

access

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

MONDAY, APRIL 23, 2018

Closed Session: 12:00 p.m.

General Session: Immediately Following

**The meeting is expected to end by or
before 3:00 p.m.**

ACCESS SERVICES HEADQUARTERS

Council Conference Room, 3rd Floor

3449 Santa Anita Avenue

El Monte CA 91731

MISSION STATEMENT

***Access Services promotes access to all modes of
transportation and provides quality and safe ADA paratransit
service on behalf of public transit agencies in Los Angeles
County.***

**3650 Fairland Boulevard
Los Angeles, CA 90043**

	<u>DISPOSITION</u>
1. CALL TO ORDER	ACTION
2. PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS	

- | | |
|---|---|
| <p>3. CLOSED SESSION</p> <p>A) <i>CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL:</i>
 <i>CAL.GOV.CODE §54956.9</i></p> <p>1. <i>Anticipated Litigation: Gov. Code §54956.9 (b)</i>
 <i>(i) Significant exposure to litigation pursuant to subdivision (b) of Gov. Code §54956.9</i>
 <i>(b) a situation where, based on the advice of counsel taking into account "existing facts and circumstances, "there exists a "significant exposure to litigation"</i></p> <p>2. <i>Pending Litigation:</i></p> <p>1. <i>Reynaga v. LACMTA, Access et al. BC673040</i></p> <p>B) <i>CALIFORNIA GOV. CODE §54957 (b) - PERSONNEL MATTERS</i></p> | <p>DISCUSSION/
 POSSIBLE
 ACTION</p> |
| <p>4. REVIEW & APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE BOARD MEETING ON FEBRUARY 26, 2018 (page 6)
 [Staff Recommendation: Approve minutes as written.]</p> | <p>ACTION
 [Vote Required: majority of quorum by roll call]</p> |
| <p>5. REPORT FROM EX-OFFICIO BOARD MEMBERS</p> | <p>INFORMATION</p> |
| <p>6. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT</p> | <p>INFORMATION</p> |
| <p>7. SUPERIOR SERVICE AWARD</p> | <p>PRESENTATION</p> |
| <p>8. CONSENT CALENDAR</p> <p>a) Consideration to Approve Extension of Term For Customer Opinion Survey Services (AS-4021) (page 15)
 [Staff Recommendation: Authorize staff to execute the second option year with The Fairfax Research Group effective October 1, 2018 through September 30, 2019.]</p> <p>b) Consideration to Approve Renewal of Employee Health and Benefit Insurance Contracts (page 17)
 [Staff Recommendation: Approve the employee benefit insurance policies for the period of July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2019 at a cost not to exceed \$853,000.]</p> | <p>ACTION
 [Vote Required: majority of quorum by roll call]</p> |

- c) Consideration to Exceed Aggregate Procurement Limit For Printing Vendor (page 19)

[Staff Recommendation: Authorize staff to exceed the \$75,000 aggregate procurement limit with Pacific Graphics Inc. for an amount not to exceed \$100,000.]

- d) Consideration to Approve Network Hardware and Services Contract (AS-4068) (page 21)

[Staff Recommendation: Authorize staff to execute a contract for up to three (3) base years with two (2) one year extensions beginning May 1, 2018 with ConvergeOne in an amount not to exceed \$201,332.15.]

- e) Consideration to Award Contract for Audit Services (AS-4045) (page 23)

[Staff Recommendation: Authorize staff to execute a contract for three years, for mandated auditing, governmental reporting services, and miscellaneous consulting services as needed for the period July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2021 with Rossi LLP (Rossi) in an amount not to exceed \$185,181.50.]

- f) Consideration to Approve Revised 2018 Board of Directors Meeting Calendar (page 27)

[Staff Recommendation: Review and approve the proposed changes to the Board Meeting calendar for 2018.]

9. **APPROVAL TO NEGOTIATE MEDI-CAL CONTRACT WITH THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES** (page 30)

[Staff Recommendation: Authorize staff to negotiate and execute a contract with the County of Los Angeles through June 30, 2020 in an amount not to exceed \$24,000,000 in reimbursements.]

PRESENTATION/
ACTION

[Vote required:
majority of quorum
by roll call]

- | | |
|--|--|
| <p>10. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD CONTRACT FOR SPECIALIZED ADA PARATRANSIT SERVICE: NORTHERN REGION (AS-4059) (page 33) - <i>Held over from the February 26, 2018 Board meeting.</i></p> <p>[Staff Recommendation: Authorize staff to execute a contract for transportation service in the Northern Region service area beginning May 1, 2018 and ending July 31, 2023, with MV Transportation in an amount not to exceed \$185,789,905 for the five year base period.]</p> | <p>PRESENTATION/
ACTION
[Vote required:
majority of quorum
by roll call]</p> |
| <p>11. BOARD STIPEND POLICY (page 43)</p> <p>[Staff Recommendation: Receive and File.]</p> | <p>PRESENTATION/
ACTION
[Vote required:
majority of quorum
by roll call]</p> |
| <p>12. UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS (page 46)</p> | <p>INFORMATION</p> |
| <p>13. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT</p> | <p>INFORMATION</p> |
| <p>14. BOARD MEMBER COMMUNICATION</p> | <p>INFORMATION</p> |
| <p>15. NEW BUSINESS SUBSEQUENT TO THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA</p> | <p>DISCUSSION/
POSSIBLE
ACTION</p> |
| <p>16. ADJOURNMENT</p> | <p>ACTION</p> |

Access Services does not discriminate on the basis of disability. Accordingly, Access Services seeks to ensure that individuals with disabilities will have an equal opportunity to participate in the range of Access Services events and programs by providing appropriate auxiliary aids and services for communications. Primary consideration is given to the request of individuals with disabilities. However, the final decision belongs to Access Services. To help ensure the availability of those auxiliary aids and services you require, please make every effort to notify Access Services of your request at least three (3) business days (72 hours) prior to the meeting in which you wish to utilize those aids or services. You may do so by contacting (213) 270-6000.

Note: Access Services Board meetings are held pursuant to the Ralph M. Brown Act [Cal. Gov. Code §54950] and are open to the public. The public may view and obtain all written information supporting this agenda provided to the Board both initially and supplementally prior to the meeting at the agency's offices located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue, El Monte, California and on its website at <http://accessla.org>. Documents, including Power Point handouts distributed to the Board members by staff or Board

members at the meeting, will simultaneously be made available to the public. Three opportunities are available for the public to address the Board during a Board meeting: (1) before closed session regarding matters to be discussed in closed session, (2) before a specific agenda item is debated and voted upon regarding that item and (3) general public comment. The exercise of the right to address the Board is subject to restriction as to time and appropriate decorum. All person wishing to make public comment must fill out a goldenrod Public Comment Form and submit it to the Secretary of the Board. Public Comment is generally limited to three (3) minutes per speaker and the total time available for public comment may be limited at the discretion of the Chairperson. Persons whose speech is impaired such that they are unable to address the Board at a normal rate of speed may request that accommodation of a limited amount of additional time from the Chair but only by checking the appropriate box on the Public Comment Form. Granting such an accommodation is at the discretion of the Chair.

The Board of Directors will not and cannot respond during the meeting to matters raised under general public comment. Pursuant to provisions of the Brown Act governing these proceedings, no discussion or action may be taken on these matters unless they are listed on the agenda, or unless certain emergency or special circumstances exist. However, the Board may direct staff to investigate and/or schedule certain matters for consideration at a future Board of Directors Meeting and the staff may respond to all public comment in writing prior to the next Board meeting.

Alternative accessible formats are available upon request.



