foreseeable needs of all ADA-eligible individuals," generally referred to as the "zero denials" rule. Staff believes it necessary to continue to receive assistance to project passenger demand, based on sound economic, demographic, statistical and scientific principles to the maximum extent possible. Staff has utilized ridership projections developed by a consulting firm since 2003.

Ridership projections developed by the consultant are needed to establish Access' annual operating budget including the development of its Short Range and/or Long-Range Transportation Plans. In the past, staff has asked the consulting firm to analyze the impacts on ADA ridership when FTA implemented its Origin-to-Destination service, the economic downturn from 2007 to 2009 after the bursting of the U.S. housing bubble and the global financial crisis (the Great Recession), the COVID-19 pandemic and other socio-economic and demographic changes in the County.

Other forecasting services that staff may request from the consultant include the continuing impacts of COVID-19 on Access' ridership, potential fare changes from the County's largest fixed route provider L.A. Metro, a possible economic recession in the near term, the 2026 FIFA World Cup and the L.A. Summer Olympics in 2028.

Procurement Overview

On August 22, 2022, Access issued Request for Proposals (RFP) No. AS-4161 to select a qualified consultant to conduct and develop a comprehensive forecasting methodology for ADA complementary paratransit ridership and eligibility projections in Los Angeles County. Over 200 companies either clicked on or downloaded the RFP from either the Access website or from the nationwide e-procurement service, Public Purchase. We also worked with our consultant GCAP to ensure that the solicitation was made known to firms which are certified as a disadvantaged business by one or more government jurisdictions. Access issued one addenda, providing responses to proposer questions. By the September 21, 2022 deadline, Access received proposals from the following firms:

1. HDR Engineering, Inc. (HDR)
2. Hollingsworth Consulting LLC (Hollingsworth) (SBE)

Both proposals were deemed responsive and the proposers responsible. As part of their proposals, the proposers (both prime contractors and if applicable, their subcontractors) were also asked to provide information regarding their status as a disadvantaged business, indicating whether they were certified in one or more the following categories: Small Business Enterprise, Women Business Enterprise, Disadvantaged Business Enterprise, Minority Business Enterprise, Disabled Veterans Business Enterprise, or other. Hollingsworth reported being certified as a Small Business Enterprise.

Shortly after the deadline for receipt of proposals, a market survey was conducted to determine the reasons why firms who downloaded the RFP ultimately decided not to submit a proposal. Of the firms who downloaded the RFP, the primary reasons for not submitting a proposal fell into two categories: the firm did not have sufficient staffing needed to undertake the work or work involved was outside of their area of expertise, regardless of staffing, to undertake the work.

A request for clarification and a Best and Final Offer were issued on October 11, 2022.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and associated weights:

Evaluation Criteria	Maximum
1. Technical expertise and experience of proposed consultant staff	45
2. Understanding of the issues and of the local and Federal environments	30
3. Ability to meet project deadlines	15
4. Cost Proposal Reasonableness, including allocation of cost elements	10
TOTAL	100

An evaluation panel was convened and a comprehensive technical evaluation by three members of Access staff followed. During the period from September 21, 2022 through October 18, 2022, the evaluation panel conducted its evaluation of the proposals. Based on the evaluation criteria, Hollingsworth ranked the highest. A summary of scores is set forth below.

Evaluation Criteria	HDR	Hollingsworth
1. Technical expertise and experience of proposed consultant staff	35.85	35.85
2. Understanding of the issues and of the local and Federal environments	24.20	21.70
3. Ability to meet project deadlines	8.00	12.25
4. Cost Proposal	8.56	10.00
TOTAL	76.61	79.80

COST ANALYSIS

Hollingsworth's price for the five-year base term was determined to be fair and reasonable. In addition to proposing the lowest cost, the final negotiated cost proposed by Hollingsworth for the five-year base period is lower than the Independent Cost Estimate of \$410,662.

Hollingsworth's proposed average hourly rate of \$100.00 for the five-year base term is lower than the current average hourly rate of \$143.69 and compares favorably with the

most recent year-over-year increase in the Consumer Price Index for the Los Angeles area of 7.8% (*U.S. Consumer Price Index, Los Angeles Region, September 2022*).

Proposer	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Five Year Total
HDR	\$55,112.91	\$48,211.52	\$49,754.29	\$51,346.43	\$52,989.51	\$257,414.66
Hollingsworth	\$45,200.00	\$43,800.00	\$43,800.00	\$43,800.00	\$43,800.00	\$220,400.00

RECOMMENDED CONTRACTOR

Hollingsworth Consulting LLC’s primary areas of expertise include data analytics and Lean Six Sigma processes. The project team consists of Brad Hollingsworth, PE who will serve as the Project Manager and Dusan Sormaz, PhD who will serve as the technical lead.

Brad Hollingsworth is a certified Lean Six Sigma Master Black Belt and registered Professional Engineer. He brings nearly two decades of experience leading improvement projects in the manufacturing, healthcare, and public service sectors.

Dusan Sormaz, PhD is the owner of IMPSystems LLC. He brings over 27 years of experience as a Professor of Industrial and Systems Engineering at Ohio University. Sormaz earned his doctorate in Industrial and Systems Engineering from the University of Southern California (USC) as well as a master’s degree in Computer Science at USC.