**STATEMENT OF PROCEEDINGS FOR THE
MEETING OF THE ACCESS SERVICES
BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

**Access Services Headquarters
3449 Santa Anita Avenue
El Monte, CA 91731**

**Monday, February 26, 2018
12:07 p.m.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting called to order by Chair Nalini Ahuja at 12:07 p.m.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT REPRESENTING A QUORUM

Present: Chair Nalini Ahuja, Vice Chair Art Ida, Treasurer Kim Turner, Secretary Theresa DeVera, Directors Dolores Nason, Doran Barnes, Martin Gombert and Angela Nwokike. Ex-Officios: CAC Chair Michael Conrad, TPAC Vice Chair Giovanna Gogreve and Legal Counsel Jim Jones.

BOARD MEMBER(S) EXCUSED FROM THE MEETING

Not Present: Director John Troost.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT WITH RESPECT TO CLOSED SESSION ITEMS

No public comments

3. CLOSED SESSION REPORT

Access Services Legal Counsel Jim Jones briefed the audience on the outcome of the closed session. Mr. Jones stated that the Board met in closed session and discussed the following item: Reynaga v. LACMTA, Access et al. No reportable action was taken with respect to this matter.

Mr. Jones then explained the public comment process.

4. **REVIEW & APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE BOARD MEETING ON JANUARY 22, 2018**

Recommendation: Approval of minutes as written.

Motion made by Director Nason to approve the minutes as submitted, seconded by Secretary DeVera. Via Roll Call all were in favor, motion passed.

5. **REPORT FROM EX-OFFICIO BOARD MEMBERS**

Michael Conrad, Chair of the Community Advisory Committee (CAC), stated that the committee met on Tuesday, February 13, 2018 and the following items were discussed. Board of Directors Report, provided by Vice Chair Ida; Autonomous Vehicle Pilot presentation, provided by Bill Tsuei; Customer Service Update, provided by Hector Rodriguez; "Where's My Ride" app update, provided by Ruben Prieto and Strategic Plan update, provided by Eric Haack.

Mr. Conrad stated that the CAC also created a nominating subcommittee for the purpose of interviewing candidates to fill the vacancies on the CAC. It was decided that the subcommittee would consist of three CAC members with two alternates. Mr. Conrad concluded his report by stating that they ran out of time and were unable to receive the Operations Performance Update but he hoped that the committee would have a chance to review it at their next meeting in March.

Giovanna Gogreve, Vice Chair of the Transportation Professionals Advisory Committee (TPAC), stated that TPAC held their meeting on February 8, 2018 and Access Services Executive Director Andre Colaiace informed the committee that staff was waiting to receive their Draft ADA Compliance Review from the FTA. He also stated that Access' Triennial Review was scheduled for some time in April 2018. Mr. Colaiace provided a status update on the "Where's My Ride" app and stated that the app was available in the L.A. basin and will be available in the Antelope Valley and Santa Clarita regions by the summer of 2018.

Ms. Gogreve also reported that TPAC received an Operations Report Update, provided by Faustino Salvador on January's operations performance and a high-level overview on the Autonomous Vehicle project provided by Bill Tsuei. Mr. Tsuei stated that as the project progressed he would come back to the committee and provide further updates and input from the members. Ms. Gogreve added that Hector Rodriguez provided a customer service performance report and announced that the year-to-date Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) were successfully achieved. He also assured the committee that staff would continue

to work with ALTA Resources, the customer service contractor to maintain their KPIs.

Ms. Gogreve concluded her report by stating that Eric Haack provided a Strategic Plan update including updates from the TPAC Strategic Plan Subcommittee. The committee also recommended that staff review the Los Angeles County Coordinated Plan.

6. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Yael Hagen made public comment by stating that she was with the Personal Assistance Services Council (PASC) and her comment was on behalf of the Paratransit Riders Coalition. She added that she was a long time rider and a rider advocate and, on behalf of the Paratransit Riders Coalition, she would like to thank Access staff for participating in their meetings and being very helpful and responsive to the riders. Ms. Hagen concluded her public comment by stating that the coalition has noticed a significant improvement in staff's willingness to be more open, responsive and taking part in a more positive dialog which was very much appreciated.

Rachele Goeman made public comment by stating that she really enjoyed the "Where's My Ride" app but there were still issues. She stated that she understood that the app was still very new but she felt that there were things that still needed to be changed, fixed or tweaked. Ms. Goeman stated that when a rider is waiting and relying on the app, then they open their door only to find that the vehicle has been sitting there for 10 minutes, it makes the rider less likely to want to depend on the app. She added that although she had a great working relationship with Mr. Prieto who was always willing to help, she felt that she did not see the app progressing.

Ms. Goeman concluded her public comment by stating that she has severe balance problems due to her back injury and, because of this, most of the drivers were willing to pick her up in her driveway because it was cement versus her having to walk across the grass and lose her balance. She stated that she had asked several times for the drivers to back up into her driveway because it was easier for her to walk across and get into the vehicle. Some drivers were nice about it and others not so nice and would refuse to do it but would not give her a legitimate reason why they refused.

Access' Systems Analyst Ruben Prieto was assigned to assist Ms. Goeman with the 'Where's My Ride' app portion of her public comment. Project Administrator Rogelio Gomez was assigned to assist Ms. Goeman with the other part of her comment.

Renee Madera made public comment by stating that she had brought up an issue in the past to one of Access' staff members regarding customer service being open on the weekends at least three quarters of the day or half a day, especially for customer related issues. She stated that she realized that Access would actually need to have employees come in on the weekends but when you have more and more customers that need the service you are going to need to increase your hours in the day or add weekends, so hopefully Access could have customer service open half a day on the weekends.

Ms. Madera also stated that when a customer is trying to make a reservation, they all know that they are not the only customer calling but they should not have to try 8 to 20 times to make the reservation they need. She stated that she sympathized with all the reservationists in the regions but some riders just can't accept whatever time was given to them especially if some of them live 45 to 50 miles away from where they want to go. Ms. Madera added that something needs to be done with the systems that Access Services uses for making reservations because she was not the only customer that has experienced this issue.

Ms. Madera concluded her public comment by stating that she was still having an issue with drivers in the Eastern region not approaching her when they arrive at her pick up location; she asked that staff look into this.

Access' Project Administrator Faustino Salvador was assigned to assist Ms. Madera after the meeting.

7. SUPERIOR SERVICE AWARD

Superior Service Award Presentation:

Medical Transportation Management (MTM) Mobility Assessment Evaluator Rachel Mix was the Superior Service Award recipient.

8. CONSENT CALENDAR

Recommendation: Approval of all items on the Consent Calendar (list of Items provided below):

8-a Consideration to Extend Term and Increase Funds - ATBOS Software Licensing Agreement (AS-1250)

8-b Consideration to Extend Term and Increase Funds - Information Technology Consulting Services Contract (AS-1288)

8-c Consideration to Award Contract for Data Communication Services (AS-4069)

Motion made by Director Nwokike to approve all items on the consent calendar, seconded by Secretary DeVera. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

9. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD CONTRACT FOR SPECIALIZED ADA PARATRANSIT SERVICE: NORTHERN REGION (AS-4059)

Recommendation: Authorize staff to execute a contract for transportation service in the Northern Region service area beginning March 1, 2018 and ending July 31, 2023, with MV Transportation in an amount not to exceed \$185,789,905 for the five year base period.

Motion made by Treasurer Turner to table this item and requested that staff bring it back to the Board at a later date. Seconded by Secretary DeVera. Via Voice Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

Public Comment

Yael Hagen made public comment by stating that if this item was approved, she was going to thank the Board for approving it and state that they were doing the right thing by showing the riders how much they really cared about customer service, but she was really disappointed that this item was not going to be discussed. She stated that she felt that the additions to this contract had a lot to do with customer service and should be important enough to this Board. She added that she was also aware that it was significantly more money, which was the Board's concern but the increase was due to the customer service additions to the scope of work and additional wage increases and other increases that were natural to this kind of business.

Ms. Hagen stated that she was shocked and a little heartbroken that this Board was not seeing these additions as valuable and not recognizing the value in how these additions would make the use of these resources more effective and efficient. She concluded her public comment by stating that she hoped that the Board would reconsider or as they review the item, they would keep those things in mind.

10. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD CONTRACT FOR TRAVEL TRAINING SERVICES (AS-4051)

Recommendation: Authorize staff to execute a three (3) year base contract beginning March 1, 2018 and ending February 28, 2021 with Mobility Management Partners (MMP) in an amount not to exceed \$2,588,009.

Public Comment

Manjot Singh made public comment by stating that he was visually impaired, legally blind and he felt that Access Services was a good program and because he had gone through the travel training program it has allowed him to make plans on the day he was actually going to travel rather than scheduling Access a day ahead. He also added that you cannot always rely on Access or other people, so with travel training he was able to learn how to get from one place to another, how to board a bus and learn where the platforms were and how to navigate them at Union Station. Mr. Singh concluded his public comment by also stating that he learned how to get to Cal State Los Angeles where he attends school every day, travel to his friend's house on the weekend rather than asking them to pick him up. He thanked Access Services for the Travel Training program.

Consuelo Ferrer made public comment by stating that she was very pleased with Access and an instructor named Michelle who came to her home and showed her the things she did not know about public transportation such as the Metro Flyaway, how to take the bus and many other things. She concluded her public comment by thanking Access for all the services they currently provide because the riders really needed them and use them.

Charles Otto submitted a written public comment. Sharon Astier read the public comment for the record. Mr. Otto stated in his comment that an instructor named Michelle showed him how to ride the trains and the Red Line from Santa Monica to Union Station which he felt was a pleasant trip. Michelle also showed him the importance of being safe while waiting for the train and standing behind the yellow line on the platform. He concluded his public comment by thanking Access for their Travel Training Program.

Martha Estrada also submitted a written public comment. Elisa Diaz read her public comment for the record. Ms. Estrada stated that she wanted to share how the travel training program had helped her feel more confident, understand the rules of public transportation and how to be safe while traveling on public transportation. She stated that she learned how to read bus and train signs, when to get off the bus or train and which direction to head after she exited the bus or train. Ms. Estrada concluded her public comment by stating that she used to lock herself in her home which made her feel really depressed and scared to go out because she might get lost but after being a part of the travel training program she now felt safe, positive and independent. She stated that she was very grateful to Access because she really benefited from this program.

Tonni Yee-Hemphill made public comment by stating that one of the travel trainers approached her some time last year and she felt that the trainer was very abrupt, rude and rushed her. She stated that she did not feel comfortable doing the travel training because she had requested travel training many years ago and did not receive it so she had to learn different ways of traveling from other riders. She concluded her public comment by stating that she was interested in seeing

how the program worked out because she still gets confused due to the lack of signage out there.

Motion made by Director Barnes to approve staff recommendation, seconded by Director Gombert.

Treasurer Turner requested that an amendment be added that staff would also report back to the Board on a quarterly basis on the performance and effectiveness of the program and to also look into possibly bringing the program in house. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

11. CONSIDERATION TO AWARD CONTRACT FOR LEGAL SERVICES (AS-4039)

Recommendation: 1) Authorize staff to execute a three (3) year contract beginning April 1, 2018 and ending March 31, 2021 with Alvarez-Glasman & Colvin in an amount not to exceed \$567,000. 2) Authorize staff to execute a one (1) year contract beginning April 1, 2018 and ending March 31, 2019 with Jones & Lester at current rates in an amount not to exceed \$100,000 with a mutual option to extend the contract for another year.

Motion made by Treasurer Turner to approve the staff recommendation, seconded by Director Nason. Via Roll Call Vote - all were in favor, motion passed.

12. UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS

Chair Ahuja reminded the Board that this was an information item only and no action was needed.

13. EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS REPORT

Access' Executive Director, Andre Colaiace, began his report by stating that service year-to-date was good at 91.4% on-time and for the month of February on-time performance was at 92.8%. He also added some IT updates by stating that Director of Information Technology Bill Tsuei was working on the online reservations program and Ben Lin, the Senior Database Administrator, was leading this effort. Staff was hoping to have a test project out in the Eastern and West Central regions by late March or early April followed by the Northern region in late June or late July and in the Southern region in late July or early August and the North County will follow. Mr. Colaiace stated that the idea of this program was to give Access customers options on how they could book their trips. He also stated that the "Where's My Ride" app continues to gain traction and staff would

like to thank the customers for their feedback including the comments that were made at today's Board meeting. Mr. Colaiace stated that as of today there are 763 customers using the app so staff will continue to market and improve the app as we move forward.

Mr. Colaiace concluded his report by stating that the Autonomous Vehicle Pilot Project was presented to the CAC and TPAC committees. US DOT Secretary Elaine Chao invited Mr. Tsuei to participate in a multi modal stakeholder policy discussion on autonomous vehicles in Washington, DC, which was quite an honor. Access also participated in the Abilities Expo this weekend that was held at the Los Angeles Convention Center. He thanked all Access staff who worked with customers, answered their questions, solved their problems and helped facilitate transportation to the event.

14. BOARD MEMBER COMMUNICATION

Secretary DeVera thanked all the providers who helped coordinate all the trips to and from the Abilities Expo this past weekend. She stated that no one was left stranded even if they had a 7:00 p.m. pick-up because staff stayed behind until 8:00 p.m. to ensure that everyone was picked up. She also thanked Mr. Salvador who went above and beyond and was at the Access booth all weekend to answer questions, concerns and complaints.

Vice Chair Ida thanked the customers for attending today's meeting and stated that it was very important that staff receive feedback from the riders regarding the service. He also thanked staff and the vendors for working hard to provide the service and he thanked legal counsel Jim Jones for his many years of legal service.

Treasurer Turner concurred with Vice Chair Ida's statements and thanked the customers for being present at today's meeting. She also stated that she learned something new today about reservations. Treasurer Turner added that she appreciated the time and effort that the customers put in to be at the meetings to let the Board know what was happening out there because they were the Board's eyes and ears.

Treasurer Turner also congratulated Mr. Tsuei because it was truly an honor to be recognized by the US DOT Secretary. She concluded her comments by requesting that staff look into the Board stipend policy and bring back a report at the next Board meeting.

Director Nason thanked Access staff members and Mr. Colaiace for the excellent job they do with preparing for the monthly Board meeting. She stated that all the meeting materials and everything else was always ready and right at their fingertips, which made the Board look organized. Director Nason also added that

she concurred with Treasurer Turner statement regarding the riders attending the meetings and letting the Board know what was going on with the service. She thanked the riders and stated that they played a valuable part in the Board being able to do their job.

Director Gombert stated that he also concurred with the Board members comments and thanked staff for some lengthy staff reports on some of the big issues. He also congratulated Mr. Tsuei and thanked Mr. Jones for his many years of legal service to Access Services and the Board.

Ms. Gogreve also thanked Mr. Jones for his many years of service with Access and the Board of Directors. She also congratulated Mr. Tsuei on his upcoming trip to Washington, DC. Ms. Gogreve wished everyone a wonderful week.

Chair Ahuja congratulated Mr. Tsuei and thanked Mr. Jones for his years of service to the Board of Directors and Access Services. She also asked the new legal counsel to step up and introduce himself.

15. NEW BUSINESS SUBSEQUENT TO THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

No new business was heard subsequent to the posting of the agenda.

16. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Director Nwokike, second by Treasurer Turner. Via voice vote all were in favor, motion passed. The meeting adjourned at 2:23 p.m.

Approved

Theresa DeVera, Secretary

Date

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: MATTHEW AVANCENA, MANAGER, PLANNING AND COORDINATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF TERM FOR CUSTOMER OPINION SURVEY SERVICES (AS-4021)

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to exercise the second and last option year of the contract with The Fairfax Research Group (AS-4021) for telephone opinion survey services of Access customers.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute the second option year with The Fairfax Research Group effective October 1, 2018 through September 30, 2019.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

None. The cost for these services has been programmed in next year's FY 2019 budget. There is no change to the not-to-exceed contract amount of \$185,860. These services will be funded with local Prop C funds.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

No alternatives were considered. Survey design and administration is a highly specialized field that requires experience in both quantitative and qualitative research designs. The survey process must be based on sound statistical and scientific principles. Staff does not possess the expertise to perform this function in-house.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, the staff will be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into extension of the contract with The Fairfax Research Group in accordance with terms, conditions and costs that are no less

favorable to Access than those proposed herein. Access would not be legally bound to the renewal or modifications unless it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND

Conducting regular passenger satisfaction surveys of Access customers is a critical step in obtaining an enhanced understanding of passenger perceptions of the entire transportation process. Measuring passengers' perceptions of the process - from making the reservation to the safe and timely arrival at their desired destination - will provide Access with invaluable insights into the perceptions of the passenger and the quality of the transportation experience.

During November and October 2017, the Fairfax Research Group conducted an independent telephone survey of 1,319 customers who recently took an Access trip within the past six months. The results of the 2017 Overall Customer Satisfaction Survey were presented at the December 2017 meeting of the Community Advisory Committee (CAC) and Transportation Professionals Advisory Committee (TPAC).

On December 11, 2017 Todd Remington, principal of The Fairfax Research Group, presented a high level summary of the results of the Customer Satisfaction Survey to the Board of Directors.

During the course of the contract, Fairfax Research was also tasked to conduct an independent telephone survey of eight hundred (800) Access customers who used the Free Fare program. The purpose of the survey was to get a better understanding of customer behavior in their usage of paratransit, fixed route, rail and commuter rail services.

Mr. Remington presented the free fare survey results to the CAC on March 14, 2017, the Regional Paratransit Free Fare Working Group meeting on April 4, 2017, the Access Board of Directors meeting on April 17, 2017 and TPAC on May 11, 2017.

Staff will work with Fairfax Research to conduct a customer satisfaction survey of customers every two years and other targeted surveys to gauge passenger opinions of the service.

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

**FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION
HECTOR RODRIGUEZ, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, FINANCE**

**RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE RENEWAL OF EMPLOYEE HEALTH
AND BENEFIT INSURANCE CONTRACTS**

ISSUE:

The current Access Services employee benefit insurance policies for medical, dental, vision, life and long term disability will expire on June 30, 2018. The Board must approve a benefit plan so that employee benefits are in place for the next fiscal year starting July 1, 2018.

RECOMMENDATION

Approve the employee benefit insurance policies for the period of July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2019 at a cost not to exceed \$853,000.

IMPACT TO BUDGET

The costs for these policies (\$753,000 for the health policy and \$100,000 for all other policies), which is a 11% increase over the current year, will be included in the proposed FY19 budget. The funding for these policies comes from Prop C Discretionary funds.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

Access' insurance broker, SullivanCurtisMonroe, conducted a comprehensive market survey. Similar benefit plans with health care carriers such as Blue Shield and United Health Care would have resulted in 16% or 22% premium increases. The current Kaiser plan is the most cost advantageous to Access.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, the staff will be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a renewal of the existing Kaiser Health Care plan and modify Access' existing vision, dental, and other benefit plans in accordance with terms, conditions and costs that are no less favorable to Access than those proposed herein. Access would not be legally bound to the renewal or modifications unless it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND

Health Plan Renewal (Kaiser Permanente HMO/PPO)

The total estimated cost is projected to be \$753,000. Assuming a 10% employee contribution, Access' annual increase is estimated to be 13% based on coverage of 55 full time equivalent positions (FTEs) and their dependents. Access employees are happy with the Kaiser medical plan offerings and it is our intention to continue our relationship with Kaiser for the coming plan year.

Dental Plan Renewal (Guardian)

The total estimated cost is projected to be \$53,303. This cost is flat over the current year.

Vision Plan Renewal (VSP)

The total estimated cost is projected to be \$9,013, a 1% increase based on 58 FTEs.

Ancillary Renewal

Ancillary policies cover Basic Life/Accidental Death and Dismemberment (Guardian), Voluntary Life (Guardian) and Long Term Disability (Unum). The total estimated cost is projected to be \$38,068, a 3% increase based on 63 FTEs.

There is no rate increase for our Chubb Business Travel Accident, Lifelock Identify Theft and Nationwide/VPI Pet Insurance plans.

Note - The FTEs vary based upon the existing number of employees electing to take the employer provided insurance.

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: MICHAEL PASCUAL, MANAGER OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION
F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO EXCEED AGGREGATE PROCUREMENT LIMIT FOR PRINTING VENDOR

ISSUE:

Board approval is required for aggregate contracts to a single vendor exceeding \$75,000 in a fiscal year.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to exceed the \$75,000 aggregate procurement limit with Pacific Graphics Inc. for an amount not to exceed \$100,000.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The recommended action is within the anticipated budget for Fiscal Year 2017/18.

The funding for these services comes from Prop C Discretionary funds.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

If the Board opts not to approve this item then staff would not be able to award any printing contracts to Pacific Graphics for the remainder of the fiscal year, even if they were the low bid on a particular print job.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, the staff will be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into written purchase orders with Pacific Graphics upon terms that are no less favorable to Access Services than those proposed above.

Access Services would not be legally bound to this purchase unless it is incorporated into formal written purchase orders.

BACKGROUND:

Access Services utilizes outside vendors to produce printed material that includes, but is not limited to, Rider's Guides, Information Packets, Renewal Forms, Posters, Postcard Mailers and Seat Drops. Throughout FY2017/18 staff has utilized various procurement methods for obtaining these necessary services, including a competitive Request for Quotes (RFQ) process. As a result, purchase orders have been issued to several print vendors, including Pacific Graphics.

In FY2017/18, the total aggregate dollar amount of purchase orders issued to Pacific Graphics is \$65,515. The Access Services procurement policy regarding aggregate procurements states, "At such time as the aggregate purchase from a single vendor exceeds the total amount of \$75,000 in the fiscal year, any additional purchases from that vendor (during the same fiscal year) must be approved by the Board of Directors, notwithstanding the amount of the purchase." If, in the course of competitively procuring these services, the low bidder is determined to be Pacific Graphics, the resulting purchase order(s) could push their total annual aggregate expenditure over the \$75,000 threshold.

The purpose of this request is to gain approval from the Board prior to reaching the policy threshold. Therefore staff requests that the Pacific Graphics Purchase Order be amended in an amount up to, but not to exceed \$100,000 in FY2017/18. Pacific Graphics has performed satisfactory services when issued purchase orders for printed material.

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

**FROM: WILLIAM TSUEI, DIRECTOR, INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY
MICHAEL PASCUAL, MANAGER, PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT
ADMINISTRATION**

**RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE NETWORK HARDWARE AND
SERVICES CONTRACT (AS-4068)**

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to execute a contract for the purchase of new data network equipment, including implementation service and ongoing support, in reference to the newly procured Voice Over Internet Protocol (VoIP) system.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute a contract for up to three (3) base years with two (2) one year extensions beginning May 1, 2018 with ConvergeOne in an amount not to exceed \$201,332.15.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The cost for this contract was budgeted in the current FY2017/18 budget and will be programmed in the FY2018/19 - FY20/21 budgets. Because the VoIP contract has an option of up to two (2) one-year extensions after the base term is completed, ongoing support for the new data network may be needed when the option period for the VoIP contract is exercised. If so, the cost for the ongoing support will be programmed in the appropriate year's budget request.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

None. The equipment and services that staff is proposing to purchase are critical to the implementation of the VoIP contract.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If the staff recommendation is approved by the Board, staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a written contract upon terms and conditions no less favorable to Access than those proposed above. Access would not be legally bound to the contract herein proposed unless and until it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity’s legal counsel.

BACKGROUND

In January 2018, Access procured a VoIP system to replace the existing phone system through a competitive Request for Proposals (RFP). Access awarded the VoIP contract to Packet Fusion for a base term of three (3) years with two (2) one-year options. The new VoIP system requires a new data network. Because Access currently uses a Cisco application, for compatibility, staff opted to procure a Cisco telecommunication data network to work with the VoIP system.

In order to procure the Cisco data network, staff utilized the National Association of State Procurement Officials (NASPO) ValuePoint Cooperative Purchasing Organization Contract, Schedule 70 (NASPO Schedule 70). This cooperative purchasing provides a list of competitively procured vendors who provide data communication products and services. Cisco is a listed vendor under the NASPO Schedule 70.

The use of cooperative purchasing expedites the purchasing process, while ensuring that a competitive price is paid for goods and services. The Common Grant Rules and the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) encourages the use joint procurements to obtain better pricing through larger purchases.

ConvergeOne is Access’ current contractor for its Comprehensive Managed IT Services contract and is familiar with Access’ telecommunication and IT environment. ConvergeOne is a licensed Cisco dealer.

Below is a breakdown of the costs:

Data Network (Equipment and Service)	Amount
Hardware/Equipment	\$ 88,656.40
Implementation and Project Management	\$ 18,175.75
Ongoing Support	\$ 94,500.00
Total Not-to-Exceed Amount	\$201,332.15

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: BRUCE FRINK, SENIOR MANAGER, FINANCIAL PLANNING AND ANALYSIS
BRIAN SELWYN, PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACTS ADMINISTRATOR

RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD CONTRACT FOR AUDIT SERVICES (AS-4045)

ISSUE:

Board approval is required to award a contract for Financial Audit Services.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute a contract for three years, for mandated auditing, governmental reporting services, and miscellaneous consulting services as needed for the period July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2021 with Rossi LLP (Rossi) in an amount not to exceed \$185,181.50.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The costs associated with this contract will be incorporated into the budget for FY 2018-2019 and the subsequent out years. This contract has the option to extend, upon Board approval, for a period of up to two (2) years in one-year increments.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

The existing contract for auditing services has four available option years remaining and therefore may be extended. However, a recent audit by Metro suggested that the *GASB* (Governmental Accounting Standards Board) standard might be a more appropriate to use than the *FASB* (Financial Accounting Standards Board) standard. Accordingly, while staff believes that the FASB standards that Access has traditionally used are appropriate, staff opted to issue a new Request for Proposals (RFP) to address this significant change of scope. If staff were to exercise the option in the current

contract with Rossi LLP, future audits would be solely conducted under the current FASB standard.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If the staff recommendation is approved by the Board, staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a written contract upon terms and conditions no less favorable to Access than those proposed above. Access would not be legally bound to the contract herein proposed unless and until it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

Access released RFP AS-4045 on February 12, 2018. Addenda providing responses to questions submitted by potential proposers were released on March 7th and March 19th. Proposals were due on March 27th. As a result of this solicitation, staff received a single proposal from Rossi, LLP, the incumbent consultant. Historically, the level of response to solicitations for our Financial Audit Services has been limited. For example, in both 2012 and 2017 two proposals were submitted. (The 2017 procurement was ultimately cancelled.)

In order to attract as wide and diverse a field of potential proposers as possible, staff solicited in four (4) venues:

- The Access vendor portal;
- *Public Purchase* (an on-line service which, on an annual basis, informs a national audience of nearly 200,000 non-profit and government solicitations);
- *Transit Talent* (a transit industry publication which provides information to individuals and the business community on both employment and procurement opportunities on a daily basis);
- And, in order to connect with over 40,000 local and regional finance and accountant professionals, the e-classified section of the *California Society of Certified Public Accountants* webpage.

Ninety-two (92) individuals looked at the RFP announcement in *Public Purchase* alone, and of those, twenty-four (24) downloaded the RFP. Following the submission by Rossi, staff performed a market analysis, querying firms on their reasons for not submitting a proposal. The reasons given for not responding to the RFP were as follows:

- Firms were not prepared to submit a proposal due to time constraints.

- Firms felt their price would not be competitive given the Scope of Work.
- The work involved was outside of their field of expertise.

A few sample comments follow:

- *(Our) firm does not have experience in auditing the funding sources the agency receives therefore decided to not respond to the RFP.*
- *In response to your inquiry, we did not submit a proposal for the audit of Access Services because we did not have enough time to put together a quality proposal that was tailored to your entity, and we did not want to send you a boiler plate proposal. Thanks for giving us the opportunity to respond to your RFP.*
- *Based on our understanding of the scope of work, review of prior audited financial statements, answers to questions submitted in the RFP process, and the sensitivity of certain requested information in the RFP, we did not feel we would be able to provide Access a fair and competitive fee on the work.*

An evaluation panel, consisting of both Access staff and an outside rater, reviewed the Rossi proposal and determined that the firm was well qualified to undertake the work delineated in the subject RFP.

CRITERION	Score	Max. Pts.
Qualifications of the Firm	26.50	30.00
Quality of Technical Approach and Work Plan	22.50	25.00
Qualifications and Availability of Proposed Staff	13.60	15.00
Price - FASB	15.00	15.00
Price - GASB	15.00	15.00
TOTAL SCORE	92.60	100.00

Rossi is requesting a modest increase in the hourly rate for each FTE to be assigned to this project in this new contract. The proposed fully burdened hourly rates for the six staff positions to be assigned to this work are within the range charged by firms doing similar work for governmental agencies based on USGSA Contract Award Labor Category data as of 2018. The average annual increase in the hourly rate of assigned staff from 2012 (the first year of the current contract) to the proposed first year of the new contract is 1.52% , which is below the average annual change in the Consumer Price Index for the same period at 1.66% (USDOL, Bureau of Labor Statistics, Los Angeles Region).

The firm of Rossi, Doscocil & Finkelstein, LLP, now Rossi LLP, has performed the professional accounting and auditing services for Access since 1995. The firm has similar long-standing relationships with other non-profit agencies such as Habitat for

Humanity of Greater Los Angeles (fifteen years) and Orange County Head Start (ten years). Rossi's performance has been outstanding in fulfilling the requirements set forth in past audit contracts. Rossi's performance over the last several years, as well as the firm's very competitive pricing, are the main reasons that staff requests the approval of its recommendation.

It should also be noted that Access, as of two years ago, is now included in the annual Consolidated Audit that LA Metro conducts on all of the jurisdictions, operators and program administrators who receive funds for transportation related projects. Metro contracts with two local, independent CPA firms to perform the financial and compliance audits of close to 90 entities receiving funding. These two firms are tasked with performing the necessary audit(s) to assure management that each recipient of subsidies included in the Consolidated Audit are adhering to the statutes of each applicable funding source and that operations data used to allocate funds is fair and in accordance with Federal Transportation Administration (FTA) guidelines.

For the last two years the CPA firm, Vasquez & Company, has conducted the audit of Access on behalf of MTA. For both years, the official opinion given by this firm stated, "In our opinion, Access Services complied, in all material respects, with the compliance requirements of the Guidelines..."

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE REVISED 2018 BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING CALENDAR

ISSUE:

At the request of the Board, staff has developed a revised Board meeting schedule to move the September, October and Annual Meetings and cancel the November Board meeting.

RECOMMENDATION:

Review and approve the proposed changes to the Board Meeting calendar for 2018.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

None.

DISCUSSION:

Staff has prepared the proposed changes to the 2018 Board meeting calendar. The majority of the meeting dates will remain on the fourth Monday of the month, with the exceptions of Monday, May 21, 2018 due to the Memorial Day Holiday; Monday, September 17, 2018 due to a conflict with the APTA Annual meeting; and Tuesday, October 30, 2018 for the Annual Meeting due to a conflict with the APTA Industry Leadership Summit. The December 10, 2018 meeting is being held early due to there being no Board meeting in November. All meetings are subject to change based upon the necessary business needs of Access Services. Notice of such schedule changes in the Board Meeting calendar will be brought to the Board's attention by the Executive Director.

All meetings with the exception of the Annual meeting are scheduled to take place at the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (Metro) located at 1 Gateway Plaza in Los Angeles or at Access Services located at 3449 Santa Anita Avenue in El Monte.

Board of Directors 2018 Board Meeting Calendar

The following meeting dates highlighted below, have been moved or canceled. All meeting dates and locations are subject to change and must be approved by the Board in advance.

<u>Date</u>	<u>Meeting Type</u>	<u>Location</u>	<u>Note</u>
Monday, January 22 nd	Board Meeting	Metro Board Room	4 th Monday
Monday, February 26 th	Board Meeting	El Monte	4 th Monday
Monday, March 26 th	Board Meeting	El Monte	4 th Monday
Monday, April 23 rd	Board Meeting	El Monte	4 th Monday
Monday, May 21 st	Board Meeting	Metro Board Room	3 rd Monday
Monday, June 25 th	Board Meeting	El Monte	4 th Monday
Monday July 23 rd	Board Meeting	Metro Board Room	4 th Monday
Monday, August 27 th	Board Meeting	El Monte	4 th Monday
Monday, September 17 th	Board Meeting	El Monte	3 rd Monday
Tuesday, October 30 th	Annual Meeting	California Endowment Center	5 th Tuesday
Monday, December 10 th	Board Meeting	Metro Board Room	2 nd Monday

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: MATTHEW AVANCENA, SENIOR MANAGER, PLANNING AND COORDINATION
HECTOR RODRIGUEZ, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, FINANCE

RE: APPROVAL TO NEGOTIATE MEDI-CAL CONTRACT WITH THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

ISSUE:

Staff requests Board authorization to negotiate a contract with the County of Los Angeles to seek reimbursement for a portion of Access trips that may be considered eligible under the Medi-Cal program.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to negotiate and execute a contract with the County of Los Angeles through June 30, 2020 in an amount not to exceed \$24,000,000 in reimbursements.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

The costs and revenues associated with this contract will be incorporated into the budget for FY2019/20 and the subsequent out years; the revenues will also be incorporated into the annual budgeting process.

ALTERNATIVE CONSIDERED:

None. Staff is always looking for additional sources of funding to support paratransit services in Los Angeles County.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If the staff recommendation is approved by the Board, the staff would be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a written contract upon terms and conditions no less favorable to Access than those proposed above. Access would not

be legally bound to a contract herein proposed unless and until it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity's legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

The County-Based Medi-Cal Administrative Activities (CMAA) Program assists in the administration of the Medi-Cal Program by improving the availability and accessibility of Medi-Cal services to Medi-Cal eligible individuals and their families.

As the ADA complementary paratransit provider for Los Angeles County, Access Services is currently providing non-emergency medical transportation to Medi-Cal eligible customers. Transit entities that provide this type of transportation are eligible to receive a percentage of their costs back from the federal government for transporting Medi-Cal eligible individuals to Medi-Cal covered services. The CMAA program thus represents a potential source of revenue to support ADA paratransit services in Los Angeles County.

The County of Los Angeles was designated as the Local Government Agency in June 2014 for purposes of participating in the CMAA Program with the State of California through its Department of Healthcare Services (DHCS).

Access staff began discussions with the County of Los Angeles shortly thereafter. Since participation in this program by transit agencies is not a common practice, Access staff had to ascertain if we would qualify to participate and how we would go about participating.

It was determined that Access would qualify, but we would have to collect certain information and ensure that the collected information remained secure. Specifically, Access would have to collect customers' Medi-Cal Identification Numbers as well as the pickup/drop-off location in order to make sure that the pickup or drop-off address belongs to a Medi-Cal eligible facility.

Access began collecting Medi-Cal information from new applicants as well as persons that were renewing their eligibility after it received Board approval on May 23, 2016. In addition, staff will be collecting this information when a participant calls to make a reservation. Staff did attempt to collect this information by direct calling but found it to be highly inefficient as the success ratio was less than one percent (1%). By comparison, the new applicant success ratio hovers around 35%.

Access staff and L.A. County staff have worked together to bring this project to fruition. In order to finalize this contract, our Board must approve the contract, prior to the same item being brought before the L.A. County Board of Supervisors for approval.

Only when the contract is approved by both agencies, will we be able to begin invoicing the County of Los Angeles for Medi-Cal eligible trips.

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: MIKE GREENWOOD, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, OPERATIONS AND SAFETY
HECTOR RODRIGUEZ, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, FINANCE
MICHAEL PASCUAL, MANAGER, PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION

RE: CONSIDERATION TO AWARD CONTRACT FOR SPECIALIZED ADA PARATRANSIT SERVICE: NORTHERN REGION (AS-4059)

ISSUE:

At the February 26, 2018 Board meeting this item was tabled. Staff has provided additional information which has been *italicized*. Board approval is now required for the selection of a contractor to provide service in the Northern Region service area beginning May 1, 2018, with a start-up period of three (3) months and revenue service beginning August 1, 2018.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize staff to execute a contract for transportation service in the Northern Region service area beginning May 1, 2018 and ending July 31, 2023, with MV Transportation in an amount not to exceed \$185,789,905 for the five year base period.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

This action is consistent with the budget estimates for the proposed contract's five year base term. Trip volume utilized in producing cost proposals was based on the projected number of trips calculated by Access' consultant HDR Engineering Inc. Payment terms of the contract will be start-up costs, a firm fixed monthly fee, a variable fixed rate per trip and a fixed rate per hour (as-needed basis only). Subject to Board approval, the contract may be extended for up to an additional four (4) years in one (1) year increments. The options to extend the period of performance are subject to negotiations but in no case shall exceed the year over year change in the U.S. Consumer Price Index (CPI) for Urban Metropolitan Los Angeles County. Option year pricing is not included in the total not-to-exceed amount since staff will need Board

approval to exercise such options. In evaluating the option years, however, proposals were evaluated based on their fifth year rates multiplied by the prevailing CPI rate increases. In order to ensure full staffing levels, a contract clause will be utilized to capture the unused cost for vacant staff positions.

The rates are as follows:

	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
Fixed	\$625,650	\$664,975	\$716,207	\$784,430	\$851,851
Variable	\$34.13	\$35.37	\$36.63	\$38.28	\$39.86
Hourly	\$38.06	\$40.03	\$42.79	\$45.50	\$47.76

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

The current contract with MV Transportation (AS-3341) has five (5) option years remaining in one (1) year increments. The Board could direct staff to execute the first of the five option years. Staff is not recommending this given the Board’s action in August 2017 authorizing staff to issue requests for proposals for all service provider contracts at the end of their current base contract term. In addition, the option year does not contain a number of customer service improvements that are contained in the current RFP and outlined below.

EFFECT OF APPROVAL OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

If this staff recommendation is approved by the Board, the staff will be authorized, but not required, to negotiate and enter into a contract with MV Transportation as the Northern Region Service area provider under terms that are no less favorable to Access than those proposed herein. Access would not be legally bound to this contract unless it is incorporated into a formal written agreement executed by all parties thereto and approved as to form by this entity’s legal counsel.

BACKGROUND:

In August 2017, the Board authorized staff to issue requests for proposals for all service provider contracts at the end of their current contract term due to issues related to real estate (facilities), continuing issues with minimum wage and wage compression and the need to update contractual language to include additional Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) and liquidated damages.

Scope of Work Changes

Before the issuance of the RFP, staff sought input from various constituencies including CAC, TPAC and the Board of Directors. Additional recommendations were received during the Comprehensive Operational Review and during the Federal Transit

Administration's ADA Compliance Review. As a result, there were major changes to the contractual requirements stipulated in the RFP.

Listed below are some of the major changes:

- **Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) & standards -**

In October 2017, the Access Board approved the adoption of KPIs, standards, and liquidated damages and the incorporation of them into operating contracts. Each KPI has applicable industry-consistent standards and liquidated damages for not meeting contractual requirements.

Specific to this procurement, the following KPIs were added -

- *On-Time Performance (Access-to-work trips)*
 - *Phone Queue Hold Times (ETAs)*
 - *Trip Denials*
 - *Complaints*
 - *Preventable Incidents*
 - *Preventive Maintenance Inspections (PMI)*
 - *Miles Between Road Calls*
 - *Missed Trips*
 - *Excessive Travel Time*
- **Staffing requirements**

Additional staffing requirements were included in this RFP to improve safety, service quality and compliance with FTA standards.

 - *Call Center Manager - Previously, the call center manager position was merged with the community relations manager position. Over time, it has become apparent that one person could not do both jobs effectively in such a large service area. Under the new contract, the call center manager oversees the reservation and ETA functions; the community relations manager oversees outreach to major ridership generators, attends community meetings, works collaboratively with Access' Customer Service Department, and oversees the customer complaint investigation process. Both positions are critical to providing good customer service.*
 - *Safety Manager - Safety is the number one priority of a good transit system, and the safety manager oversees all driver training and the investigation and corrective actions for all collision and incidents. It should be noted that although it was not previously a "required" position, MV Transportation provided one.*
 - *Parts/Warranty Clerk - Access has moved most vehicle replacement and expansion purchases from Prop C (local) funding to 5310 and other federal funded grants. The FTA has clearly stated that they expect recipients to use vehicle warranties when needed to repair covered vehicles, and not use operating funds to repair items covered under a manufacturer's warranty.*

The FTA in past triennial audits has asked for tracking of warranty claims to equipment manufacturers. Since this now involves a majority of our vehicles it has become a full time position to track these repairs and have the cardinal knowledge of all vehicle chassis and associated equipment warranties. The Parts/Warranty Clerk will manage the parts inventory and support for manufacture factory warranty claims. Previously, the position was not required in Access contracts and the maintenance manager handled these duties.

- *Road Supervisors - The previous contract required five road supervisor positions. Time has proven that five is insufficient to cover so large a service area for a 24/7 operation. The new contract requires eleven (11) road supervisors, who respond to collisions, incidents and disturbances, as well as who monitor driver performance. This will allow for four road supervisors to cover the morning shift, four to cover the afternoon shift, and the other three to cover overnight and weekend periods.*
- *Starter at Olive View Medical Center - Olive View Medical Center is the fourth busiest Access pick-up location in Los Angeles County and the most complex due to the volume of riders in combination with Olive View being the transfer hub between the Los Angeles Basin, Santa Clarita, and Antelope Valley. Access has had a starter at Rancho Los Amigos National Rehabilitation Center and the Braille Institute Los Angeles for many years and the starter position has been extremely beneficial for customer service.*
- **Service Improvement**
 - *Contractor responsibility for investigating rider complaints - Responsibility for investigating complaints was not included in the previous contract. In 2015, Access imposed the requirement on its operating contractors but did not change the scope of work, or provide compensation for staffing to do such work. The new SOW formalizes the responsibility. In response, MV proposed adding a Customer Service Coordinator position to manage the process.*
- **Technology Enhancements**
 - *Reservations/Scheduling/Dispatch Software is now included as part of the proposed cost. This is different than the requirements in the 2013 contract, which offered to provide the software to the contractor at no cost. MV's proposal includes start-up costs of \$285,000 for IT software & installation in addition to monthly recurring costs.*
 - *Video Recording for Taxis - Taxicabs have different video recording systems; Access now requires rapid access to video/audio to enhance investigations and reinforce higher standards of service quality.*
 - *Cyber Security Plan - New requirement consistent with Access' internal policies to protect customer data.*

- o *System Redundancies - Requirements to ensure uptime of systems and minimize disruptions to service.*

Procurement Overview

The Northern service region contract is in the last year of its five (5) year base term and therefore staff issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) on October 6, 2017 as authorized by the Board in August 2017. The scope of work provides for the provision of three (3) types of trips: next day ADA trips, standing orders and Access-to-Work service.

Following a pre-proposal conference on October 16, 2017 and the release of four (4) addenda to the original RFP, a total of four (4) proposals were received on November 28, 2017. Of the four (4) proposals, only three (3) were deemed responsive to the RFP. The three responsive proposals were from: (1) MV Transportation, (2) Ride Right and (3) Transdev. The Procurement Department preliminarily reviewed the three responsive proposals and found them to be also responsible proposals. The one proposal deemed not responsive proposed a brokerage model, which was not the model specified in the Scope of Work.

The proposals were then evaluated by a multi-agency panel comprised of five (5) Access staff members and two (2) representatives of local transit and member agencies for a total of seven (7) evaluation panel members. In reviewing the proposals, the panelists brought a blend of talents and experience in the field of transportation and paratransit, specifically in the areas of operations, finance and information technology. All are familiar with ADA paratransit service and the work of Access and appreciate the importance of carefully selecting a vendor who can properly serve Access' customers and the community as a whole.

Proposers were interviewed on January 24, 2018 and follow up questions, including requests for a Best and Final Offer (BAFO), were forwarded to the proposers.

The criteria considered in evaluating the proposals and the weight attached to each criterion were:

Quality of Technical Approach	15 points
Qualifications and Availability of Proposed Staff	10 points
Quality of Proposed Operating Facility	5 points
Cost/Price Proposal	20 points
Employee Pay and Benefits	20 points
Financial Qualifications of the Proposer	5 points
Proposer's Paratransit Operating Experience	15 points
<u>Agreement to Retain Existing Employees</u>	<u>10 points</u>
TOTAL	100 points

Based on the evaluation criteria delineated in the RFP and following the submission of BAFOs, the evaluation team scored the proposals as follows:

PROPOSER

EVALUATION CRITERIA	MV	Transdev	Ride Right
1. Quality of Technical Approach	13.31	11.44	10.24
2. Qualifications and Availability of Proposed Staff	9.13	7.20	6.47
3. Quality of Proposed Operation Facility	4.35	3.32	3.26
4. Cost/Price Proposal	20.00	19.37	16.23
5. Employee Pay and Benefits	15.60	14.80	13.80
6. Financial Qualifications of the Proposer	4.00	3.20	3.60
7. Proposer's Paratransit Operating Experience	14.23	12.43	10.80
8. State Mandated Employee Retention Preference	10.00	10.00	10.00
TOTAL SCORE	90.62	81.76	74.40

Scores for Employee Pay and Benefits and Financial Qualifications of the Proposer were determined by Access Finance Department staff. For Employee Pay and Benefits, staff compared the three proposals in terms of comparability of pay to other organizations in the industry, regularity of increases (based on tenure or merit), quality of health care plan (including percentage of premiums paid by employer vs. employee), number of vacation, sick, PTO days, nature of educational reimbursement program, availability and nature of 401K/pension/retirement plan and other benefits.

For Financial Qualifications of the Proposer, staff reviewed the audited financial statements submitted by each proposer and rated the proposer’s financial strength using various financial ratios.

The score for the cost proposals was determined by a strict formula in which the proposer with the lowest cost proposal earns the maximum 20 points and other proposer earns points based on how close their five year cost is to that of the proposer with the lowest bid. The formula is as follows:

<i>(Lowest Proposed Cost/Proposed Cost of Proposal Being Evaluated) X (0.2)</i>
--

It should be noted that in calculating scores for the cost criterion, staff included the cost of start-up.

In keeping with the recommendation in the Comprehensive Operational Review that Access acquire its own real estate, the RFP, for the first time, included a new requirement that the successful proposer may assign the facility lease agreement to Access upon completion of the start-up period. This means that Access could be the direct tenant to the landlord instead of the contractor. This provides Access an economic advantage where, should the need ever arise, it can turn-over the contract to another contractor without the issue of locating a suitable facility.

Financial Analysis

The table below details the final submitted proposed costs after the Best-and-Final Offers:

Proposer	Startup Costs (S/U)	Total 5 Year Service Cost (incl. S/U)
MV Transportation	\$337,514	\$185,789,905
Transdev	\$2,030,145	\$191,566,436
Ride Right	\$2,844,823	\$228,737,200

Over the five year base term, the average year-to-year change to the fully loaded cost per trip will average 3.4% (see Table 1 below).

TABLE 1

ANNUAL INCREASE % vs. PRIOR YEAR				
	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
Fixed Cost	0.3%	1.3%	2.9%	2.0%
Variable Cost	3.6%	3.6%	4.5%	4.1%
Total Contract	2.8%	3.0%	4.1%	3.6%
Average	3.4%			

Additionally, in the first year of the contract, the proposed annual cost is 19.4% higher than the current rate and the proposed rates for the fixed monthly and variable per trip are 9.2% and 23.2% higher respectively than the current rates (see Table 2 below). *(It should be noted that Access currently pays for MV's software costs, which are now contained in the proposed MV contract. If these annual Trapeze software costs of \$385,344 are considered as part of the costs of the current MV contract, then the fixed cost increase declines from 9.2% to 3.4% and the total annual cost increase declines from 19.4% to 17.7%.)*

TABLE 2

CURRENT RATES vs. PROPOSED RATES			
	Current MV Contract	Proposed MV Contract	% Change
Total Estimated Annual Trips	675,922	675,922	
Fixed Costs Total - Year 1	\$6,875,436	\$7,507,800	9.2%
Variable Rate - Year 1	\$27.70	\$34.13	
Variable Cost - Year 1	\$18,723,039	\$23,069,218	23.2%
Year 1 Annual Cost - Primary Service	\$25,598,475	\$30,577,018	19.4%

The chart below shows the proposed fully-loaded per trip rates for Year 1 for the three proposers, as well as the fully-loaded per trip rate for the current Northern Region contractor.

**FULLY-LOADED PER TRIP RATES:
ACCESS SERVICE CONTRACTORS**

<u>Service Area</u>	<u>Contractor</u>	<u>Rate</u>
Northern Region Current	MV	\$37.87
Northern Region Year 1	MV	\$45.17
	Transdev	\$47.71
	Ride Right	\$57.07

Access staff analyzed all of the proposals and performed a detailed analysis of the recommended proposer. The staff analysis found that in the fixed rate component of the proposal, almost the entire increase was due to wages and benefits of both existing staff and the new staffing requirements. In relation to the variable component, staff found that 100% of the increase was directly related to increased driver costs and the cost of subcontracted service.

Further, staff reconstructed the financial information to ascertain any available opportunities to further reduce costs. Staff created pro-forma financial statements for this contract, verified contractual assumptions with subcontractors, verified details of those assumptions, and found that they were all consistent and within the expected range of values given the current market. An analysis of recent Los Angeles County fixed-route transit contract awards for Los Angeles Metro and Foothill Transit showed cost increases that ranged from 15 percent to 33 percent. Access' most recent contract award in the West Central region increased by 14 percent.

Overview of Recommended Proposer

The following comments highlight just a few of the strengths gleaned by the panelists as they reviewed the proposals:

- The facility proposed is the same as the current facility. It is located in Van Nuys, which is within the service area and close to the freeways. The facility has ample parking.
- The proposed management team has extensive experience operating in the service area.

Since beginning its partnership with Access, MV Transportation has consistently shown its reliability and flexibility in providing safe and reliable transportation. Throughout the term of their most recent contract, AS-3341, MV Transportation has regularly exceeded Access performance standards in the key areas of on-time performance, excessively late trips and telephone hold time. Year-to-date, MV Transportation has

delivered over 323,761 trips with an on-time performance of 92%. Over the same period, MV Transportation has had a very low complaint rate of 1.7 per 1,000 trips.

Based upon its receipt of the highest evaluation score among the three responsive proposers and lowest overall cost, staff recommends award of contact AS-4059 to MV Transportation for the period and under the terms specified above. This recommendation is consistent with Board-adopted contracting principles. The contract will also contain an option to extend the period of performance, upon Board approval, in one year increments for up to four additional years.

Should the Board approve this recommendation, staff will insert additional clauses in the contract allowing Access to recapture the unused cost of vacant staff positions from the contractor in the event the proposed staffing levels for the new contract are not maintained and positions remain vacant after a period of time.

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS
FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION
RE: BOARD STIPEND POLICY

ISSUE:

At the February 26, 2018 Board meeting, Board Member Turner requested that staff make a presentation on the current Board stipend policy. The previous Board item from June 2016 approving this policy is attached at the end of this item.

RECOMMENDATION:

Receive and file.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

In FY2016/17 the Board was compensated \$10,100 as a total of six (6) Board members received stipends for the meetings they attended on Access business. Year to date that total is \$4,300. Prior to the change in policy in 2016, the annual total was \$3,500.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

The Board may elect to change the policy.

BACKGROUND:

Access Services By-Laws Article VI, N states that "Directors may receive such compensation, if any, for their services as directors or officers, and such reimbursement of expenses, as the Board may determine by resolution to be just and reasonable as to the corporation at the time that the resolution is adopted." The current policy provides a \$100 stipend for any meeting or event that an Access Board member attends on Access-related business with a maximum monthly limit of \$500.

The current policy was changed in June 2016, increasing the meeting stipend from \$50 to \$100 per meeting. This was based on a benchmark study presented to the Board as part of the approved item.

Previous Board Agenda Item

JUNE 17, 2016

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS
FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION
RE: CONSIDERATION TO APPROVE INCREASE OF BOARD STIPEND

ISSUE:

Staff has completed a bench mark study of peer transit agencies' Board stipend policies. A change to the existing \$50.00 per meeting for Access Board members requires Board approval.

RECOMMENDATION:

Authorize a change in Board stipend compensation to \$100 per day with a maximum monthly limit of \$500.

IMPACT ON BUDGET:

Last year the Board was compensated \$3,500 as a total of 7 Board members received stipends for the meetings they attended on Access business. An increase of the stipend to \$100 would equate to \$7,000 for the same period.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED:

The Board may elect not to increase the stipend.

BACKGROUND:

Access Services By-Laws Article VI, N states that "Directors may receive such compensation, if any, for their services as directors or officers, and such reimbursement of expenses, as the Board may determine by resolution to be just and reasonable as to the corporation at the time that the resolution is adopted." The current policy provides a \$50 stipend for any meeting or event that an Access Board member attends on Access-related business. This amount has not changed in a number of years.

As a matter of good governance, staff conducted a bench mark study of peer transit agencies' Board stipend policies and noted the following -

Metro - \$150/day; maximum of \$600/month

Foothill Transit - \$150 per meeting; a maximum of 6 per month; CPI adjusted every 3 years

Long Beach Transit - \$50 per meeting

MetroLink - \$100/day; a maximum of \$500/month

Antelope Valley Transit - No compensation; Council Members get paid from their cities; 2 County members that don't get paid

On average Board members only attend one Access meeting per month however there are occasions where due to special events, meetings, and/or conferences this may vary. In light of the bench study, staff finds that it is reasonable to recommend increasing the stipend but establishing a maximum monthly limit. Board members should be aware that once individual compensation exceeds \$600 in a year, a IRS 1099 form will have to be issued from Access to the Board member. This policy change will not affect the stipend policy for CAC members.

APRIL 16, 2018

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS
 FROM: F SCOTT JEWELL, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATION
 RE: UPCOMING BOARD ITEMS

ISSUE:

The following items are tentatively scheduled to be addressed by the Board through July 2018 at the regularly scheduled Board meetings.

May 21, 2018

Board Meeting - Metro

Agenda Items:	Disposition:
Renewal of SIR Program	Action
Renewal of Commercial Package Insurance	Action
Vehicle Purchase Award	Action

June 25, 2018

Board Meeting - El Monte

Agenda Items:	Disposition:
Consideration to Approve FY2017/18 Budget	Action
Consideration to Authorize Funding for Back-Up Service Providers	Action
Santa Clarita Service Region Contract Award	Action

July 23, 2018
Board Meeting - Metro

Agenda Items:	Disposition:
TBD	